CONTENTS

Trans - Altai Sustainability Dialogue: Gender & Sustainability

AGENDA

Opening remarks

Zandanshatar, G. Chairman of the State Great Hural of Mongolia

Ban Ki-moon. The 8th Secretary-General of the United Nations and Chairman of the Ban Ki-moon Foundation for a Better Future

Kim Young-joo. Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly of the Republic of Korea

Gi-Wook Shin. Professor of Sociology, Director of the Walter H. Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center, William J. Perry Professor of Contemporary Korea, Director of the Korean Studies Program, Senior Fellow, Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies, Stanford University

Policy papers

Eun Mee Kim. Empowering women through higher education: Women in STEM in the digital transformation era

Bulgantuya, Kh. Women’s Leadership and Sustainable Development

Undraa, A. Sustainable Development and Gender Equality: Role of Organizations

Odontuya, S. Gender Equality in the Labor Market

Dorjkhand, T. Gender Equality and Sustainable Development

Elaine Conkievich. Women’s Empowerment and Leadership

Mark Koenig. Gender Equality in the Labor Market
## Academic Articles

### Gender Studies

*Christine Min Wotipka*. Persistent Gaps: Global and National Perspectives on Gender and Higher Education 34

*Begz,N*. Issues of Human Development and Maturity in Sustainable Development 42

*Ankhbayar,B., Christine Min Wotipka, Risa Ninomiya, Jieun Song*. Development of Gender Equality Evaluation Index in Higher Education Institutions 48

*Maznah Mohamad*. Gender-Based Violence and Human Rights 56

*Gulmira Kudaiberdieva*. Quality and Gender Inclusive Education in the Kyrgyz Republic 57

*Ariunaa,Kh*. Factors Influencing Career Choices 60

*Enkhtogtokh,A., Sanjaabadam,S., Bayarmaa,B*. Sustainable Development and Education for Sustainable Development Policy Alignment and Implementation Study (a Case Study of Mongolia) 63

### International Trends for Altai Regional Research

*Enkhbat,A*. Further Development of “Altai Studies” 68

*Aynur Ibrahimova*. The Gender Problem in the Context of the Epic “Koroglu” 70

*İlhan Şahin*. Studies on the Altai People in the Historical Process: Past, Present and Future 73

*Abdrasul İsakov*. Native Americas (Na-Dene) are a Part of the Altai Civilization 78

*Kürşat Yıldırım*. An Evaluation of Studies on Mongolian History in Türkiye 82

## Student Papers

*Tsolmon,G., Namuuun,U., Yesui,B*. Applications of Artificial Intelligence Tools to Mongolian Higher Education Sector 84

*Enkhtsetseg,T*. Can Partnership Help English Teachers to Improve the Quality of EFL Curriculum? 88

*Marlaa,B., Mandukhail,B., Dulguun,N*. Research on Accessible Infrastructure for People with Disabilities: a Case Study of Mongolia 93


*Vilina Engheepi*. Deconstructing Water Scarcity in Water-Rich Himalayan Region: A case study of Sikkim, India 100

*Tuulsaiikh,a*. Contribution of “Ulaanbaatar Railway” to the Sustainable Development of Mongolia Supplied Community Participation 114

*Tuvshintugs,A., Gunbileg,B*. Article 6.2 of the Constitution of Mongolia is the Basis for the Efficient Use of Natural Resources and the Development of Its Sustainable Management 117

*Udval,O., Temuge,G*. Umyete - “Impartiality” Mongolian Red Cross Rotary Club 121

## Closing Remark

*Gi-Wook Shin*. Professor of Sociology, Director of the Walter H. Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center William J. Perry Professor of Contemporary Korea, Director of the Korean Studies Program, Senior Fellow, Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies, Stanford University 123
TRANS - ALTAI SUSTAINABILITY DIALOGUE

GENDER AND SUSTAINABILITY

AGENDA

Organizers: Office of the Parliament of Mongolia, Ban Ki-moon Foundation of the Republic of Korea, Stanford University of the United States, Ewha Womans University of the Republic of Korea
Chairman of Parliament of Mongolia, Members of the Parliament, Academic researchers, representatives of the civil society

Participants: Chairman of Parliament of Mongolia, Members of the Parliament, Academic researchers, representatives of the civil society

Venue: State Palace of Mongolia

Date: 2023.06.12-14

Language: Mongolian, English (with simultaneous translation)

Monday, June 12
Best Western Premier Tuushin Hotel, “SULD” Hall

Welcome Reception

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18:45-19:00</td>
<td>Welcome Guests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:00-19:10</td>
<td>Congratulatory remarks Odontuya Saldan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vice-Chairwoman of the State Great Hural of Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:10-19:20</td>
<td>Bulgantuya Khurelbaatar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Member of the State Great Hural of Mongolia, Chair of the Sub-Committee on Sustainable Development, Minister for Labour and Social Protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19:20-20:15</td>
<td>Dinner</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tuesday, June 13
State Palace, Ikh Mongol Hall

Opening Session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>08:30 - 09:00</td>
<td>Registration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00 - 09:10</td>
<td>Zandanshatar Gombojav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chairman of the State Great Hural of Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:10 - 09:15</td>
<td>Kim Young-joo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly of the Republic of Korea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:15 - 09:20</td>
<td>Gi-Wook Shin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Director of the Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center and Korea Program, Professor of Sociology, William J. Perry Professor of Contemporary Korea, and Senior Fellow at the Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies, Stanford University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:20 - 09:25</td>
<td>Ban Ki-moon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The 8th Secretary-General of the United Nations and Chairman of the Ban Ki-moon Foundation for a Better Future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:25-09:40</td>
<td>Photo Session</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ikh Mongol Hall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:40-10:00</td>
<td>Coffee Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tovchoo Restaurant Area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Plenary session

Topic 1: Women’s Empowerment and Leadership

Moderator: Nominchimeg Odsuren - Advisor to the Chairman of the State Great Hural of Mongolia

10:00-10:15 Keynote Speaker

Bulgantuya Khurelbaatar

Member of the State Great Hural of Mongolia, Chair of the Sub-Committee on Sustainable Development, Minister for Labour and Social Protection

10:15-10:30 Panelists

Elaine Conkievich

Resident Representative, UNDP Mongolia
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:30-10:45</td>
<td>Eun Mee Kim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>President of Ewha Womans University, Professor at the Graduate School of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>International Studies, and Director of the Ewha Global Health Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>for Girls and Women, Ewha Womans University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:45-11:00</td>
<td>Baigalmaa Sanjjav</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Principal Manager at the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00-11:15</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Topic 2: Gender Equality in the Labor Market**

**Moderator:** Mandkhai Mendbayar - Secretary General of Social Democratic Women of Mongolia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11:15-11:30</td>
<td>Keynote Speaker Odontuya Saldan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vice-Chairwoman of the State Great Hural of Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30-11:45</td>
<td>Mark Koenig</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Country Representative for Mongolia, The Asia Foundation in Ulaanbaatar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45-12:00</td>
<td>Naomi Koshi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Former Mayor of Ōtsu City, Japan, Partner of Miura &amp; Partners and Chief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Executive Officer of OnBoard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00-12:15</td>
<td>Euna Lee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Associate Professor in the Department of Women’s Studies and Director of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the Korean Women’s Institute, Ewha Womans University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:15-12:30</td>
<td>Deirdré Lingenfelder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chief Executive Officer of Oyu Tolgoi LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30-12:45</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45-14:00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High-level delegation (Tovchoo Restaurant)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Guests &amp; Panelists (Urguu Ger)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Topic 3: Gender Equality in Education**

**Moderator:** Rie Hiraoka - Former Director of Social Sector Division, Central and West Asia Department, Asian Development Bank

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14:00-14:15</td>
<td>Keynote Speaker Pilwha Chang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chairperson of the Korea Foundation for Women and Professor Emeritus of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the Department of Women’s Studies, Ewha Womans University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:15-14:30</td>
<td>Anchbayar Begz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Researcher at Mongolian University of Science and Technology’s Open</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education Center and Former Visiting Scholar at the Walter H. Shorenstein</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Asia-Pacific Research Center of Stanford University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30-14:45</td>
<td>Panelists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Christine Min Wotipka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Associate Professor (Teaching) of Education and (by courtesy) Sociology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Director of the Master’s Programs in International Comparative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education and International Education Policy Analysis, Stanford University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:45-15:00</td>
<td>Chalidaporn Songsamphan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Co-President of the Asian Association of Women’s Studies and Professor of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Political Science, Thammasat University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00-15:15</td>
<td>Gulmira Kudaiberdieva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Former Minister of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:15-15:30</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Topic 4: Gender-Based Violence and Human Rights**

**Moderator:** Kiyoteru Tsutsui - Deputy Director of the Asia-Pacific Research Center at Stanford University in the United States and Director of the Japan Program, Faculty Co-Director of the Center for Human Rights and International Justice, Professor of Sociology, Senior Fellow at the Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies at Stanford University

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Session</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15:30-15:45</td>
<td>Keynote Speaker Tsoptaatar Damdin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Member of the State Great Hural of Mongolia and Head of the Mongolian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Delegation at the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Parliamentary Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:45-16:00</td>
<td>Panelists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maznah Mohamad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Associate Professor and Head of the Department of Malay Studies, Associate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professor of Southeast Asian Studies, National University of Singapore</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00-16:15</td>
<td>Wai Wai Nu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Founder and Executive Director of Women’s Peace Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:15-16:30</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:30-17:00</td>
<td>Coffee Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tovchoo Restaurant Area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Topic 5: Gender Equality and Sustainable Development**

**Moderator:** Eun-Shil Kim - Professor Emeritus of the Department of Women's Studies, Ewha Womans University

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17:00-17:15</td>
<td>Keynote Speakers</td>
<td>Anujin Purev-Ochir&lt;br&gt;Member of the State Great Hural (Parliament) of Mongolia and Head of the Standing Committee on Social Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:15-17:30</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dorjkhand Togmid&lt;br&gt;Member of the State Great Hural of Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:30-17:45</td>
<td>Panelists</td>
<td>Undraa Agvaanluvsan&lt;br&gt;Former Member of Parliament of Mongolia, President of the Mitchell Foundation for Arts and Sciences, Co-Chair of the Mongolia Chapter of the Women Corporate Directors, and Affiliate at the Center for International Security and Cooperation at Stanford University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:45-18:00</td>
<td></td>
<td>Hyojeong Kim&lt;br&gt;Deputy Director, Ecofeminism Research Center by Korean Women's Environmental Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:00-18:15</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mia Siscawati&lt;br&gt;Lecturer and Head of the Graduate Program on Gender Studies, School of Strategic and Global Studies, Universitas Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:15-18:30</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Tuesday, June 13**
State Palace, Chingis Khaan Hall

**Parallel Session**

**Topic 1: International Perspectives on Trans-Altai Studies (Part I)**

**Moderator:** Dr. Ankhbayar Danuu - Senior Lecturer at the National University of Mongolia and İzmir Katip Çelebi University Turkic Studies Institute

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10:00-10:10</td>
<td>Keynote Speakers</td>
<td>Mehmet Sureyya Er&lt;br&gt;Secretary General of the Parliamentary Assembly of Turkic States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:10-10:20</td>
<td></td>
<td>PhD. Sambuudorj Ochirbat&lt;br&gt;Leading Researcher, Institute of Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:20-10:30</td>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Huseyin Bagci&lt;br&gt;President of Foreign Policy Institute of Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30-10:40</td>
<td>Panelists</td>
<td>Dr. Enkhbat Avirmed&lt;br&gt;School of Humanity and Business Administration at the University of Science and Technology, Mongolia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:40-10:50</td>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. İlhan Şahin&lt;br&gt;Professor of the History Department, Faculty of Literature, İstanbul 29 Mayıs University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:50-11:00</td>
<td></td>
<td>Asst Prof. Dr. Isakov Abdrasul&lt;br&gt;International Medical University, Kyrgyzstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00-11:10</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Topic 2: International Perspectives on Trans-Altai Studies (Part II)**

**Moderator:** Dr. Enkhbat Avirmed - School of Humanity and Business Administration at the University of Science and Technology, Mongolia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11:25-11:35</td>
<td>Keynote Speaker</td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Sahin Mustafayev&lt;br&gt;President of the International Turkic Academy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:35-11:45</td>
<td></td>
<td>PhD Aslan Turlybek&lt;br&gt;Vice President of Socio-Educational Affairs, Astana International University, Kazakhstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45-11:55</td>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Şaban Doğan&lt;br&gt;Professor at the Institute of Social Sciences, İzmir Katip Çelebi University, Turkey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:55-12:05</td>
<td>Panelists</td>
<td>Dr. Ankhbayar Danuu&lt;br&gt;Senior Lecturer at the National University of Mongolia and İzmir Katip Çelebi University Turkic Studies Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:05-12:15</td>
<td></td>
<td>Dr. Aynur Aydin Ibrahimova&lt;br&gt;Azerbaijan Academy of Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:15-12:25</td>
<td></td>
<td>Prof. Dr. Kürşat Yıldırım&lt;br&gt;Professor of the Department of History, Faculty of Letters, İstanbul University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:25-12:35</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45-14:00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td>Urguu Ger</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Topic 3: Case Presentations by Students and Young Leaders (Panel)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Moderator: Cheryll Alipio - Associate Director for Program and Policy at the Walter H. Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center of Stanford University</th>
<th>Panellists</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14:00-14:10</td>
<td></td>
<td>Mihyun Kim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ph.D Candidate in the Department of Women’s Studies, Ewha Womens University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:10-14:20</td>
<td>Jayathry Dhananja Gunarathine Loku Thambugalage</td>
<td>Ewha-Korea International Cooperation Agency Ph.D Student, Ewha Womans University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30-14:40</td>
<td>Vilina Pradeep Engheepi</td>
<td>Ph.D student, The Graduate School of International Studies, Ewha Womans University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:40-14:50</td>
<td>Marie Wako</td>
<td>JSD Candidate, Stanford Law School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:50-15:00</td>
<td>Q&amp;A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Tuesday, June 13

**Dinner**

*Hosted by G. Zandanshatar, Chairman of the Great Khural of Mongolia*

*A celebratory dinner will be held at Han Uul Residence of Ikh Tenger Complex*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18:45-20:15</td>
<td>Special Programme</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Wednesday, June 14

**Nature trip, Naadam, Cultural Performance, Closing Luncheon in Terelj**

*Terelj National Park - Tourist Area*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>09:00</td>
<td>Departure from hotel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:00</td>
<td>Sightseeing at Turtle Rock, Terelj</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30</td>
<td>Arrival at the Camp “Buuvel”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:45</td>
<td>Opening remarks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>Traditional folk song and dance concert</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:40</td>
<td>Introduction to nomadic culture and tradition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:10</td>
<td>Naadam: Mongolian national wrestling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:10</td>
<td>Luncheon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:40</td>
<td>Naadam: National archery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:10</td>
<td>Naadam: Horse racing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:50</td>
<td>Naadam award ceremony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:00 - 16:15</td>
<td>Closing Remarks:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Bulgantuya Khurelbaatar</strong>, Member of the State Great Hural of Mongolia, Minister for Labor and Social Protection, and Chair of Sustainable Development Goals Sub-Committee of Parliament</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Gi-Wook Shin</strong>, Director of the Asia-Pacific Research Center and Korea Program at the Stanford University in the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Eun Mee Kim</strong>, President of Ewha Womans University, Professor at the Graduate School of International Studies, and Director of the Ewha Global Health Institute for Girls and Women, Ewha Womans University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Kim Bong-Hyun</strong>, Former President of Jeju Peace Institute, and Advisor to the 8th UN Secretary-General, Mr. Ban Ki-moon, under the Ban Ki-moon Foundation, Ambassador</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:15</td>
<td>Departure from Terelj</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:30</td>
<td>Arrival at the Hotel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
OPENING REMARKS

ZANDANSHATAR Gombojav
Chairman of the State Great Hural of Mongolia

Ladies and gentlemen, distinguished guests, and participants,

Good morning! It is my great pleasure and honor to welcome you all to Mongolia.

Dear guests, ladies and gentlemen,

Greetings to all participants of the TRANS-ALTAI SUSTAINABILITY DIALOGUE!

In October 2022, the Stanford University, Center for Asia Pacific Studies and the Ban Ki-moon Foundation For a Better Future, established by the 8th UN Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon, co-organized the "TRANS PACIFIC STABILITY DIALOGUE" in Seoul. The purpose of the conference was to accelerate the implementation of the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals and support multilateral cooperation, in line with the 17th goal of sustainable development.

During the conference, it was emphasized that cooperation and mutual understanding in the Asia-Pacific region are crucial for achieving the Sustainable Development Goals, leading to the decision to continue this dialogue annually.

This year, we are organizing the "Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue" in Ulaanbaatar, with the aim of accelerating the UN's sustainable development goals and fostering cooperation.

This conference, held in collaboration with the Mongolian Parliament, Stanford University, the Ban Ki-moon Foundation, and Ewha Women's University, holds special significance as it expands its focus to include the countries of Central Asia, extending the Asia-Pacific region to the west.

Situated at the heart of Central Asia, the Altai Mountains region boasts majestic mountains, vast plains, and pristine lakes. Throughout history, the Altai region has been a historic crossroads connecting the East and the West, leaving an indelible mark on human history, heritage, culture, and linguistics.

Today, the world faces numerous political, economic, and social challenges. In light of the global pandemic, social and economic difficulties, armed conflicts, and geopolitical transitions, it is vital to engage in dialogues and foster cooperation across the Altai Mountains to promote sustainable development. Strengthening Altai studies, which underpin this cooperation and mutual understanding, is crucial for fostering collective aspirations for stability and development in the region.


The United Nations Sustainable Development Goals address a wide range of interconnected issues, including cooperation, climate change, social justice, and economic inclusion. However, the realization of these goals cannot be achieved without the active participation of women, who constitute half of our world and society. Thus, today’s conference will place a strong emphasis on women’s leadership, gender equality in the labor market and education, gender-based violence, human rights in Mongolia and the region, and international trends in Altai studies, encompassing a wide range of topics.

Representatives from academia, policymakers, civil society, and students who represent the next generation of leaders are actively participating, fostering multifaceted cooperation.

The success of this conference is the result of the collective efforts of many individuals. On this occasion, I express my deepest gratitude to the 8th President of the United Nations, Ban Ki-Moon, who leads the Trans-Pacific Partnership for Sustainable Development, as well as Stanford University, Ewha Women’s University, and our distinguished guests.

I would also like to extend my thanks to the Asian Development Bank, Asian Fund, European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, United Nations Development Program, and Oyu Tolgoi LLC for their support of this conference.

I am confident that this conference will yield fruitful outcomes, initiating real cooperation and evaluating policy solutions.

I wish you all success in the conference.
OPENING REMARKS

Ban Ki-moon

The 8th Secretary-General of the United Nations and Chairman of the Ban Ki-moon Foundation for a Better Future

The Honorable Gombojav Zandanshatar, Chairman of the Parliament of Mongolia,
The Honorable Kim Young-joo, Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly of the Republic of Korea,
Professor Shin Gi-wook of Stanford University,
Excellencies, Distinguished Guests, Ladies and gentlemen,

As Chairman of the Ban Ki-moon Foundation for a Better Future, I have the honor and privilege to welcome all of you participating in the First Trans Altai Sustainability Dialogue here in Mongolia.

Mongolia is the land of the spirit of resilience which merges with the enchanting landscapes. Mongolia is the land of the spirit of inclusiveness which merges with the noble mind of its people.

This spirit is the source of our shared commitment to gender equality and women’s empowerment. And this spirit represents the global movement striving to create a just and equitable world for all. Therefore, ‘gender equality’ is the relevant subject of this event here in Mongolia.

It is a cause that I have championed throughout my career as Secretary General of the United Nations and a core to the mission of the Ban Ki-moon Foundation for a Better Future.

In the early days of my tenure as Secretary General of the United Nations, I pledged to make gender equality and women’s rights a global priority. Recognizing that change starts close to home, it was a commitment that drove me to appoint dozens of distinguished women to senior positions within the UN.

As I traveled the world, I witnessed the struggles of women and girls, drawing strength from the indomitable spirit of women who refuse to be silenced and show their resilience and determination to make a difference in their communities.

We took concrete steps to address the challenges. Initiatives like Every Woman, Every Child or UNiTE to End Violence Against Women have become organizing strategies. It has helped activists and organizations around the world to advance the health and well-being of women and children. It also galvanized advocacy efforts, and share innovations to end violence against women and girls once and for all.

Through alliances like HeForShe, we have mobilized men and people of all genders to stand in solidarity with women’s rights, recognizing that gender equality is a shared responsibility.

The establishment of UN Women as the United Nations entity for gender equality and women’s empowerment has been instrumental in consolidating these and other efforts and driving UN Member States to implement gender parity action.

Since 2015, this work has been closely integrated with the central, transformative promises of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and firmly aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals action plans to fast-track country-level implementation of SDG 5 to achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls.

While we made significant progress, we must confront the challenges and setbacks that remain ahead. As the latest Sustainable Development Goals Report indicates, the world is not on track to achieve gender equality by 2030, and the social and economic fallout from the COVID-19 pandemic has had a particularly damaging effect on women and girls.

Violence against women continues to plague our societies. And advancements in women’s representation and access to leadership positions in political and economic spheres continue to be slow.

To alter this trajectory, we must apply a comprehensive and multifaceted approach. We must promote laws, policies, financing, and institutions that propel gender equality forward.

By fortifying our understanding of setbacks and successes, we can channel resources and efforts more effectively, fostering tangible change. The 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda provides us with a
framework for collective action, and it is our responsibility to ensure that gender equality and women’s empowerment remain at the forefront of our efforts.

Moreover, to accelerate our progress, we must foster partnerships and collaborations among governments, civil society, and the private sector. I am therefore inspired by this convening and excited to join forces with our partners in Mongolia, Stanford University’s Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center, and Ewha Womans University.

I encourage all of you, the policymakers, professionals, academics, and students gathered here today to continue driving change within your spheres of influence. Your dedication and unwavering commitment will surely inspire others to join the journey toward a world where gender equality is a lived experience for all.

Together, let us turn the aspirations of the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda into tangible realities.

As we embark on this Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue, I am hopeful that the collective knowledge and actions we cultivate here will reverberate far beyond the borders of Mongolia, resonating across Asia and beyond.

With unity and determination, we shall dismantle barriers, bridge gaps, and expedite a future where every woman and girl can flourish and participate fully in shaping sustainable and prosperous societies.

Finally, I would like commend all the staff and volunteers for their successful preparations of this wonderful event.

Thank you.
KEYNOTE ADDRESS

Kim Young-joo
Deputy Speaker
National Assembly of the Republic of Korea

H.E. Zandanshatar Gombojav, Chairman of the State Great Hural of Mongolia,
Professor Shin Gi-wook of Stanford University,
Mr. Ban Ki-moon, former Secretary General of the United Nations,
Distinguished guests,
It is a great pleasure to be here.

I am Kim Young-joo, Deputy Speaker of the National Assembly of the Republic of Korea. I am honored to participate as a keynote speaker in the Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue held in Mongolia, with the majestic Altai Mountains stretching to the west.

The slogan of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), "Leave no one behind," resonates deeply with us. It is a goal that cannot be achieved without the empowerment of women. In several parts of Asia, however, women still face discrimination in many areas of society, including politics and economy.

In today's dialogue, I will share my personal experiences and those of South Korea in the fight for women's rights and explore ways to promote sustainable development in the Trans-Altai region in which Mongolia is located.

Ladies and gentlemen,
Before going into politics, I was an ordinary employee at a bank. Then one day, I became aware of various forms of discrimination against women in the workplace. Not only did women's salary increase at a significantly slower rate than men even though they did the same work, but being a female worker was a title in itself, with no opportunity to compete for promotions on an equal footing with male workers.

Women workers had to quit their job when they got married, and of course, there was no maternity or paternity leave at the time.

I could not tolerate not being treated equally to male workers simply because I was a woman, and thus, spearheaded a movement to eradicate gender-based discrimination. My activities, however, failed to capture the attention of the labor union's leadership, which was mostly comprised of men.

Undeterred, I proposed that all female members leave the union, thus alerting the leadership of the issue of gender discrimination. Even after convincing the union, it was an uphill battle, but I did not give up.

To eliminate the discrimination between male and female bank workers doing the same job in the same place, I personally sought out legislators to raise awareness of the blatant discrimination in the workplace and requested they amend the law.

Finally, in 1989, eight years after I started working in the labor union, I succeeded in getting the principle of equal pay for work of equal value enshrined in law. We had managed to break down the wall of discrimination after years of persistent efforts. This experience made me realize the importance of legislation and inspired me to pursue a career in politics to empower women and create a world without discrimination. However, it was not easy for a woman to become a Member of the National Assembly in South Korea.

The Republic of Korea granted women the right to vote since the establishment of the government in 1948, but in the 1948 Constitutional Assembly, there was only one female member out of a total of 200, and the number of female lawmakers did not exceed 10 until more than 50 years later, in 2000.

It was harder for the number of female lawmakers to reach double digits than it was for female bank workers to be treated equally with their male counterparts.

In the 2000 election, however, South Korea elected 16 women to the National Assembly, and when I first joined the National Assembly in 2004, 39 women were elected, more than double the number of women elected four years earlier. This dramatic increase in the number of women lawmakers since 2000 is due to electoral reforms that promote women's participation in politics, such as proportional representation.
National Assembly amended the election law to require political parties to nominate at least 50 percent of their candidates for proportional representation in the National Assembly and local councils, and to recommend candidates falling under every odd number in order of the candidate roll from among women.

In addition, in local council elections, the law required political parties to nominate women for at least 30% of the total number of local council seats across the country. More than 20 years later, these changes are showing results.

Today, the number of women parliamentarians in South Korea has risen to 57 out of a total of 300, and the proportion of women in local councils has also increased, with women representing 20 percent of members in metropolitan councils and 33 percent in municipal councils.

This is profoundly meaningful because not only has the number of female politicians increased, but women are holding key positions in the National Assembly.

The role of women in government is also undergoing a gradual expansion. I was appointed the first Minister of Employment and Labor in the Moon Jae-in administration in 2017, and at the time, women were appointed to 30% of ministerial positions in the cabinet.

From 2020 to 2022, five of the 17 standing committees were chaired by women, and for the first time in its history, the National Assembly elected a woman to serve as deputy speaker of both the first and second half of the four-year term of the 21st National Assembly.

This is an especially personal matter for me because I was elected as deputy speaker in a fair competition against my male colleagues in the election.

I do not intend to stop here, but will continue to move forward to open a new chapter in the history of Korea.

Ladies and gentlemen,

The experiences I have shared with you about myself and the Republic of Korea, and the recent encouraging results are a culmination of a long, hard fight. It was not my fight, but our fight.

Today, however, discrimination and unfair treatment of women still persist in many parts of the world. Nevertheless, I believe that true gender equality is possible if we work together to create systems for women empowerment - not alone, but together; not by women alone, but together with men. And, as the slogan of the SDGs states, no one will be left behind when the systems for gender equality that we have created together are established in each country.

On the occasion of today’s Pan-Altai Sustainable Dialogue, I look forward to seeing the elimination of discrimination against women in your countries and around the world. For that to happen, we will all have to work together.

Thank you for listening.
OPENING SESSION REMARKS

Gi-Wook Shin
Professor of Sociology, Director of the Walter H. Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center, William J. Perry Professor of Contemporary Korea, Director of the Korean Studies Program, Senior Fellow, Freeman Spogli Institute for International Studies, Stanford University

Chairman Zandanshatar,
Deputy Speaker Kim, Secretary-General Ban,
Ladies and gentlemen, distinguished speakers, guests, and friends,
Good morning, everyone. My name is Gi-Wook Shin, and I am the director of Stanford University’s Walter H. Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center, known as APARC. I am also the founding director of the Korea Program at APARC.

It is my great pleasure to welcome you to the Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue. I am filled with immense excitement as we gather experts, decision-makers, academics, and young leaders dedicated to advancing sustainable development and gender equality.

Before we delve into the compelling discussions that lie ahead, let us take a moment to reflect on the remarkable journey that has brought us here.

Today’s convening is not an isolated event but the outcome of the annual Trans-Pacific Sustainability Dialogue, a joint initiative of APARC and the Ban Ki-moon Foundation For a Better Future. We created the Trans-Pacific Sustainability Dialogue initiative as a platform for spurring meaningful discussions, research collaborations, and policy partnerships between experts from the United States and Asia as we aim to accelerate progress on realizing the United Nations-adopted 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. We held our inaugural Dialogue in October 2022 in Seoul, South Korea. I’m delighted that this inaugural convening ignited further collaborations to expedite the implementation of the 2030 Agenda’s underlying Sustainable Development Goals by governments and non-state actors. Today’s Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue — T ASD — builds upon the momentum and enthusiasm generated during that inaugural event. The learnings we share and the connections we form here will be invaluable for our next Trans-Pacific Sustainability Dialogue, which is already in the works and which we will hold this coming September, again in Seoul.

Today, we gather here in Mongolia as the State Great Hural leads the convening of the TASD. Mongolia has made commendable efforts in implementing gender equality processes and structures, recognizing women’s crucial role in sustainable development. The Parliament’s commitment to being a gender-sensitive and human rights-focused institution is genuinely inspiring.

We are also thrilled and grateful to continue working with Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon and his team at the Foundation and with our partners at Ewha Womans University. For us at APARC, this gathering comes on the heels of celebrating our 40th anniversary. As we build on our legacy of achievement and look to tackle the pressing challenges ahead of us, we are energized to bring our four decades-long track record of bridging rigorous academic research and meaningful policy action to advance the long-term prosperity of people and the planet.

Today’s gathering focuses on gender equality, a core theme that drives the Sustainable Development Agenda. Despite progress, deeply-rooted and restrictive social, economic, and political barriers still limit women’s choices and access to opportunities. We recognize, however, that achieving gender equality is not a distant dream but a tangible goal that requires our collective efforts.

Members of Mongolia’s Parliament, alongside other participants, will share experiences and lessons learned in advancing and mainstreaming gender equality, providing critical insights for all of us. We are also delighted to be joined by young student leaders from Stanford University and Ewha Womans University, who will share their research and applied work. Their creativity and passion showcase the power
of youth in driving sustainable development and achieving the Sustainable Development Goals.

Together, we must address crucial questions: What concrete steps can policymakers take to promote gender equality in education, government, and sustainable development? How can we effectively and holistically measure and evaluate women's and girls' empowerment? Which interventions work at different levels and contexts? And how can we effectively implement the outcomes of this Dialogue?

Let us use these questions to guide our discussions, drive us toward tangible actions, and ensure that these actions translate into real-world impact. By harnessing our collective wisdom and energy, we can break down structural barriers to gender equality and build a world where women and girls fully realize their potential in their homes, economies, and societies.

I want to extend our deep gratitude to our hosts and co-organizers and thank everyone here for joining us. Now let us begin this remarkable Trans-Alta Sustainability Dialogue with optimism, purpose, and determination!
EMPOWERING WOMEN THROUGH HIGHER EDUCATION:
WOMEN IN STEM IN THE DIGITAL TRANSFORMATION ERA

Eun Mee Kim
President, Ewha Womans University
Republic of Korea

Introduction
The 21st century brought forth tremendous changes with the Fourth Industrial Revolution, and the world was once again united to work on three pillars of development—i.e., economic development, social development, and environmentally sustainable development—at the United Nations under the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) from 2016 to 2030 to “Leave No One Behind.” Following the progress made with the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs, 2001-2015) to halve extreme poverty in the Global South compared to the level of 1990s, the world was poised to eradicate extreme poverty by 2030, hence the motto, “Leave No One Behind.” However, the COVID-19 Pandemic that swept through the world since 2020 created havoc and led to increases in extreme poverty for the first time since the 1990s. It was not just the SDGs that was put on hold, but the whole world froze in the face of a small virus. The countries in the Global North, which used to support the countries in the Global South in previous pandemics, closed their borders and were inward-looking desperately trying to save their own people, who were also affected by the pandemic.

In this paper, I focus on the most vulnerable, yet unexpected victims of COVID—women and girls in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM). The digital gap and the gender gap were compounded and exacerbated during the COVID-19 pandemic compared to the early phase of the Fourth Industrial Revolution, and the SDGs. I conclude with some suggestions about what we need to do as we move forward for women and girls in STEM.

Digital Transformation, the Digital Gap, and the Gender Gap
The Fourth Industrial Revolution or the digital transformation is a significant paradigm shift as the First Industrial Revolution with the invention of the steam engine. Artificial Intelligence (AI), which arguably is at the center of the Fourth Industrial Revolution is affecting all aspects of our lives, and is predicted to contribute $15.7tn to the global economy by 2030, and this may be a low estimate.

However, another important alarming aspect of AI is its impact on widening the income gap making the already rich with high-tech and high-skills with AI-capability to take advantage of the progress made with AI, but those without access to AI to completely lose out. They will not only lose income, but will lose jobs to AI. Thus, the concern is those who do not have AI/digital literacy will lose out, and more than likely these will be women, the disabled, and those that are already disadvantaged people and groups.

The 2019 Global Sustainable Development Report quoted a very serious research and development (R&D) gap between the Global North and the Global South (UN 2019). There was a heavy concentration of R&D investment in the Global North vs. a paucity of R&D in the Global South. Moreover, the R&D in the Global North was largely funded by the private sector, which was primarily for the gains of private businesses. This has tremendous implications for global sustainable development since the Global South would be forever dependent on the Global North for science and technology for further development, and in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution when the AI technology and high-tech/high-skill sectors are critical for further development, the chances of economic advancement in the Global South are worse than ever. The digital gap was already becoming a serious problem between the Global North and the Global South in 2019 ahead of the COVID-19 Pandemic.

Furthermore, the 2019 Global Sustainable Development Report (UN 2019) identified four areas in which the SDGs implementation around the world were not only slow, but going backwards and needed
immediate intervention in order to meet the SDGs’ targets by 2030: (1) climate change mitigation; (2) inequalities, and in particular, gender inequality; (3) bio-diversity loss; and (4) ecological footprint. It was particularly noteworthy that women and girls were experiencing compounded gaps in terms of digital and gender gaps in STEM education, research, and work, which are key fields in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution.

**COVID-19 Pandemic and the Digital/Gender Gap**

The COVID-19 Pandemic, which hit the whole world in 2020 created havoc, but it also disproportionately affected the Global South, women and girls, and the most vulnerable living in the Global South (McKinsey & Company 2020). Partly because of the decrease in income in the Global South, the Internet became more “expensive” in the Global South during the Pandemic, thus making Internet connectivity more difficult and costly in the Global South.

UN Women noted that women around the world experienced greater workload at home: 63% of women saw increases in their time spent in unpaid domestic work vs. 59% in men; 60% of women saw increases in their time spent in unpaid care work vs. 54% of men. More women also were found in care-related work, while fewer women were in STEM jobs and professional work. Only 16-28% of the STEM and professional work were occupied by women, which fared relatively well during the COVID-19 pandemic. In sum, women were in lower-paying, less-skilled care-related jobs, which were more precarious during the pandemic, and women were also exposed to greater unpaid domestic and care work. They were most likely to be the first to be the laid off, which was a situation similar to previous pandemics and economic/financial crises. Women were the unseen victims of the Pandemic.

Gender gap in STEM education was also very serious with only 3% in ICT, 5% in science, math and statistics, 8% in engineering, manufacturing, and construction (World Bank Group, 2020). STEM fields are in high demand for the workforce of the Fourth Industrialization industry, i.e., technology- and knowledge-driven economy, and only 29% of science researchers globally are women (Ibid. 2020). Women in STEM are low across the board from education, workforce, and researchers, and this trend leads to marginalization of women in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution – i.e., the future – and will erode the gains made in gender equality of the past decades. The pessimistic scenario of the World Economic Forum’s (2022) Global Gender Gap Report 2022’s prediction that it will take 132 years to reach gender equality may have been optimistic and may take even longer given what has been lost during the Pandemic in terms of gender/digital gap in STEM.

Thus, it is critical that we work strenuously to make up for this gender/digital gap in STEM with concerted effort through education and empowerment of women and girls in STEM. We must work together to support women and girls in STEM in higher education to reduce digital/gender gap. Concerted global efforts headed by international organizations and like-minded governments with international development cooperation must come forward to provide STEM education and empowerment for women and girls around the world now.

**References**


Achieving gender equality, supporting girls and women at all levels, and increasing women’s leadership continue to be major challenges in building a sustainable society and future.

While achieving gender rights and equality and increasing women’s leadership are driving forces for development progress, women are unable to realize their full potential due to social, economic and political inequalities and gender-based violence and discrimination.

Sustainable Development Goal 5 emphasizes the vital role of women and the need for equal participation and leadership in all aspects of sustainable development. In order to make progress on the path to this goal, the conference is being organized by Stanford University, Eva Women’s University, and representatives from Northeast, Central Asia, Southeast, and South Asia.

Increasing the participation and leadership of women in all spheres of social life and ensuring equal opportunities and equal participation of men and women at the decision-making level can be understood as not only the goal of development, but also an important means of achieving development.

Inadequate gender equality and under-representation and participation of women increase the cost of lost opportunities in economic terms. In other words, under-utilization of the resources that should be used increases losses. As a result, many deadlocked problems have negative effects and consequences, such as not finding a solution or solving them at too high a cost.

According to research conducted in Asia, access to quality education and health care for girls is scarce in several Asian countries, while opportunities for women to find decent work and earn decent wages are limited. Furthermore, women’s participation in political and economic decision-making levels and representation in institutions is low.

Mongolia was the first country in Asia to declare equal rights and justice for men and women in its 1924 constitution. In the last century, the world emphasized women’s right to choose and be elected, but this century is an era in which equal rights and equal opportunities for all, including the role of women in development, are important.

According to the World Development Report, the level of decision-making in Mongolia in 1990, the representation of women in the People’s Congress was 25 percent, but over the past 30 years, this representation has decreased by more than 30 percent. Considering the gender status of government and political officials in Mongolia today, 17.1 percent of the members of the State Great Khural of Mongolia, 13.6 percent of the Cabinet members, 6.2 percent of the Deputy Ministers, 4.7 percent of the Provincial Governors, and 11.1 percent of the District Governors are women. This is very low compared to parliamentary democracies.

Globally, women’s parliamentary representation has doubled between 1990 and 2020 in high-income countries, and more than 60 percent in low- and middle-income countries. In other words, women’s economic and political participation has increased in upper middle-income economies.

Since Mongolia joined the United Nations in 1961, it has joined and ratified international conventions and agreements related to gender equality and women’s rights. In 1996, the National Program for the Improvement of Women’s Status was initiated, and in 2000, the National Council for Gender Equality was established, and until 2005, the Council organized the implementation of the "National Program for Gender Equality". In 2005, the National Committee for Gender Equality was established and its activities expanded.

The Government of Mongolia implemented the Gender Equality Program in 2003-2015 to ensure gender equality and protect human rights, especially the rights of women and girls. During this period, "Law
on Combating Domestic Violence (2004)”, "Law on Ensuring Gender Equality (2011)”, "Law on Elections to the Great Khural of Mongolia (2011)”, "Law on Combating Human Trafficking (2012)” A number of laws have been approved by the Parliament, and a legal and policy environment has been created to ensure gender equality.

In our country, there are more than 10 laws and 5 policy documents that provide basic regulations for ensuring gender equality and non-discrimination based on gender, but the implementation of those laws and policy documents is insufficient, which is evidenced by the high level of gender-based inequality. On the global average, a woman with an advanced degree who is 10 years out of college earns 23 percent less than a man with the same level of education. In Mongolia, women’s wages are 17 percent lower than men’s. This is due to the higher level of education of women compared to men.

According to statistical data, more than 80% of our country’s health sector workers, more than 70% of education sector workers, 70% of banking and insurance sector workers, 60% of retail trade and maintenance workers, and more than 50% of light industry workers are women. By the end of 2022, there are more than 140,000 enterprises registered in our country, 64% of which are managed by men and 36% by women.

Also, considering the state of ownership of property and assets, Mongolian women are 2 times less than men and women in property ownership, 3-6 times less in terms of land ownership, and 1.5 times less in terms of the ownership of other real estate.

Although the number of women with higher education in our country is high, their participation in the labor market is decreasing. In particular, the labor force participation rate of women aged 25 to 34 is relatively low. The level of participation of women in the labor force in our country has been decreasing since 2006, and it reached the lowest level, less than 50 percent, during the COVID-19 pandemic. At the end of 2022, the labor force participation rate in Mongolia's labor market was 52 percent for women and 68 percent for men. Nationally, the labor force participation rate is over 60% on average, which means that only 60 out of 100 people are interested in working, while women’s interest in working is about 17 points lower than men’s. It should be noted.

If Mongolia wants to intensify its economic development, it is necessary to increase the economic, social and political participation and leadership of women, and to support them. For example, if the level of female labor force participation in Mongolia can be increased to 65%, on the one hand, it will improve gender equality in the household, business, and workplace, and on the other hand, it is estimated that GDP per capita can increase.

In 2022, the Government of Mongolia approved and implemented the "Interdisciplinary Strategic Plan for Gender Equality (2022-2031)”, and within this framework, the following 5 goals are being worked on. These include: (1) Creating equal opportunities for girls, boys, men and women to live healthy, safe, and learn; (2) Promoting equal gender opportunities and gender participation in the economy; (3) Develop a framework for gender equality; (4) Increase women’s participation and leadership at decision-making levels; (5) Ensuring gender equality in climate change mitigation and adaptation. It is necessary to successfully and consistently implement the above objectives of the cross-sectoral strategy for gender equality, and to make efforts to increase women’s leadership.

Gender equality is not only an issue of gender, it is an issue of development and progress of the country. Men and women differ in the way they approach and solve problems. With the support of women, they can solve many problems that men cannot solve. Men try to solve problems by force in the majority, which sometimes leads to deadlocks, while women emphasize solving problems by finding harmony, negotiation and consensus. Even when women negotiate on their own behalf, they are for the common good and society.

Studies conducted in many countries around the world show that when women work at the national and local government levels of the country, the level of corruption is the lowest and integrity is increased. In the past 30 years, it has been said that women are successfully working in the social infrastructure sectors such as human development, education, health, and social security, but in the last 10 years, many new sectors led by women have emerged. Women are also working in large numbers in new financial products, information technology, and new management fields.

McKinsey, the world’s largest research organization, says that men are promoted based on
their skills, while women are promoted based on their achievements and experience. Finding success and impressing others is directly related to men and inversely related to women. In addition, women’s economic opportunities and financial capabilities are poor compared to men. Therefore, a woman has to put in at least twice as much effort to compete with men, and she goes through a tougher road. Therefore, in order to increase women’s leadership, it is necessary to take into account the traditional, cultural, customary and economic barriers of society and work to find ways to reduce them.

The developed countries of the world today use representative democracy, which is a classic form of democracy, in the principle of elections. A key characteristic of representative democracy is the ability to represent the population. More than 50 percent of Mongolia’s population and voters are women. Therefore, maintaining a proper and balanced representation of the population is a major development challenge.

Almost 40 years before Æduge, Norway’s Prime Minister and former leader of the Labor Party, Mrs. Gro Harlem Brundtland, said: “Women’s representation at the decision-making level should be one-third or 33 percent. This is a necessary condition for influencing policy and doing politics. However, it is not a sufficient condition. Women’s participation is less than 30 percent, which destroys the opportunity to influence policy and do politics.”

Increasing the representation and leadership of women in the economic, social and political life of the country is valuable, important and vital.
Ladies and Gentlemen,

Good afternoon. First of all, I would like to thank my fellow organizers for inviting me to speak at this important event.

When I served in the parliament of Mongolia, I chaired the Parliamentary Subcommittee on Sustainable Development Goals. Before and after my term, I have remained dedicated to the cause of gender equality. The work and activities I have been involved in have provided me with a foundation for reflecting on Gender Equality and Sustainable Development.

Many colleagues are sharing truly important perspectives, experiences, and research findings at this conference. The UNDP, with support from KOICA, has spearheaded numerous activities in recent years to increase the participation of women in political decision-making roles. I agree with all of their actions. It is crucial to focus on tangible work, so “less talk, more action” is the principle I wish to adhere to.

Therefore, today, I have decided to share three examples of actions toward gender equality goals.

The first example of an action is our launch of the United Nations’ HeForShe movement in Mongolia. The keynote speaker this morning, Mr. Ban Ki Moon, is one of the key authors of the Global HeForShe Initiative during his tenure as the Secretary General of the United Nations. I have come to believe that gender equality cannot be achieved without the engagement of all genders in the discourse. All genders face challenges and problems, although the manifestations may differ. Often, when we discuss gender equality, there is a misconception that it only pertains to women’s issues. However, women and girls face many challenges due to their gender, as do men and boys. In our country, for instance, suicide is one of the leading causes of death among young men. Unfortunately, cultural norms that place excessive responsibility on young males and a lack of encouragement for them to express their emotions openly contribute to a high rate of depression. This issue must be discussed with all stakeholders at the table.

Finding a male champion for the HeForShe movement was initially challenging. As the SheForShe and SheForHe, I sought male colleagues to be champions for the movement, but no one stepped forward. Eventually, I decided to launch the program through the Mitchell Foundation’s young leaders, with the help of civil society [1]. Finally, one of my colleagues, Mr. Tserenbat Namsrai, who was the Minister of Environment at the time, stepped up to be the voice. Here I will share some photographs of colleagues who now support and have taken over the championship: Mr. Khunan Jargalsaikhan, Human Rights Commissioner of Mongolia; Mr. Tsogbaatar Damdin, Member of Parliament; Dr. Ankhbayar Begz, gender expert and Fisher Family fellow at Stanford University; Professor Gunbileg Boldbaatar of the National University of Mongolia. I would also like to mention Mr. Uchral Nyam-osor, current MP and president of the Young Wing of the ruling political party, the Mongolian People’s Party, and Mr. Erdenebold Sukhbaatar, President of the Young Wing of the main opposition party in the parliament, the Democratic Party. We are continuing our efforts to involve more champions. I also want to highlight Mr. Dorjkhand Togmid, member of Parliament and Chair of the HUN party. It is pleasing to note that the HUN party announced they will nominate an equal number of female and male candidates for the next parliamentary election ballot.

We are also expanding the movement to provinces. The HeForShe movement was launched in Umnu-gobi province in collaboration with the Policy Department, and the male champion was Mongolian traditional
wrestling star Mr. Darkhanbat Shoovdor [2]. So far, 3500 people in Mongolia have signed up for the HeForShe movement to show their support for gender equality.

The second example I wish to share is the pilot project on the gender equality index in universities in four countries: Mongolia, USA, Japan, and South Korea. Two colleagues, Dr. Ankhbayar Begz, the creator of the new index, and Professor Christine Min Wotipka, a leading voice in gender equality research in higher education, have shared about this work. This is a highly significant action. If universities provide a more equal environment, it will positively impact the lives of thousands of young people.

Why equality at universities is crucial? Because this is where most youth transition into adulthood, learn, and receive education to embark on their life journeys. Universities are the cradles of thoughts and ideas. All universities, without exception, have a moral obligation to drive change for a better future.

The third example I wish to share is about the Women Corporate Directors (WCD) chapter in Mongolia.

According to the latest Gender Gap index of the World Economic Forum, Mongolia ranks 80th in the world [3]. The largest gender gap exists in political decision-making and power sharing. As mentioned earlier, the HeForShe movement partially addresses this issue, and the parliament is about to vote on an election law soon in this regard.

To enable more equal economic empowerment, one area where we should take more action is corporate governance. This is where WCD comes in. WCD is a global membership organization with 2500 members serving on private and public company boards, overseeing decisions for 8 trillion dollars of market capitalization. If WCD were a separate country, it would be the third-largest economy after the United States and China. When I met with the founder of the organization, Mrs. Susan Stautberg, I asked her if she could help us launch the chapter in Mongolia, and she graciously came to Mongolia to assist us. Member of Parliament of Mongolia, Mrs. Oyun Sanjaasuren, has always been a staunch supporter from the beginning and served as a co-chair for seven years until this year, when Mrs. Onchinsuren Dendevsambuu of Onch Audit took over as co-chair.

The past and current members of WCD Mongolia are board directors of some of the largest companies in our country. We have conducted training programs with the International Finance Corporation and the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development to enhance board functioning and committee capabilities. Our members have served as panelists at the Global Institute and Regional Institutes in Europe and Asia. We also frequently host guest speakers, the most recent one being the CEO of Oyu Tolgoi LLC, Mrs. Dierdre Lingenfelder.

In August, members of the WCD Japan chapter, some of whom came to help us with the initial launch, will visit Mongolia. They are like “big sisters” to our chapter. We plan to hold a bilateral event to learn from Japan’s corporate governance experiences.

Last but not least, we continue to pursue our main mission of increasing the number of women in boardrooms. We have been working with the Financial Regulatory Commission of Mongolia and the Mongolian Stock Exchange to make changes to the company listing requirements and codex to include clauses on diversity and equality. This effort has been championed by our co-chairs and members, including the current member of Parliament and Minister of Labor and Social Protection, Mrs. Bulgantuya Khurelbaatar.

I have shared the names of individuals, the tapestry of organizations, and details of our actions. I believe that achieving gender equality and creating a more just world is championed by individuals and progressive organizations. These are not abstract concepts or mere numbers. Therefore, I salute all of you for taking more actions, and thank you for your attention.

References
GENDER EQUALITY IN THE LABOR MARKET

ODONTUYA Saldan

The Deputy Speaker of Parliament of Mongolia

Legal environment

"Pursuant to the Constitution, Civil Code, and Laws on Gender Equality of Mongolia, it is prohibited to provide equal opportunities and protect the rights of citizens, girls, and women, and to discriminate, limit, or set preferences in society or family in any way based on gender, regardless of gender. This adherence to the principle of equal and open inclusion and protection."

"Laws on Labor, Employment Promotion, Occupational Safety and Health prohibit discrimination, restriction, or preference based on gender in employment and labor relations. Meanwhile, the Revised Law on Combating Domestic Violence, Law on Gender Equality, and Anti-Trafficking Laws regulate legal relations related to combating and stopping gender-based violence, determining its causes, and protecting the rights of victims."

"The Law on Elections of the Great Khural of Mongolia and the Law on Ensuring Gender Equality are used to ensure equal participation of women in all sectors and levels."

"Our country has joined international agreements and conventions in the field of protecting women's rights and improving the legal environment, approving national laws and policy programs, and taking initiatives. For example, they have joined the 'Beijing Declaration on the Status of Women', the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Feminism, and the Geneva Declaration on Improving the Status of Rural Women."

Labor relations and employment

"Women have been actively engaged in wealth creation within their society, taking care of their families, raising their children, and making significant contributions to the national and household economy. Women constitute 50.91\textsuperscript{1} percent of the total population of our country. By 2022, there will be 66,600 single mothers and 32,000 single mothers with children under 18 years of age. Additionally, there are 47,500 households with single elderly individuals, of which 72.9 percent are women."

Women make up 61.6 percent of the population outside the labor force and 46.7 percent of the total workforce, indicating that the women's labor force participation rate is 14.9 percent lower than that of men. As of 2022, the labor force participation rate of men in our country is 66.4 percent, and that of women is 51.5 percent. The employment rate of men is 61.5 percent, while that of women is 48.5 percent.

Women make up 63.5% of the service sector, 22.5% of the agricultural sector, and 14% of the industry and construction sector. Additionally, out of the 55,400 enterprises paying contributions to the social insurance fund, 22,300 or 40.2% of them are managed by women.

Although women play a major role in the country's economic development, the issue of protecting women's rights and promoting gender sensitivity in labor relations will be considered in the context of the reform of the Labor Law.

The revised Labor Law incorporates several provisions aimed at safeguarding and upholding women's rights in the workplace, as well as ensuring decent employment practices. These regulations specifically address the protection of female employees engaged in labor relations. They encompass the following measures:

1. **Prohibition of termination:** The law prohibits the termination of employment contracts for pregnant women and mothers with children under the age of three, thus safeguarding their job security.
2. **Additional breaks and allowances:** Provision is made for additional breaks and allowances to accommodate breastfeeding and child care

\textsuperscript{1} National Statistics Office, 2021
responsibilities, recognizing the importance of supporting working mothers in fulfilling these duties.

3. Maternity and paternity leave: The law grants maternity leave for female employees, allowing them the necessary time to recover from childbirth and bond with their newborns. Moreover, paternity leave is also provided, enabling fathers to actively participate in child-rearing.

4. Adoption and childcare leave: Employees who adopt a newborn child are entitled to leave, acknowledging the importance of supporting adoptive parents. Additionally, childcare leave is granted to employees with children under the age of three, acknowledging their need to attend to their children's care.

5. Flexible employment arrangements: Pregnant women and employees with young children can be employed under flexible conditions, recognizing the need for flexibility in balancing work and family responsibilities.

6. Prohibition of employment on official assignments: It is legally prohibited to assign pregnant women and employees with young children to official duties that may be deemed unsuitable for their well-being.

Furthermore, the revised law recognizes various types of labor contracts, including part-time work, work from home, and remote work. These provisions allow women to effectively manage their work-life balance and adapt their work arrangements to suit their individual needs and circumstances.

On January 10, 2020, the Law on Violations was amended to include specific provisions regarding freedom from any form of discrimination in the workplace and the appropriate liability for violations.


A total of 46.8 billion MNT was allocated for the implementation of the aforementioned projects. In 2022, the number of participants in programs and events doubled, reaching 85.3 thousand individuals. Among them, 50.7 thousand, accounting for 59.5%, were women. As part of these programs and measures, a total of 42.8 thousand jobs were created and preserved. Among these, 7.8 thousand are permanent positions, 27.3 thousand are temporary positions, and 7.6 thousand are part-time jobs. In 2022, the "Women's Employment Promotion Program" will be implemented for the first time. The program aims to support women who are responsible for caring for young children at home, with the objective of enhancing their income. It will provide them with the necessary electronic skills, training, and support, recognizing the unique challenges faced by mothers who have been taking care of their children at home for an extended period of time.

The Women's Employment Promotion Program aims to enhance women's employment opportunities and facilitate their reintegration into the labor market. The program focuses on addressing barriers to employment for women who are currently outside the labor force, as well as mothers who stay at home for extended periods to care for their young children. By providing them with essential electronic skills, necessary training, and support, the program strives to increase their income. In 2022, a total of 3,482 individuals participated in the program, with an allocated budget of 618.2 million MNT. As a result of the program, 556 permanent and temporary jobs were created, contributing to the overall goal of empowering women and fostering their economic independence.

Approximately 90% of the victims of domestic violence are women, while children make up about 10% of the total. It is concerning that the number of violence victims is steadily increasing on an annual and monthly basis. Additionally, 11.2% of all convicts sentenced by the court, totaling 1,505 individuals, are women, and 1.7% are children, amounting to 228 cases.

Within the framework of the social security policy aimed at mothers and children

As of 2022, Mongolia's total population is recorded at 3,457.5² thousand. The country exhibits an average

² Statistical Yearbook, NSO 2015
annual growth rate of 2.2 percent. With its vast territory and strategic location between two significant powers, Mongolia places great importance on population growth and human development, considering them as the fundamental pillars of its state policy.

Between 2010 and 2015, Mongolia witnessed an increasing trend in its average annual population growth, which climbed from 1.6 percent to 2.1 percent. However, there was a slight decline in the subsequent years, with the growth rate reaching 1.8% percent in 2019, indicating a decrease of 0.3 percent. Projections suggest that this downward trend in population growth will persist, with an estimated average annual decline of 0.14 points per year until 2033. From 2034 onwards, the growth rate is expected to gradually rebound.

The Law on Incentives for Mothers with Many Children and the Provision of Allowances for Mothers, Single Mothers, and Fathers with Many Children includes various measures to support families. These measures encompass monthly allowances for pregnant women and mothers caring for children aged 0 to 3, as well as additional allowances for mothers of twins and mothers with four or more children. Furthermore, the Order of Mother’s Glory is conferred annually to recognize the contributions of mothers with many children. It is important to note that these policy initiatives primarily focus on promoting population growth and may not fully consider the standard of living. While providing benefits and incentives is a means to encourage population growth, additional efforts might be necessary to address the overall well-being and quality of life for families. As of the end of 2022, a total of 168,200 individuals received age endowment benefits. Among them, 96.5 percent were women. Similarly, for child care benefits aimed at children aged 0-3 years old, 98.5 percent of the beneficiaries were women. In the case of benefits for single mothers and fathers with three or more children, 92.4 percent of the recipients were women. Furthermore, 77,600 mothers are currently receiving maternity benefits. Additionally, 283,200 individuals received benefits specifically designed for single mothers and fathers with multiple children, with women comprising 98.8 percent of the recipients.

These figures highlight the significant representation of women among the beneficiaries of these support programs.

Out of the total 957,800 households in Mongolia, 542,550 households have children between the ages of 0 and 18. Among these families, 65.3 percent consist of 1-2 children. In addition to the existing monetary allowance policy, there is a need to implement a livelihood support policy that promotes an increase in the number of children per family. This can be achieved by encouraging young families with multiple children through measures such as providing tax benefits and government support for housing. By incentivizing families to have more children and offering support in various forms, the government can contribute to the well-being and stability of these households. Increasing the number of children per family can have a positive impact on population growth and further development of the country.

Through the social insurance system, over 6.8 million people in Mongolia receive various pensions, benefits, and healthcare services. These include more than 30 different types of support provided to eligible individuals. The expenses associated with social insurance amount to approximately 7 percent of the country’s gross domestic product (GDP).

In our country, women make up 67.7 percent of the population aged over 60. Furthermore, women tend to have a higher average life expectancy compared to men, with a difference of 9.4 years.

In the social insurance system, there is no principle of setting pension, benefits, or insurance rates based on gender. However, special attention is given to women, as they are eligible for retirement at the age of 55, while men retire at the age of 60. Considering this age requirement, approximately 70 percent of all pensionable citizens are women.

Based on the provided data, it is highly probable that the majority of Social Security retirees will be women. However, it is important to note that the pension amount received by female pensioners tends to be lower compared to male pensioners. This discrepancy is not a result of the pension system itself but rather stems from the wage disparity experienced by women during their working lives.

---

3 Introduction to the population of Mongolia, NSO, 2020

4 Updated perspective estimate of Mongolia’s population for 2015-2045, NSO, 2017
However, with the aging population in our country, there will be a decrease in the percentage of the working-age population and an increase in the number of pensioners from 2030 onwards. This demographic shift poses a challenge to the sustainability of the current pension insurance system. As a result, a long-term strategic goal of gradually increasing the retirement age to 65 is being implemented to address this issue.

Due to the higher representation of female pensioners and their lower pension amounts, it is more likely that a significant portion of pension recipients will be older women. The Government of Mongolia has implemented measures to address this issue, including increasing the minimum amount of full pension, enhancing overall pension amounts, and reducing interest rates on pension loans. These measures have had a positive impact on elderly women, aiming to improve their financial well-being and ensure a more equitable pension system.

Social insurance coverage for low-income groups, such as herdsmen and self-employed individuals, is currently insufficient. Herdsmen, who work in demanding natural conditions and often have irregular working hours, appreciate the decision to extend the retirement age by 5 years specifically for them. This acknowledgment takes into account the unique circumstances of their occupation and aims to address the challenges they face.

Empowering girls and women and protecting them from violence

In Mongolia’s concept of sustainable development, specific goals have been set forth to promote gender equality and empower women and girls. Although our country has made significant progress in achieving gender equality, with increased education levels and life expectancy for women, there are still certain issues that girls and women should pay attention to:

Firstly, the percentage of women in decision-making positions and women elected to Parliament in 2020 stands at 17.1 percent, which is lower than the global average (25.5 percent as of January 2021) and the average in Asia (20.4 percent as of January 2021), including Mongolia (21.8 percent as of January 2021). However, it is still below the average for Central Asia (24.7 percent as of January 2021).5

Secondly, the issue of gender-based violence persists. Despite having laws in place to protect girls and women from violence, there is an ongoing prevalence of sexual and gender-based violence that primarily affects women. Domestic violence, in particular, remains a significant and life-threatening violation of human rights in Mongolia. Alarmingly, 89.1 percent of the victims of domestic violence are women. Thirdly, women continue to face lower employment opportunities and income compared to men. The labor force participation rate for male employees stands at 66.4 percent, whereas for female employees, it is 51.5 percent. A persistent wage gap has also been observed, with male employees earning nearly 20 percent more than their female counterparts. This disparity in salaries between genders has persisted over a significant period of time.

Fourth, there is a prevailing bias towards men in terms of real estate ownership, farming, and entrepreneurship. This bias is particularly evident in rural areas, where male ownership is significantly more dominant than female ownership.

Fifth, teenage girls continue to face challenges such as unintended pregnancies, abortions, and sexually transmitted diseases.

Sixth, in addition to women bearing greater responsibilities in raising children and caring for family members, this stereotype imposes limitations on their income, skill acquisition, development, and participation in social life. It is crucial to recognize and promote the significant influence and participation of women in enhancing stability across various spheres such as politics, the economy, and society.

Therefore, it is necessary to implement the following measures to empower girls and women:

• Developing and implementing policies and targeted programs to support women entrepreneurs in every sector of economic activity.
• Increase access to financing and investment to support women entrepreneurs.
• Clarify the term “female entrepreneur”.
• Effectively implement the policies and decisions proposed to ensure gender equality and increase the empowerment of girls and women. This includes the implementation of the 5th objective of the "Sustainable Development Program until 2030", the "Sustainable Development Concept of

5 World Economic Forum "Gender Gap Report", 2020

- To improve the sexual and reproductive education of adolescent girls and youth, there is a need to change the current education methods and elevate them to a new level.
- To create conditions for equality, it is essential to empower girls and women.
- Efforts should be made to stop gender-based violence and provide effective support to victims, particularly girls and women. It is also essential to implement comprehensive preventive measures against violence on a wide scale.
- To promote healthy family dynamics, it is important to provide family education for teenagers and young people. Additionally, organizing training programs and awareness campaigns for the public can play a significant role in fostering a balanced division of responsibilities between men and women in family life.
- Efforts will be made to enhance and empower rural girls and women.

Ensuring women are free from violence and empowering them is crucial for their increased participation and role in society, both at the household level and in broader social development.
Hello, everyone! Dear guests and representatives! Good day to all of you!

Gender equality is included as the fifth of the 17 goals for sustainable development proposed by the United Nations. One of the key objectives is to provide women with equal opportunities for full and effective participation and leadership at all stages of decision-making in political, economic, and social spheres. This goal can be achieved by increasing the representation of women in parliament and local government meetings, as well as promoting their involvement in management positions.

In this context, let’s consider some statistics that shed light on the current situation:

- As of 2021, women comprise almost 51% of Mongolia’s population.
- In terms of gender disparity, our country ranks 69th out of 156 countries, with a score of 71.6 percent.
- As of the first half of 2021, Mongolia ranks 127th out of 193 countries in terms of the percentage of women in parliament (17.3%). This falls below the international and regional averages.
- In the 2020 parliamentary elections, a total of 606 candidates competed, with only 151 (25%) being female candidates. However, only 13 female candidates were elected as members of Parliament.
- Throughout the eight parliamentary elections since 1992, a total of 608 members were elected, of which only 64 were women. The proportion of female members increased from 5.3% in 1992 to 17% in both 2016 and 2020.
- There is a significant disparity in the number of female candidates between local constituencies and the capital city of Ulaanbaatar.
- In the last four parliamentary elections, out of a total of 1,814 candidates, 430 (23.7%) were women. However, women comprised only 18% of the candidates in local constituencies, while the percentage rose to 30% in the capital city of Ulaanbaatar.

One major effort made by Mongolia to achieve the fifth goal of sustainable development was the amendment of the Constitution. To address this issue, the People’s Party launched the "Let’s Change Together" campaign, which lasted two years and aimed to engage citizens and voters in both the capital city and local areas. Following collaboration and agreement among the ruling party and other parties, a mixed electoral system was implemented, increasing the number of parliamentary members by 50. This significant increase provides greater opportunities for representation of women, youth, and disabled individuals in the parliament.

Furthermore, there are important solutions that should be discussed, debated, and proposed, particularly in the context of ongoing discussions on draft laws concerning elections and political parties. These solutions include:

- Challenging gender stereotypes in society and enhancing voter education.
- Establishing public funding mechanisms that support gender equality.
- Providing state supplements for women candidates, irrespective of the electoral system.
- Implementing direct funding support. For instance, South Korea provides additional funds to cover election costs when the number of female candidates exceeds a certain percentage. Similarly, in Finland, parliamentary parties allocate 5% of their total budget to support women’s groups.
- Implementing quotas to support equal participation of women in elections. As discussed in the recent conference, the proposed quota is 40%, while the People’s Party aims to increase the quota to 50%.
for women candidates to 50% as part of the People’s 50/50 policy.

- Reducing the electoral registration fee for female candidates and removing certain expenses related to election campaigning.
- Imposing limits on campaign costs and exploring alternative opportunities to manage television advertising time.
- Establishing comprehensive systems that create possibilities, opportunities, monitoring, and accountability for fair elections.

Additionally, it is crucial to mention other data regarding the gender situation in Mongolia:

- In 2022, Mongolia ranked 70th out of 146 countries in terms of gender equality worldwide.
- According to the 2022 Global Gender Gap Report, Mongolia is at or above the world average in economic participation, education, and health. However, it scores below average when it comes to increasing political participation.
- In Mongolia, 60% of university graduates are women. However, women account for only 30% of middle-level managers and a mere 15% of top-level managers.

While Mongolia has made commendable progress in terms of gender equality, significant challenges still need to be addressed. These include gender segregation in employment and education, labor force participation, violence against women, life expectancy, access to quality healthcare, and the number of female university graduates.

Therefore, apart from political participation, it is essential to promote gender equality at all levels by implementing appropriate policies to empower girls and women, approving and improving relevant laws, and establishing a budget allocation and control system to enhance women’s empowerment.

With increased women’s participation at decision-making levels, Mongolia can break free from social and economic development deadlock, reduce corruption, ensure transparent decision-making processes, and enhance the implementation of laws and regulations.

Thank you for your attention.
Your Excellency Minister Bulgantuya, Honorable guests and distinguished panelists and participants,
It’s my absolute pleasure to speak to you in the Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue on Gender and Sustainability - as gender equality, and more specifically women’s empowerment, is the most essential issue to address in the 21st century.

And the timing could not be more important than now, as the parliament of Mongolia is discussing changes to the gender quota in the electoral law.

Data shows that women are underrepresented at all levels of decision-making worldwide, including in Mongolia, and that achieving gender parity in political life is still regrettably very far off.

• As of 1 January 2023, there are 31 countries where 34 women serve as Heads of State and/or Government. At the current rate, gender equality in the highest positions of decision-making will not be reached for another 130 years.
• Only six countries have 50 per cent or more women in parliament in single or lower houses: At the current rate of progress, gender parity in national legislative bodies will not be achieved before 2063.
• Data from 136 countries shows that women constitute nearly 3 million, or 34 per cent of elected members in local deliberative bodies. Only two countries have reached 50 per cent, and an additional 20 countries have more than 40 per cent of women in local government.

The Gender Gap report of the World Economic Forum from 2022, that measures gender parity, in terms of Economic Participation and Opportunity, Educational Attainment, Health and Survival, and Political Empowerment says, it will take staggering 132 years to reach full gender parity globally. The number is even worse for the Asia Pacific region including Mongolia where it would be 168 years.

The latest UN Women Report says, at the current rate of progress, it may take 286 years to remove discriminatory laws and close prevailing gaps in legal protections for women and girls.

But instead of talking about how long it should take, we here should be asking ourselves, why not now? And why not now? There is absolutely no reason why women should not have equal representation in the national and local parliaments in Mongolia.

To those who say, there are not enough women to run as candidates, please know that with our KOICA-supported project, we have trained and prepared 1600 women to be candidates in next year’s elections.

To those who say, the public does not support women in politics, please see the April 2023 poll here in Mongolia among 1000 respondents by Sant Maral, where 82.9% DISAGREE that women should take care of the family and the household and leave politics to men. That is a very clear message. An overwhelming majority of the population, voters we can say, are saying that women should be in politics.

Here I would like to state clearly: gender equality is a right, and not a privilege. Women have the right, to be equally represented in decision-making bodies.

And I would like to emphasize, that this is not a women’s issue. It’s an issue for men, as well as women, because it affects us all. And here I would like to thank the male champions in the State Great Hural, that are supporting gender parity for women in decision-making. It takes the leadership of MPs, male and female, political parties, and the voters to make gender equality a reality, now, in Mongolia.

No society can develop and prosper - economically, politically, or socially – when half of its population - women are not able to fulfill their full potential. Mongolia is no exception.

While there has been progress, Mongolia is still far from achieving gender equality in all decision-making levels, particularly, in the Parliament.

With 20% gender quota for electoral lists, Mongolia has only achieved 17% women in parliament.
Mongolia ranks 134th out of 186 countries in terms of women in national Parliaments as per Inter-Parliamentary Union, regrettably far from gender equality.

With the current discussion on increasing the gender quota, for more female candidates in Mongolia, a quota of at least 30% female candidates in the majoritarian system and 1:1 on proportional representation, would only bring Mongolia, an increase from the current 17%, to around 20-22% women being elected in parliament. This is considering the increased number of MPs through the recent constitutional amendment.

With the candidate gender quota set to at least 40%, this could bring 23-25% of women elected to the Parliament.

Thus, even with a higher 40% quota in the majoritarian system and 1:1 male-female on proportional representation, Mongolia still would not even, necessarily reach the global average of women in parliament, which currently stands at 26%. Is this where Mongolia wants to be?

This is important to understand - that a 30%, or even 40% quota, in majoritarian system and 1:1 gender ratio in the proportional - does not mean 30% or 40% of the elected Parliament Members will be women.

Thus, it is concerning that the current discussion to significantly increase the gender quota is so highly contentious.

It should be a given, that the voices and rights of 51 percent of Mongolia’s population, women and girls, are equally represented in the legislative bodies.

In this regard, the political parties have a critical role to play in creating a conducive environment for women to succeed in politics. 10 political parties, including the 3 currently in parliament, signed a pledge in April, just 2 months ago, to set a 40% quota internally and to work for gender parity in decision-making. This is a key step in increasing women MPs at the national and local levels for the upcoming elections.

Thus, it is imperative that political parties translate the commitments they made, in the pledge, into tangible results, and ensure that they are fulfilled. Only then, concrete and meaningful change, can be brought about in Mongolia.

I am hopeful that the upcoming amendments of the Law on Political Parties and the Law on Elections will play a transformative role in achieving equal representation of women in Mongolia.

But changes in the law are not enough. Deep-rooted gender stereotypes and discriminatory social norms pose significant obstacles to women in decision-making. Particularly concerning is the portrayal of women politicians in the media.

To address these stereotypes, UNDP, under our KOICA-supported project, is actively collaborating with media outlets, to promote gender-responsive journalism, to respect women politicians, and to portray women politicians, as equal and capable leaders, in their own right.

Last year, we trained nearly 600 journalists, on gender-responsive and ethical journalism, while creating a database of 500 women experts and leaders, for the first time, to tackle the under-representation of women in media content.

Beyond the current discussion on the gender quota and women and elections. I would like to raise another important matter directly related to this Dialogue, which everyone should be deeply concerned with.

2023 marks the halfway point in the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals. While there is a dedicated Goal on Gender Equality, SDG 5, gender equality is a cross-cutting issue, that is mainstreamed across the 17 Goals. Any lack of progress on gender equality, will strongly hinder progress towards achieving ALL of the SDGs.

As I am speaking about women in decision making, let’s look at SDG 5.5 – “Ensure women’s full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision making in political, economic and public life”:

UNDP’s SDG Push diagnostics show 49 synergies with other SDG targets. Women’s equal participation and leadership in political, economic, and public life are essential to achieving ALL the SDGs by 2030. This shows, how clearly and how deeply, women’s leadership is related to other SDGs. Take for example:

- Women’s leadership and participation will significantly contribute to poverty eradication (SDG 1) by promoting gender-responsive policies, inclusive economic opportunities, and social protection programs that address the specific needs of women and girls.
- Women’s leadership enhances health systems’ (SDG3) responsiveness to women's health needs, including sexual and reproductive health, leading to
improved healthcare access, maternal health, and reduction in gender-based violence.

- Women’s involvement in the energy sector (SDG 7) promotes gender equality in energy policies and programs, fostering sustainable energy access, clean energy solutions, and renewable energy entrepreneurship for women.
- Women’s participation leads to gender-responsive labor market policies, equal pay, decent work conditions, and inclusive economic growth. (SDG 8)
- Women’s involvement in urban planning and decision-making leads to gender-responsive and inclusive cities (SDG 11), ensuring safe and accessible infrastructure, affordable housing, and public spaces for all.
- Women’s participation in climate decision-making ensures gender-responsive climate policies, promotes women’s leadership in climate action, and addresses gender-specific vulnerabilities to climate change. (SDG 13)
- Women’s participation in land and forest management, ensuring gender-responsive land rights, sustainable land use practices, and conservation of biodiversity and ecosystems. (SDG 14)

And I could go on. Though it should be clear that full and effective participation of women in decision-making is essential for sustainable development, there are still people, who question why gender equality is needed and how it benefits Mongolia.

These people could be our friends, family members, and colleagues, and even members of parliament – which means we need to work to change the understanding and mindset of the public, as well as those in decision-making positions.

We need to help these persons understand, that when women’s voice and agency, fully and equally contribute to development:

- Policies and regulations are inclusive and address the needs of everyone
- Economic growth is inclusive, and leaves no one behind
- The environment is better protected and cared for
- Society is more peaceful, with more resilient communities

While the challenges to making progress on gender equality are daunting, we should not be discouraged. In fact, it should be the very reason why we must increase our advocacy for women’s rights. So, we all need to:

- advocate for laws and regulations that promote and support gender equality
- raise awareness in our respective fields on why gender equality matters
- support women candidates to run for decision-making roles
- and encourage voters to elect women candidates

168 years is simply way too long to wait for something that should be a reality today.

Thank you.
It is a great pleasure to join you all here today. My name is Mark Koenig, I am here representing The Asia Foundation (TAF). TAF has been a proud partner to Mongolia for 30 years and we highly value the partnerships we have had over those 30 years with the government of Mongolia, members of parliament, civil society organizations and the private sector to promote gender equality as a key priority of our work.

We have already heard about many of the challenges that prevent women from fully participating in the economy and the statistics that demonstrate them. For example, women’s participation in labor force has been declining, women entrepreneurs are more likely to own informal or micro businesses. Women receive smaller amounts when they apply for loans, are less successful with their applications, and they pay higher interest rates. All this despite having a better performance statistically on repayment of loans.

We are aware of these figures and the challenges they indicate, however, we should not confuse these statistics with women not already being incredibly important to the success of the economy.

We must avoid definitions of economic growth, productivity and the use of certain statistics, that lead us to undervalue women’s incredible contributions to the economy now. The care economy is a concept that is emerging in global discourse that helps us form the vocabulary to discuss the critical (but often unpaid) work that is required in any society or economy, and that work is disproportionately carried out by women. In Mongolia studies tell us that if you compare working men to working women, not including those who stay home full time to take care of family and loved ones, working women do three times more household work than working men. This critical contribution is not something that should be undervalued. This is unpaid labor, but without that labor, our society and economy ceases to function. So everything we record as economic growth and economic productivity is enabled through that work we often undervalue in discourse.

The second undervalued contribution that we need to recognize is the critical role that women in Mongolia are also making through the informal economy. 70% of employees of informal businesses are women and these business often are providing critical and flexible income to their families. We often look at the informal economy as a problem, a challenge, and want to figure out how every business can be formalized, however the informal economy often can serve as a safety net, it provides a source of flexible income and serves many families to make ends meet at end of the month. So we need to see these informal businesses are critical contributors to the economy now, even if we do seek to promote more pathways towards formalization and growth.

So let us start from a place of recognizing how important these contributions are to the economy.

Now, we need to discuss why there is a need for change, and support the full participation of women in the economy and labor force. One key reason is that diversity is a strength. Diversity is a strength for parliament, for businesses, or any kind of organization. Having different opinions, and different lived experiences represented in decision-making can help shape policy, business strategies, and the way an organization thinks and lead to better results. Right now, we are not taking full advantage of the incredible insight and incredible lived experience, incredible potential of women in Mongolia and around the world, because we have let constraints on their full participation in the economy persist.

The decline in labor workforce participation in Mongolia has been generated by a serious of individual and quite rational decisions that are being made by women and their families. If you think through some of the reasons why women are leaving the workforce, we see the care economy and the care responsibility being foremost. Those are compounded and contribute to a
A wide range of social and urban challenges. For example, the traffic in Ulaanbaatar means that anyone who has one or two children in school understands that the transport issues make more difficult efforts to juggle a career with taking care of your children. The efficiency of service delivery can be similar; Mongolia has taken an important step forward in promoting e-service that makes service more efficient and easier to access. This is important because statistics show, it is women who are more likely to be interfacing with the government on service issues, so efficiency gains will help increase their time. These kinds of efficiency gains all help us contribute to freeing up time and space.

At the end of the day, however, change on some of the obstacles to the full economic participation of women will not come easy, and it will not come without the full participation of men. The complexity of the transition and the importance of men’s participation is something we all recognize, but at times we’ve struggled to figure out the solution. There are incredibly difficult conversations and difficult issues that need to be discussed, so that we can identify clearly what some of the blockages of progress towards equality may be. I think when we have strong female role models, we need to understand what we can learn from them, but not put the entire burden of leading change only on them. When need to have male role models help challenge values that lead to male dominance of the economy, and to understand and argue that we are not taking full advantage of all the diverse members of society.

Finally, would like to talk briefly about the challenges women face as entrepreneurs. The Asia Foundation, with support first from KOICA and most recently from Global Affairs Canada, has been operating a Women’s Business Center for about eight years. This is a single-sex location which is meant to provide a space for women to network, learn, research, experiment, study and form business relationships. We have often been challenged for opening a single-sex space on the premise that it is unfair, and disadvantages male owned small business who also face challenges. The reality, however, that fairness cannot really be discussed in that way until we have some sense of progress on the many structural barriers that allow economic exclusion and disadvantage of women to continue. The reality is business is still mostly done in majority male spaces. Most business require travel, requires networking and anyone who has been in business in many countries will know, spending time for drinks after the meeting can be a part of the business culture. Being able to travel, network, find new sources, and meet new contacts for your business is a necessity but it is made far more difficult if you have elderly, loved ones or children to take care of. So we don’t have a structural system that allows women to meet all of the many responsibilities society has asked them to take on without giving something up. And of course, we have many examples of women in leadership positions who have shown incredible strength, incredible energy and incredible know-how to overcome some of these disadvantages. But those exceptional performances shouldn’t be required for women to be successful but they should be acknowledged for what they are, they should be celebrated, but they shouldn’t be the example we constantly hold up and avoid difficult decisions, and difficult discussions about structural barriers that exist.

Access to finance is another area where we have structural barriers, we often respond with capacity development, trying to help women do more and be more effective. However, this approach can be critiqued for expecting those who are disadvantaged to actually come up with the solution for progress, which is an unfair burden on them. When we look at access to finance issues, the unequal ownership of collateral is a fundamental problem and we also have a significant challenge with actual bias and stereotypes. We did an experiment with a bank here several years ago when we trained those who are making loan decisions on gender equality, suddenly the percentage of women who are receiving loans increased at that one bank branch. This is a small example of how biases obverted or introverted is still a major part of society.

So my brief message here today is simply that these are incredibly complex issues and we have to look at the structural barriers to full participation of women or other disadvantaged groups in the labor force to make significant progress. Because the decisions that are being made right now by many women to leave the workforce are rational, households are making the best decisions they can and these decisions are affected by the structural arrangements. For example, when the pay gap is a reality and a family has to decide who will take care of the children and barely struggle to meet the bills, if the wife is earning less than the husband that will impact the decision. When we start to create a
system where people start behaving against their own values, it creates stress, it creates mental health issues, it creates challenges and we have been doing it for so long that we have a lot of work to do to untie and unknot some of this obstacles, challenges to create a situation which families can make value-based decisions, decisions that support diversity but also make economic sense so that they can reach full participation in the economy. We all know and accept in this room that if we can manage to do that the economy and all our lives will be better for it.

Thank you very much and I will leave my remarks at that. I think there are a lot of good statistics on the issue and I didn’t share most of mine given what has been said by the speakers before me. I hope this has been a useful contribution to the conversation.
PERSISTENT GAPS: GLOBAL AND NATIONAL PERSPECTIVES ON GENDER AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Christine Min Wotipka

Stanford University

His Excellency Chairman Zandanshatar Gombojav and The Secretariat of the State Great Hural of Mongolia Secretary-General Ban Ki-moon and the Ban Ki-moon Foundation For a Better Future Professor Gi-Wook Shin and the Walter H. Shorenstein Asia-Pacific Research Center at Stanford University President Eun Mee Kim and Ewha Womans University Distinguished guests, esteemed colleagues and students

Thank you for this opportunity to share my research and perspectives on Persistent Gaps: Global and National Perspectives on Gender and Diversity in Higher Education.

Many of us are aware of women’s growing participation as students and graduates of higher education. This is happening at all levels of higher education: Bachelor’s, graduate, and among faculty, and in many countries around the world.

To understand what is happening in higher education, it’s essential to look earlier in the education pipeline. As seen in this graph [Figure 1], the y-axis indicates the gender parity index, with 1 indicating gender parity or equality for men and women. This figure shows that at the beginning of the period (in 1990), enrollment rates favored men for all three levels of education, but this has changed considerably over time. As indicated by the green line with circles, primary education reached gender parity in 2013. For secondary education (as indicated by the blue line with squares), trends were similar as of the late 1990s, and there is now near gender equality. However, the slope for tertiary education (indicated by the top line) has always been much steeper. Gender parity was reached sooner – by around the year 2000 – and has continued to climb since then such that women outnumber men in tertiary education in many countries worldwide.

Let’s consider the reasons for the massive worldwide growth in women in higher education (Figure 2). There are several explanations at various levels of analysis. At the global level, the inclusion of many previously-excluded groups and individuals in many additional spheres of society was made possible by the global community’s attention to human rights issues following the atrocities of World War Two. In subsequent years, many countries worldwide gained independence and established universities and
colleges that had never been closed to women. Not long after, women’s rights movements gained momentum globally and in individual countries, thereby bringing about increasing rights for women, changed attitudes toward gender roles, and, with greater economic development, a decline in birth rates. Developing economies were hungry for teachers, medical professionals, and other highly educated workers. At the societal and personal levels, families felt the need for more than one household income with the rise in neoliberal economic policies. Women pursued higher education for the personal growth and fulfillment it promised and for financial protection after losing a spouse due to death or divorce. Finally, women also ramp up their education credentials to offset labor market discrimination. In short, women, more than men, need more education to have any hope of doing at least as well as men in the labor market.

Women cannot afford not to complete higher education.

Figure 2. Reasons for Growth in Women in Higher Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global</th>
<th>National</th>
<th>Social/Personal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Attention to human rights post-World War II</td>
<td>• Women’s rights movements (national)</td>
<td>• Need for more than one household income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Independence of colonized countries</td>
<td>• Changed attitudes toward gender roles</td>
<td>• Personal growth and fulfillment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Women’s rights movements (global)</td>
<td>• Decline in birth rates</td>
<td>• Financial protection after loss of spouse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Need for teachers, skilled workers</td>
<td>• Labor market discrimination</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. This figure presents some of the reasons why the number of women in roles across higher education are increasing, on three different levels, with information obtained from Berg (2019).

As you can imagine, tertiary enrollments by gender differ considerably depending on various factors. Among them is country income. As shown by this figure (Figure 3), tertiary enrollments match perfectly with country income. Perhaps not surprisingly, we see that shares of both women and men are highly represented in tertiary enrollment in high-income countries, with close to 90% of the age cohort of women and 70% of the age cohort of men enrolled. Although at lower levels than in high-income countries, it is still the case that more shares of women compared with men are enrolled in tertiary education in upper-middle, middle and lower-middle income countries. At the other end of the spectrum are low-income countries, which have the lowest shares of students enrolled in tertiary education and lower shares of women compared with men.

Figure 3. Tertiary Enrollment by Income Level and Gender

Note. The data for this graph is from “[OECD education statistics database]”, collected from the OECD website (https://data.oecd.org/education.htm) by Jieun Song, March 30, 2022. The graph itself was generated by Jieun Song.

Tertiary enrollment also differs by geographical region (Figure 4). At the world level, just over 40 percent of the age cohort of women versus approximately 35 percent of the age cohort of men were enrolled in tertiary education in 2020. Countries in North America, and Central, Eastern, and Western Europe have the
highest rates of higher education enrollments overall, and women are enrolled at higher levels than their male counterparts. In fact, only in Sub-Saharan Africa, where higher education enrollments are extremely low, do men have higher enrollments than women.

Figure 4. Tertiary Enrollment by Geographical Region and Gender

As education leaders, we are aware of gender gaps by fields of study, particularly in science, technology, engineering, and math, or STEM. In research I conducted with colleagues in the Graduate School of Education, we found gender disparities in the global average of the percentages of students enrolled in STEM fields of study between 1998 and 2018 [Figure 5]. Over those 20 years, as indicated by the top/red line, we see that considerably more men than women were enrolled in STEM fields, and the trends changed only slightly. At the beginning of the period, approximately 34 percent of men were in STEM. By 2018, that number dropped very slightly to 32 percent. As indicated by the lower/blue line, in 1998, approximately 14 percent of women were enrolled in STEM majors. Twenty years later, in 2018, that number ticked up only about two points to 16 percent. Despite the efforts of many countries, programs, and individuals, STEM continues to lack appeal to women students and may be losing its appeal to men as well.

To probe further, we examined women’s share of STEM graduates across countries by level of economic development, as classified by the World Bank (2019), from 1998 to 2018 [Figure 6]. Since country income levels change over time, we based our analysis on the classification of countries in 1998 across these four categories: high-income, upper-middle-income, lower-middle-income, and low-income. We again found less variation in 2018 than in 1998, reflecting increases in three of these economic categories and a modest decline in the upper middle-income group that in 1998 was ahead. By 2018, women’s share of STEM graduates was over 35 percent in both the upper-income and middle-income groups and below 35 percent in both the low- and high-income groups of countries. There appears to be no modernization advantage for women in the top-income countries. This finding is consistent with the lack of advantage for women in STEM in North America and Western Europe.

In another study with colleagues from the University of Toronto and Meta (Facebook), we examine the tenure gap for women faculty in 13 countries [Figure 7]. Tenure track positions represent the highest status academic position, offer job security and freedom, and are often necessary to advance to positions of leadership. The dark bars indicate the proportion of faculty who were women, while the light gray bar indicates the share of tenured women faculty. The gaps between these two numbers are listed in parentheses. In all but the case of Brazil, women were far less likely to be faculty with tenure. 33% of total faculty and 30% of tenured faculty, and women in Turkey fare even better (46% versus 42%, respectively). Japan and South Korea had the lowest rates of women faculty and tenured faculty at around 10%.

**Figure 7. The Tenure Gap for Women Faculty**

Note. Women’s share of all faculty compared with women’s share of faculty with tenure, by country. From Faculty at globally ranked universities in comparative perspective: Differences by gender, fields, and tenure status by Nakagawa, Wotipka, & Buckner (2023). Manuscript in progress.

National opportunities for tenure appear to play an important role in determining the percentage of tenured women faculty. In our descriptive analyses [Figure 8], we draw on the existing literature to group...
countries into three classifications based on their tenure opportunities: low (less than 40%), medium (40-60%), and high (above 60%). These categories represent long-standing differences in university systems around the world and map onto distinctive traditions. As expected, tenured faculty — men and women — are more likely to be found in higher education systems with higher tenure rates overall. In countries with low tenure systems (e.g., Germany and the Netherlands), only 8% of women faculty are tenured (and 20% of men), compared to 55% of women (and 80% of men) in high tenure systems (e.g., China, Japan, and South Korea). While women are still under-represented in high tenure systems (55% women versus 80% men), among women who have faculty status, a relatively higher proportion have tenure. Further analyses are warranted and on-going.

Figure 8. Share of Tenured Faculty by Gender

Note. Share of tenured faculty by gender in low, medium, and high tenure systems. From Faculty at globally ranked universities in comparative perspective: Differences by gender, fields, and tenure status by Nakagawa, Wotipka, & Buckner (2023). Manuscript in progress.

We use this to generate deeper insights into the nature of the so-called leaky pipeline. We think of this as:

- The availability of women to fill spots: Women’s enrollment in higher education overall and in particular fields determines the availability of women Ph.D. graduates who can enter academia.
- The availability of positions in higher education: Entry into tenure-track positions is shaped by the availability of positions – we know women may be diverted to non-elite universities or non-tenure track positions within elite HEIs. In addition, some systems have very few untenured positions at all, which “stalls” the pipeline for new entries; other systems are growing rapidly.
- The availability of coveted tenured spots (that allow for advancement): Advancement is shaped by the availability of tenured positions – a rare commodity in some systems. This is not to say that there isn’t positive movement across the board, but there remain stark differences.

Figure 9. The Leaky Pipeline for Women in Tenured Faculty Positions

Note. The leaky pipeline for women in tenured faculty positions. From Faculty at globally ranked universities in comparative perspective: Differences by gender, fields, and tenure status by Nakagawa, Wotipka, & Buckner (2023). Manuscript in progress.

While women’s higher education enrollments and graduation rates have outpaced those of men in the United States and most countries around the world, women are less frequently included in academic leadership roles, including the higher education presidency. Research has found that when women lead
colleges and universities, women administrators are not only paid more equitably across the institution, but these institutions also become more democratic, communal, and inclusive for all higher education stakeholders. As the most public-facing and highest-ranking leadership position in an HEI, the presidency represents a milestone for colleges and universities to reach in pursuit of gender equality in all its forms.

Ivy League universities have been exemplars in supporting women presidents [Figure 10]. Starting July 1, 2023, Claudine Gay will be Harvard University’s first Black leader. Nemat “Minouche” Shafik will be Columbia University’s first female president, and Sian Leah Beilock, will be the first woman to lead Dartmouth College. They follow in the footsteps of Amy Gutmann, president of the University of Pennsylvania (who was followed by another woman, M. Elizabeth Magill); Drew Faust, president of Harvard University; Ruth Simmons, president of Brown University (who was also followed by another woman president, Christina Paxson; and Shirley Tilghman, president of Princeton University. Not pictured is Elizabeth Garrett, the first woman president of Cornell University (in 2015).

On the other hand, pictured in the upper-left corner are the last four presidents of Stanford University, which has never had a woman president! In 2022, women made up only 22 percent of presidents leading the top 130 research institutions. Women of color comprised only about 5 percent (Quilantan, 2023).

In research I am conducting with my students, we examine trends and explanations for when colleges and universities in the U.S. have their first woman president. This Figure [Figure 11] shows the percentage of colleges and universities in our sample that had a first woman president from 1980 to 2018. In 1980, the starting point of this study’s timeframe, 34 out of 234 colleges and universities, or 14.5 percent of the institutions in the sample, had had a first woman president.

The proportion of colleges and universities that hired their first woman president increased steadily over time, reaching 131 colleges and universities out of 234 as of 2018. This is equivalent to 56 percent of all colleges and universities in the sample.

On the other hand, this means that 44 percent of the sample had not experienced having a woman president by 2018.
Results from our statistical analysis suggest significant relationships with the presence of gender studies programs and to a lesser extent, the proportion of women in state legislatures [Figure 12]. The establishment of women’s studies was a critical and hard-fought innovation in higher education that signified the valorizing of women’s knowledge, research methods, and topics of study. Once women’s studies institutionalized women’s knowledge in academia, it has become increasingly possible for women to be seen as capable of holding the highest authority of that knowledge. Having women presidents demonstrates the ultimate valuing of women as heads of knowledge institutions. Furthermore, our findings suggest that the larger political environment matters as well.

Women in positions of political power serve as role models for others, particularly young women, and motivate greater political participation by other women. They also change public attitudes such that men and women who reside where more women hold seats in power are more likely to believe women can govern. Beliefs about women’s ability to govern may extend beyond electoral politics to positions of power in higher education.

I have shown persistent gaps, as well as gains, in women’s participation in higher education as students, graduates in STEM fields, faculty and tenure-track faculty, and presidents of colleges and universities. What are the solutions to achieving gender equity and equality? I hope we can discuss ideas for what will work in Mongolia, throughout Asia, the United States, and beyond.
References


ISSUES OF HUMAN DEVELOPMENT AND MATURITY IN SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

BEGZ Nadmid
Mongolian National Institute for Educational Research
Human development research sector

Summary

The main content of this speech is the question of the maturity of a person who, in order to develop sustainably, should treat the mother nature with love and no harm, develop the economy with common sense, live according to the principle of smart consumption, and create a society that develops forward without harming the future for the future generations.

The philosophy of sustainable development is concerned with meeting the needs of the present without compromising the development of future generations. So, what are the material and non-material sources of sustainable development? Today, human beings use the earth’s resources for their daily needs and for the long-term development. This situation will continue in the foreseeable future.

Due to human consumption exceeding the nature’s capacity, human beings have become a factor that negatively affects the natural development and existence of the world, so the issue of sustainable development of nature, society, and economy is becoming more urgent. Humanity can no longer follow this current path of existence that worships overconsumption.

During the existence of human society, the steady and continuous growth without delay, interruption, or stoppage of any process should be the basis for sustaining the process of human development. Such a stable developed society can only be built by a person who has developed and matured properly. Therefore, the motto of education for sustainable development is, first of all, “Let’s develop people. Let’s develop with the strength of our people. Let’s develop for our people” should be the motto (Mongolian Educational Journal, 2002/1-2021/170th issue). We have been promoting this slogan with our Mongolian Educational journal for the last 20 years.

Key words: existence; change; progress; development; social maturity; social development.

One. The concept of development

The general concept of development is expressed in different ways in all fields of study, such as anthropology, physics, chemistry, biology, and social science. Even in economics, there are several different concepts under the category of development. Nowadays, scientists of anthropology and education studies divide human development into three main groups: physiological, cognitive, and social (Begz N. et al. 2018, p10).

So, what exactly is development, is it any movement, change, growth in numbers? What is the difference between growth and development? In other words, the concept of development refers to the movement and change in nature and society from quantity to quality, from one quality to another advanced quality, from the old to the new, and thus perfection (Ojegov S.I. 1981, p372).

According to the dominant concept in philosophy today, matter and consciousness as a whole are progressing from the simple to the subtle, from the lower clumsy system to the more organized higher system (Kokhanovsky V.P., Zolotukhina E.V. 2015, p. 320).

Two. Theories about development

Development, which is considered a positive value in existence, has attracted the interest of mankind since ancient times and has been an important subject of scientific research. Many prominent thinkers have dedicated their lives and works to understanding development, and as a result have created a number of
Key theories to view development ((Kokhanovsky V.P., Zolotukhina E.V. 2015, p. 320). For example:

- classical frequency theory based on the ancient Greek and Roman ideas about the endless repetition of the decline and growth of material production covering nations and civilizations,
- a cyclical theory of development that holds that the world is approaching a major catastrophe involving threats such as nuclear war, dangerous disease epidemics, or rapid population growth,
- the theory of linear development, which considers development as a never-ending and never-ending process of progress,
- cyclic linear development theory, which combines the conflicting orientation of cyclical theory and the optimistic orientation of linear development theory,
- there are theories such as the theory of formation, which states that human society will progress through feudalism, slavery, feudalism, capitalist, socialist society, and finally communism. These are theories about the general regularity of the development of human society in general, not in a particular field, or in a particular country or region (Human Resource in the Context of Regional Development. FTF, 2002, p.15).

Those who believe that there is an interactive dynamic relationship between education and development are mostly proponents of linear development theory. Among these, there are 3 major groups of social scientists, and they are divided into structure-role theorists, human capital theorists, and reform theorists. According to the theory of human capital and reform, education supports and improves development, and it is considered to be the social factor that best creates the conditions to demonstrate this in life.

However, life and development do not always follow a straight path, with continuous growth and progress. Natural and social life on our planet is a complex process with alternating cycles of growth, development, decline, demise, and recovery, with a beginning, continuation, and end, depending on many external and internal factors.

So, what is the nature of the "sustainable development" that we have a very superficial imagination, and how will it serve in a country like ours and the current level of upbringing and education of our people? Isn’t sustainable development a bright and
naïve dream like the theory of linear development, which sees development as an ever-lasting and never-ending process of progress?

I think that how much we take into account the possible grayness of the process, stagnation, decline, and recovery in development policy and planning are the research questions that require a clear answer. An essential part of sustainable development education should be the study of it.

Three. The creator of development must be developed himself

The nature, society, and economy are directly dependent on human development, intelligence, and consciousness. An ancient Arabic proverb says, "If you put a donkey in a glass palace, it will urinate and defecate." In order to ensure the sustainable development of the society, it is very clear that it is necessary to develop a person, his mind, and his morals first of all.

Medicine, natural and social sciences explain what human development is from different perspectives, but we educators believe that the most important part of the development policy of a member of society is the issue of his civilization, as mentioned above.

The main difference between humans and animals that live in the beauty of nature is the established norms of social relations, and the ability to create and live a life within the scope and limits of human nature. First of all, it includes the issue of intelligently forming one’s living environment and conditions, having the wisdom and awareness to solve one’s own problems without harming the needs of others.

Based on this, the main role of education is to support human growth and development based on natural data, thereby creating progress in social life. Creating one’s own living environment and condition with intelligence and an ability to resolve one’s own challenges consciously without harming other’s needs are integral part of that role. The concept of development first proposed by UNESCO and followed around the world in recent years considered economic development after the Second World War, but in recent years it has changed to focus more on the development of people themselves, and it is becoming more coherent with the notion of increasing the livelihood of people through education.
Four. What is the relationship between education and development?

Educators and research representatives from almost all social and economic sectors believe that the best way to develop a population is through education, and that social development is supported by a variety of learning styles and follows the development of lifelong human resources.

Scholars who believe that education is important for development generally support the reformist theory (Begz. N. 2009, p3-8).

Some scholars in this field believe that innovation and change mean development. According to them, a society cannot develop if the population does not create and preserve modern attitudes and values. I agree with that. But one of the criticisms here is that change and renewal are not development in the full sense. But it is true to consider them as intermediate steps to development. In my opinion, it should be considered that changes with positive attitude are prepared from new ideas, and the development results from them.

There is a direct link between education and socio-economic development. Education improves and transforms individual creativity and labor outcomes. Education is a set of values and beliefs that directs an individual towards greater development and ultimately becomes a powerful force to change social behavior.

Education is a force to change or suppress outdated values that tend to hinder the process of reform. Humans are of an animal origin. Also, because humans can still possess animal-like qualities, social institutions such as religion, education, science, and law enforcement perform social activities to soften and sometimes even suppress these characteristics in a person’s childhood.

Since education is one of the main factors of human resources, social, economic and cultural development, it also plays an important role in economic development, which is the material condition of society’s existence. According to APEID (Asia Pacific Education for Entrepreneurship Development) research, in Malaysia, Nepal, Korea, and Thailand, the labor productivity of agricultural workers who completed 4-6 years of primary school (measured by yield per unit area) is much higher than that of people without education. It is shown that 4 years of education are better than people without education in their ability to use modern scientific methods in agriculture, such as how to choose plant seeds, how to use fertilizers and insecticides (Education and Development. Vol.24. 2019, p.51). A large number of studies on the relationship between the education level of the population and national economic growth have been conducted between 1970 and 2020 in Asia and Oceania countries, and in these studies, economic growth is improving as access to and quality of education increases in all the countries surveyed (Human Resource in the Context of Regional Development. 2020, p.31).

Five. The role of educated people in sustainable development

As can be seen from the results of the roles and participation of people, the social maturity and moral development of people play a very important role in sustainable development. The abilities born from nature are the foundation of human abilities learned from society. Humans do not have natural language, culture, mathematical knowledge, skills, ethical sense, and communication norms at birth. People learn it only from the social environment. This is called education. Education has become a social mechanism for passing on the knowledge, skills, and practices of culture and life skills created by tens, hundreds, and thousands of generations since the birth of intelligent people. Education will continue to be the main factor in human development, and its role in a more developed society will increase (Begz N. 2001, p49).

Education helps individuals to understand their inner world and their environment, gives them work habits, and increases their active participation in social life. The flexibility of the educational space covering the whole society, the availability of multifaceted activities and the lifelong presence have a better impact on human development. Because education helps a person to feel any changes in the society, to get used to it, to overcome the difficulties with less damage, and it contains the knowledge and experience that is the basis of human potential (Theoretical and practical problems of management. 2003. p162).

As for our country, tens of thousands of people migrated from rural areas to big cities in the last 30 years and settled in central areas, many problems of their civic development are raised. Because there is no tradition of land ownership, it is considered that the
land beyond the threshold is not mine (Ecological vocation: the juridical guarantee of existence. 2012, p.168).

However, what you lose becomes someone else’s gain for us Mongolians who have nomadic descent who have not learned enough about the cultural and ethical norms of living together, this is more than a valuable cultural heritage, it is a common culture and citizenship, and it is good for other countries in the world. It is considered as a negative factor that prevents a pleasant life and shows that it is necessary to fight with it (Begz N. 2013, p.135).

Human rights, freedom, justice, equal rights, and responsibilities, which are important values of civil society, can be acquired, enjoyed, and implemented by people only on the basis of a certain level of education, knowledge, and practical actions. If we don't train and develop awareness in this way, we will be driven by our selfishness and destroy the non-renewable resources of the natural world, which is the main environment of our lives.

In order to ensure sustainable social development, the important qualities of loving people, interacting with cultures, learning and working together, balancing personal and social choices, taking care of others, making the right decisions, and taking responsibility for the decisions made are cultivated in the citizens in terms of intellectual and practical actions, it seems that it should be directed more towards human development.

In our current situation, education is an important institution for the development of our society, because it is a tool to make people aware of the interconnected nature of human, nature, and society, to acquire the culture of not only taking from nature and society, but also to live with giving, and to install such a correct logic of thinking.

Education is considered from many angles, but today the basic concept of education has been updated. In addition to acquiring scientific knowledge, abilities, values, and attitudes about oneself, human relations, and the environment, especially about social and cultural traditions and reforms, one also acquires practical skills for communicating and living together with others, personal development, and proper maturity, and one’s own and because it plays an important role in ensuring the sustainable development of society, the value and value of education in society is always growing in this regard.

However, for us, in our educational activities, we do not do a good job of teaching students about progressiveness, human ethics, ethics and morals only in theory, but in shaping them into the norms and customs of social relations and the daily life habits of children, youth and all citizens. it seems. Also, our education and training activities revolve around only information and knowledge, and may not be closely related to the development of human education in the form of application skills, habits, and attitudes. Our general talk and slogans about education are not landing on the ground.

On the other hand, when it comes to education, only 8 hours of classes and lessons come to mind. The non-school education space and the national lifelong education network that covers it have not been established in our country, and social groups such as adults, the senior citizens, the unemployed, the disabled, housewives, and the elderly have been left out of the education policy. According to the data of the United Education Statistics Foundation, the scope of our education policy basically ends at the age of 22-23, and the ages beyond that are left out of education policy, planning, coordination, management, and financing. For this reason, it can be considered that it is not too surprising to look at the development and moral situation of Mongolian society from the point of view of educational goals.

Six. Education and competitiveness of Mongolians in the global environment

At the beginning of the new millennium, we Mongolians are living alongside many other nations in the global environment of development. This new environment, which is constantly changing at a fast pace, demands from all of us high creativity and universally accepted global ethical norms.

However, we continue to show many bad traits that are impossible for people to live together in this world. For Mongolians, entrusting their destiny to the government, or religion, or else struggling to build their lives and livelihoods solely on their own, not tolerating other people’s opinions, seeing only the negative aspects of the process, flatly criticizing everyone who does not accept others are negative effects of the past societies we lived through, but bad qualities that we must be collectively working to correct today.
Accurate decisions based on fairness, collective intelligence, and high competitiveness have become the choice of the intelligent minority of our young generation with knowledge and skills in recent years. However, it should not be mistaken that the entire population will become a driving force for sustainable development by relying on it, by its own flow, by the example of external experience, and by the slogan of UNESCO. In other words, it means that the problems of the development and maturity of the entire population will not be solved by the goals of the classrooms of formal education, mainly aimed at numerical growth. In this way, we lay the foundation for the development of Mongolian people in elementary school, give our students the foundation of scientific knowledge of human thinking and understanding the world in middle school, provide vocational education in high school and post-secondary education, prepare our youth well for life, and continue to develop them throughout their lives. If possible, we are a nation with traditions and natural resources that can be educated as well as neighboring Russia, China, Japan, and Korea. At present, we should think carefully about the fact that most of the Mongolians go abroad and live in menial jobs with the lowest rating.

In our current practice, where the majority of the population lives in urban areas, it is necessary to carry out complex training activities with a cycle and sequence of settlement, urbanization, citizenship, and provide citizens such lifelong education in a form accessible to the entire population. In addition, it is important to provide the rural population with this education in a continuous manner, and to create a social mechanism that takes account of its results. It is important to solve many problems that threaten the existence of the Mongolian nomadic culture and the Mongolian nation, such as global warming, desertification of the territory, the overgrazing of pasture land, and the destruction of the environment due to mining. It is believed that this goal can only be achieved through formal and informal lifelong learning.

In the 4th industrial revolution, living in a smart city in the age of artificial intelligence, interacting with the Internet of Things, and digitalizing education, etc., are being promoted as the most important directions of the development policy of today’s young, middle-aged, and elderly people. This is a grand goal that is as important as the sustainable economic development of our country, which is currently underway to revive our economy, to carry out major constructions, and to create a good living environment for our people.

**Conclusion**

The norms and ideals of civilized social life are the most important values of human development, which have been formed by passing through difficult paths and leaving hard lessons for many centuries. If the contribution of education to their formation and development is properly considered, and the development policy should consist of the intersection of common international standards and the unique characteristics of the Mongolian nation. If we do not cultivate the culture of sustainable development facing the current society, the development of the nation will be negatively affected.

Providing education for the sustainable development of the new century to our citizens, who are rapidly being drawn into the process of urbanization from a semi-nomadic society, is a long-term activity that requires time and funding resources. In this case, finding the conscious support of the masses and improving their participation is important for the realization of the set goals. If we are able to do so, we will be able to protect nature and society as our master, and create a culture of intelligent consumption for members of society that will fully satisfy the needs of the present without harming the future, and there is no doubt that this can only be solved by the lifelong education of the population.

**Gratitude**

I would like to express my gratitude to those who gave me the opportunity to share my views on the role of an educated person in building a mature and sustainable society.

**Abstract**

In order to achieve sustainable development, it is important to love the mother nature, develop the economy with common sense, live by the principles of smart consumption, and build a society that moves forward without compromising the future of our next generations. First, we must address the issues of human development, which are main factors of the sustainable development of today and in the future. To develop a person means to talk about education. This
will provide an opportunity to define human roles and responsibilities for the sustainable development.

The concept of the sustainable development is a process of meeting current needs without compromising the development opportunities of future generations. So, what is development and what is sustainable development? The material source of the sustainable development is that today, human beings use the earth resources for their daily needs and long-term development.

Human development is achieved through education. A developed person builds a developed society. That is why the motto of education for sustainable development is "Let’s develop people. Let’s be developed by human power. Let’s develop for the sake of our people.” Providing education for sustainable development to Mongolians who are rapidly becoming more and more involved in the process of urbanization from a semi-nomadic society is a time-consuming and long-term process. In our current practice, where the majority of the population is living in urban areas, it is necessary to develop and implement a policy to solve the complex process of resettlement, urbanization, civilization, and development through lifelong learning. This cannot be addressed in formal education alone. This development goal needs to be considered and addressed in line with the Sustainable Development Goals-4 Education 2030 Plan.

Bibliography

Academy of Educational Sciences. Educational Research, 2002/1-2021/170
Begz. N. Education and development. BS-2009/11/3-8
Ecological vocation: the juridical guarantee of existence. (2012), UB, p. 168
Human Resource in the Context of Regional Development. FTF, 2002, p.15
Human Resource in the Context of Regional Development. FTF, 2020, p.31
Kokhanovsky V.P., Zolotukhina E.V. etc. (2015). Philosophy of science. UB, p. 320
DEVELOPMENT OF GENDER EQUALITY EVALUATION INDEX IN HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS

ANKHBAYAR Begz1, CHRISTINE Min Wotipka2, RISA Ninomiya2, JIEUN Song2,
1Mitchell Foundation for Arts and Sciences, Mongolia
2School of Education, Stanford University, USA

Introduction
In our society, remnants of patriarchal ideas have persisted to some extent. Based on our research, we found that Mongolian children are taught to honor men from an early age. Through statistical analysis of the employees at Mongolian National University of Science and Technology (MUST) and focus group interviews with faculty and staff, we concluded that gender inequality is prevalent in Mongolia in a hidden form. This research was conducted between 2017 and 2022.

International studies conducted in Mongolia also highlight the insufficient level of gender equality. Despite the existence of legal frameworks such as the Constitution of Mongolia and the Law on Gender Equality, the implementation of these laws remains inadequate. Previously, there was no evaluation instrument to assess gender equality in Mongolia. While international evaluation indices can provide a broader perspective, they lack indicators specific to the organizations and sectors.

There is a growing global focus on gender equality in society. The discourse has shifted from empowering oppressed women to promoting social equality between men and women. In recent years, banks and financial institutions have incorporated gender equality as an indicator for low-interest funding, influencing global business and economic governance. The assessment of gender equality is also becoming increasingly important in society, science, and educational institutions.

Therefore, it was necessary to develop an evaluation index with international standards specifically for assessing gender equality in educational institutions in Mongolia. As part of author’s doctoral research, a gender index was developed to establish evaluation criteria for measuring the level of gender equality, and it was tested at the Mongolian University of Science and Technology (MUST) as a representative organization.

The aim of this study was to investigate and evaluate whether faculty in higher education institutions work in a gender-sensitive environment and whether students study in a gender-equitable environment. Thus, our study aimed to develop and test an index for evaluating gender equality in higher education institutions and calculate the results.

Through our research, we compared internationally used gender indices. We then adapted the general evaluation index used at the national level to a specific institution, developing a multi-parameter index suitable for higher education institutions.

To assess the feasibility of implementing this evaluation in organizations, two focus group interviews were conducted with representatives from faculty, researchers, and staff. The separate interviews with women and men revealed that workplace sexual and other pressures are common at MUST, negatively affecting the healthy working environment. Additionally, the lack of an organizational culture for victim protection and low trust were identified as potential factors impacting the organization’s productivity. The absence of specific policies on career development, coupled with excessive political interference and male-dominated policies of political parties, further contributed to the violation of gender equality rights within the governance of MUST.

From the four general indices compared in the study, we adopted 20 common parameters and developed an additional 43 parameters specifically tailored for educational institutions. Thus, the final version of the index consists of three groups and 63 parameters. Using this newly developed index to evaluate MUST as an example, the overall score for
governance was 0.239, for teachers and staff it was 0.593, for students and learners it was 0.617, and the overall score for MUST was 0.463.

This assessment reveals a lack of gender equality in all levels of management and leadership positions. However, gender equality at the level of faculty and staff, and at the level of students scored above average. The index-based assessment is aligned with the findings of other qualitative studies conducted at the school, and its objective nature allows for a comprehensive evaluation of gender equality. Consequently, the purpose of our research has been fulfilled, and we have formulated appropriate recommendations.

About Mongolia

Mongolia is a country located in Northeast Asia, bordered by Russia and China. It has a population of 3.3 million people, with 48 percent male and 52 percent female. The majority of the population, 70 percent, is under the age of 35. In terms of education, there are approximately 500,000 children in secondary school and 160,000 youths in higher education. The first university was established in 1942, and the institution where this research is focused, Mongolian University of Science and Technology (MUST), was established in 1978. MUST has 15 branches and currently enrolls 13,500 students in bachelor’s, master’s, and doctoral programs.

Current status of gender equality in Mongolia

Several studies conducted in Mongolia indicate that gender equality is insufficient in the country. For instance, the Gender-Based Violence Research Report of 2017, supported by the United Nations Population Fund and the Swiss Development Agency, highlighted the prevalence of gender-based violence, including domestic violence. The report found that 29.7 percent of surveyed women experienced physical abuse by their partners, while 17.3 percent reported workplace or other forms of abuse. Furthermore, 14.0 percent of women with partners had experienced sexual violence by others, a relatively high figure compared to other countries in the Asia-Pacific region.

These findings reveal that gender equality education is not effectively implemented in educational institutions, and instances of sexual violence persist in some higher education settings. While Mongolia may score well on certain international indicators related to education, such as literacy rates and access to schooling, these indicators only reflect aspects of educational access and do not provide a comprehensive assessment of the gender equality environment or quality of education.

Status of the research in Mongolia

Numerous studies on gender equality have been conducted in Mongolia, including the joint study “Gender Equality in Mongolia” by the Independent Research Institute of Mongolia (IRIM) and the Swiss Development Agency (SDA). Sociological sample studies have also been conducted to gauge public opinion on gender issues. However, research specifically focused on gender in the field of education is limited. Most studies in Mongolia have concentrated on women’s equal rights in areas such as the labor market, society, and politics, conducted mainly by international organizations working on poverty reduction, equal participation, and the elimination of domestic violence.

Although a few academic works have been published on gender-related topics in Mongolia between 1958 and 2022, only three doctoral theses have directly addressed gender issues. These works explored gender segregation in employment, factors influencing gender socialization among elementary school students, and the gender management system in Mongolia. However, none of these studies have specifically addressed the gender status in higher education institutions, which is the focus of our current research.

Development of gender equality evaluation index and test on Mongolian higher education institutions

The state education policy in Mongolia is built upon three pillars: 1) access to education, 2) quality, and 3) efficiency. While access to education has been a primary focus, it is important to recognize that solely
emphasizing access does not encompass the full scope of educational achievements. The quality of education and policy measures to enhance it are equally vital in our evolving times. Furthermore, it is crucial to assess whether faculty and staff, and students in educational institutions work and learn within a gender-sensitive environment. Ensuring gender equality, implementing relevant gender laws, incorporating gender content in employment contracts, and establishing gender balance policies are important indicators to consider. Additionally, key issues include whether educational institutions have dedicated departments addressing gender balance, conduct gender training and awareness programs, and promote gender equality among students. These issues warrant in-depth investigation. Adhering to a common standard is necessary to foster a positive and supportive gender environment in Mongolian higher education institutions.

To this end, it is essential to determine whether gender equality is upheld within educational institutions and develop a comprehensive gender index for evaluation, which is currently lacking in our country.

In developing this new index, we studied four internationally recognized indices that measure the outcomes of domestic policy decisions: the United Nations Development Program Gender Index, the World Economic Forum’s (WEF) Gender Gap Index, the European Union’s Gender Equality Index, and UNESCO’s Education Index. These indices provide valuable insights into how an index as a tool works.

The United Nations Development Program’s Gender Index evaluates gender equality across countries using five indicators: labor force participation rate, parliamentary representation, adolescent birth rates, maternal mortality rates, and the percentage of people with at least a secondary education.

The World Economic Forum’s (WEF) Gender Gap Index is a comprehensive measure that assesses 65 indicators across multiple dimensions. It encompasses 156 countries and is divided into four main categories: economic participation and opportunity, educational attainment, health, and political empowerment. As of the end of 2021, global economic participation and opportunity scored 58.0%, educational attainment reached 95.0%, health achieved 96.0%, and political empowerment stood at 22.0%. These figures highlight the need for increased women’s economic participation, improved political empowerment, and enhanced gender equality in many countries.

The European Union recognizes that systematic and consistent measurement of the gender gap at the member state level is essential for effective policy improvement and achieving desired outcomes. Their Gender Equality Index consists of eight subgroups and 31 indicators.

By drawing insights from these indices, we aimed to develop a tailored gender equality evaluation index specifically for higher education institutions. This index provides a comprehensive framework for assessing gender equality in the educational environment and serve as a valuable tool for progress monitoring and policy development. The four indices mentioned above provide a broader perspective on gender equality, encompassing various macro-level indicators across countries such as the economy, society, employment, finance, and health.

The main focus of this research is on the issue of creating a gender-sensitive environment in the higher education sector and developing a gender index. However, the aforementioned global indices do not adequately capture gender equality in the education sector. The index that best represents the situation in the education sector is UNESCO’s Gender Index in the Education Sector. This index compiles gender-sensitive education statistics and indicators from different countries and identifies factors that influence gender equality in education under two categories: Demand and Supply. It primarily focuses on primary and secondary education and is designed to assess countries as a whole, rather than specific institutions.

In the 21st century, human rights, including gender equality, have emerged as crucial global issues. As a result, banking and financial institutions have revised their loan requirements and made gender equality an important criterion for accessing low-interest funds. The Green Climate Fund, in addition to its green credit

10 https://hdr.undp.org/en/content/gender-inequality-index-gii
13 https://en.unesco.org/genderequality
criteria, mandates gender assessment for all projects it finances.

Today, gender equality assessment is gaining significance in the governance of global business and economic environments. For instance, the NASDAQ Stock Exchange in the United States, with a market value of $19.4 trillion, now requires companies whose shares are traded on the exchange to submit an annual report on their gender equality practices to their management. Failure to comply with this requirement may result in consequences. The United States’ Financial Regulatory Commission has also approved the need for companies to demonstrate their efforts in this regard. When graduates enter the workforce after completing higher education and acquiring professional skills, they are not only expected to excel in their respective fields but also to possess knowledge of human rights, a commitment to gender equality, and the right mindset. All these developments indicate that the world, countries, sectors, and organizations are entering a new era of governance, management, policy, and finance. It is essential for countries, sectors, and organizations to conduct fair and accurate assessments, acknowledging areas that need improvement and embracing the need for change. The time has come for informed judgments to be made.

By utilizing this new index, it aims to promote human rights fulfillment within educational institutions, identify areas for improvement, and determine the current level of gender equality. The study believes that creating an inclusive environment will positively impact the working and learning conditions for teachers and students in higher education.

As mentioned above, comparing internationally used gender indices, the study aims to adapt and create a multi-parameter index specifically designed for evaluating Mongolian higher education institutions. Through two focus group interviews involving 20 faculty and staff, the study found that sexual and other forms of harassment were common in the institution, negatively affecting the working environment. It also highlighted the absence of a victim protection culture and low trust within the organization, which can hamper productivity. The study identified factors such as the lack of a specific career development policy, excessive political involvement, and male-dominated political parties as contributors to gender inequality within the governance of the institution.

This assessment indicates a lack of gender equality at the management and leadership levels. However, gender equality assessment for faculty and staff, and students was found to be above average. The results obtained through this index align with the findings of other qualitative studies conducted at the institution. The study concludes that the objective assessment of gender equality has been achieved, and appropriate recommendations have been formulated as a result of the research work.

Meaning and Description of Gender Index Parameters

Parameters of the gender index and their selection basis

The values of the parameters in the gender index are derived from information provided by the National Institute of Education, taking into consideration the context of educational institutions. These parameters are created based on relevant quantitative indicators pertaining to the faculty and staff, and all students of MUST, including those enrolled in bachelor’s, master’s, and doctoral programs.

In collecting this information, we not only consider quantitative data related to individuals but also analyze internal regulations of MUST, provisions of the labor contracts for teaching staff, codes of conduct for teachers and staff, student codes of conduct, as well as the composition of councils and trade unions at MUST, ensuring gender balance. This comprehensive approach allows us to obtain parameters from various sectors where pertinent information can be sourced.

When selecting the parameters, we adopt a similar principle to the European Union index, which assesses and evaluates working environment conditions. We also draw inspiration from the Gender Diversity Index of the World Economic Forum (WEF), a widely recognized index that measures gender representation in employment, terms of employment contracts, and gender equality at the management level. Therefore, the parameters in the developed index are derived from the WEF parameters.

It is important to note that these selected parameters are specifically designed to assess the gender sensitivity of the working and learning environment.
environment within an organization, ensuring the establishment of a favorable environment for individuals of all genders. The index does not intend to evaluate gender aspects of educational program and curriculum content, as that should be approached as a separate study.

**Parameter Values**

A value of one indicates that gender equality has been achieved, while a value of zero signifies that gender equality has not been achieved. The parameter values range from zero to one, with a closer proximity to zero representing a higher degree of gender equality. The values of the total index parameters will vary, and some parameters will have a direct value of either zero or one. This is because these parameters typically relate to questions concerning internal regulations, policy documents, labor contract clauses, articles, gender-related programs, and the overall work environment of the organization.

However, parameters related to the number of faculty and staff, gender ratios, and the number of students have values between zero and one, depending on the proportion of men and women within the organization. Additionally, for certain parameters, it is appropriate to consider their qualitative assessment alongside the quantitative value, as determined by the focus group interview, in order to provide a comprehensive understanding of their evaluation.

The gender index was calculated according to the following formula.

\[
G = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{N_{\text{max}}} \alpha_i W_i}{\sum_{i=1}^{N_{\text{max}}} W_i}
\]

- \(G\) - Gender Equality Index
- \(i = 1, ..., N_{\text{max}}\) - Parameter number
- \(\alpha_i\) - Parameter value
- \(W_i\) - i number Parameter weight
- \(N_{\text{max}} = 63\) and \(N_{\text{max}}\) can change if the number of parameters is increased or decreased. During the calculation, the value of the parameter \(\alpha_i\) was the data determined by the current conditions of the school.

But the parameter weight \(W_i\) is a variable, and when ranking the indices of many universities simultaneously, the values of the weights can be obtained by multivariable analysis. In this case, when evaluating the school, the weights were ranked based on qualitative research, and the parameters calculated with higher weight or 3 points are: 1, 7, 12, 14, 15, 25, 29, 30, 35, 37, 40, 41, 43, 59, and 61 (a total of 15 parameters).

On the other hand, parameters defined as equality by law, such as the amount of wages specified in the law, or provisions that apply to a few people, for example, the number of trainee teachers and the gender ratio parameters, are weighted with 1 point. These parameters include: 8, 16, 17, 24, 31, 32, 34, 36, 46, 47, 48, and 57 (a total of 12 parameters). The remaining 36 parameters are calculated with 2 points. Some parameters cannot be measured with discrete values of 0 and 1.

The integrated calculation of parameters was done using the Matlab program. The evaluation result of gender equality for MUST is 0.465.

Based on this, the results of the evaluation of gender equality for each of the three sub-groups are as follows:
- Governance: 0.239
- Faculty and Staff: 0.594
- Students: 0.617

**Conclusion for initial study**

International studies indicate that gender equality in Mongolia is insufficient. To address this issue, the Gender Equality Law was developed and approved in our country in 2011. However, multiple studies have revealed that the implementation of this law in Mongolia has been inadequate.

In recent years, there has been a growing emphasis on assessing gender equality in the international business and economic environment. Banking and financial institutions have revised their loan-granting requirements and made gender equality an indicator for low-interest sources. Similarly, within society, science, and educational institutions, the assessment of gender equality has gained importance.

In the context of higher education institutions, there is a need to develop a new self-evaluation index to ensure gender equality. By doing so, we can enhance the educational policy-making process by fostering evidence-based decision-making and strengthening relationships.

Therefore, it is essential to develop an evaluation index with international standards that can be used to assess gender equality in the educational institutions. In this study, we selected and compared the Gender
Index of the United Nations Development Program\textsuperscript{15}, the Gender Difference Index of the World Economic Forum\textsuperscript{16} the Gender Equality Index of the European Union\textsuperscript{17}, and UNESCO’s Gender Index in the Education Sector\textsuperscript{18}.

These indices assess the gender equality of countries and rank them globally and within the European Union based on their gender equality indicators. By comparing these widely used international gender indices, we were able to adapt the general evaluation index used at the national level to the specific context of higher education institutions. We developed a multi-parameter index with a total of 63 parameters, out of which 43 parameters were specifically designed for educational institutions.

These 63 parameters were categorized into three levels: Governance, Faculty and Staff, and Students. Each group was evaluated for gender equality, and scores were assigned accordingly. To demonstrate the application of this index, we conducted an experiment at MUST as a representative educational institution.

The assessment of gender equality yielded the following results: a score of 0.239 at the governance level, 0.594 at the level of teachers and staff, and 0.617 at the level of students and learners. The overall score for MUST was 0.465, indicating a lack of gender equality in management councils and leadership positions. However, the assessment of gender equality among teachers, staff, and students was above average.

The assessment conducted using the developed index, based on the selected methodology, aligns with the findings of other qualitative studies conducted at the school. With the ability to objectively evaluate the state of gender equality, we believe that the objectives of our current research have been achieved, and we offer the following recommendations.

**Suggestions and recommendations for the university**

Based on the assessment conducted to improve gender equality in MUST, the following suggestions and recommendations are proposed:

A. At the level of governance:

1. Incorporate gender equality into the university's development policy at the organizational level. Take steps to achieve gender equality, including:
   - Assessing the existence of a gender-sensitive environment
   - Seeking intentional commitment
   - Establishing fair and participatory mechanisms
   - Evaluating gender equality
2. Develop and implement a gender balance policy.
3. Create a dedicated unit or position responsible for gender balance issues.
4. Develop a policy and plan to establish gender balance and equality.

B. At the level of teaching staff:

1. Provide gender-related training and awareness among employees.
2. Ensure gender equality among MUST board members.
3. Establish mechanisms to prevent and address sexual and other forms of harassment in the workplace.
4. Balance the gender ratio of the Doctoral Degree Board.
5. Ensure gender equality at the management level and in branch schools.
6. Implement programs to support male and female employees returning to work after maternity leave or leave for childcare.

The university should consider the impact of career breaks on earnings and lifetime earnings disparity between male and female workers who started at the same level, and conduct a detailed analysis of income breakdowns for male and female faculty with 5, 10, 15, 20, and 25 years of experience in the same field or branch. This analysis should account for factors such as retirement income and use labor economics methods to study the long-term social and economic implications.

- Provide facilities, such as dedicated rooms or areas, for breastfeeding and childcare.
- Develop and implement career development policies.
- Elect or appoint an ombudsman.

C. At the level of students:

---

\textsuperscript{15} https://hdr.undp.org/en/content/gender-inequality-index-gii
\textsuperscript{16} https://www.weforum.org/reports/global-gender-gap-report-2021
\textsuperscript{17} https://eige.europa.eu/gender-equality-index/2020
\textsuperscript{18} https://en.unesco.org/genderequality
- Implement a policy to increase male students' participation in scholarships and loans.
- Pay attention to increasing the employment rate of female graduates.
- Activate the Ethics Committee's work.
- Foster an environment that respects academic freedom in its entirety.

By implementing these suggestions and recommendations, MUST can make significant progress in promoting gender equality within its institution.

**Expansion of research: Pilot study**

Expanding the usage of the new Index, we conducted a pilot study to evaluate gender equality in eight different universities across four countries.

One of the purposes of the gender equality index for universities is to measure and evaluate the gender equality situation, assessing how organizations are performing in terms of respecting the rights of people who work and study in universities, and identifying areas of challenge. Another purpose is to identify areas that need further improvement at the higher education policy level. It is important to consider gender equality at universities because they are places where large numbers of youth gather. These institutions provide an opportunity to acquire proper knowledge about gender equality before entering the job market and society, where they can promote the right ideology about gender equality. Therefore, achieving more gender equality globally is essential for building a more sustainable and better life for future generations. This is the main justification for why the index can have more global applicability.

We selected two universities in each of the four countries: Mongolia, the USA, Japan, and South Korea. The chosen universities are the Mongolian University of Science and Technology and the German-Mongolian Institute of Technology in Mongolia, Stanford University and the University of California in Berkeley in the USA, Osaka University and Waseda University in Japan, and Seoul National University and Yonsei University in South Korea.

Stanford University received a total score of 0.86, and UC Berkeley received a total score of 0.85. Both universities have a comprehensive set of policies and tools to address gender equality issues. Stanford publishes an annual report, which is important for raising awareness and monitoring progress. Additionally, both universities have a strong presence of the Ombuds office. The public availability of data and transparency for the US universities was excellent. These two universities are among the world’s leading institutions, and many best practices exist that other universities around the world could follow.

Osaka University obtained a total score of 0.68, while Waseda University scored 0.6. Both universities have dedicated centers for Diversity and Inclusion, as well as an Office for the Promotion of Equality and Diversity, which serve as administrative units for implementing measures related to diversity and inclusion. These units have multiple initiatives, such as supporting female researchers in their careers, studies, and work-life balance. They also organize gender equality-related seminars, workshops, events, funding programs, and childcare services on campuses. The transparency of data for Japanese universities was poor, which leads to low confidence in the scores mentioned. Therefore, these scores are tentative results.

The total score for Seoul National University was 0.70, and Yonsei University received a total score of 0.68. The confidence in these scores is low due to incomplete data. There was a lack of transparency in the data from South Korean universities. However, it should be noted that both SNU and Yonsei have gender-supportive university structures. SNU has the Institute for Gender Research, Human Rights Center, and Diversity Council, while Yonsei has established the Center for Gender Equity and Human Rights Center. These offices and centers implement various activities, including workshops, counseling services, and gender-related research. Both universities have women faculty member councils. In the past, there were women student councils at both universities, but they no longer exist.

The data for the two universities in Mongolia was the most comprehensive. It took several months of dedicated research to obtain data for the Mongolian University of Science and Technology, and the scores for the subcategories can be drawn with high confidence. For the governance category, the score is 0.2 out of 1, for Faculty and Staff it is 0.5 out of 1, and for Students it is 0.6 out of 1, resulting in a total score of approximately 0.4 out of 1.

For the German-Mongolian Institute of Technology (GMIT), the governance category scored 0.7 out of 1, Faculty and Staff scored 0.5 out of 1, and for Students,
it received a score of 0.74, resulting in a total score of 0.67 out of 1.

Some tentative conclusions can be drawn from the current pilot study. Gender Data Transparency (GDT) is an important factor to consider when researching this topic. The more transparent the data, the better the assessment of gender equality. In all four countries, there is a strong demand for Gender Data Transparency and segregation of data by gender. The most transparent data was collected from US universities, while in the Asian countries of Korea, Japan, and Mongolia, it was difficult to obtain gender equality data. Gender data segregation is not practiced in Asia. Moreover, in STEM fields, the number of faculty members is heavily skewed towards men. Out of the eight universities, only two have had female presidents throughout their history. When evaluating these two universities, the duration of female leadership should also be compared to male leadership, considering the length of time the universities have been established.

Challenging and daunting issues exist worldwide, such as limited access to education for women in some countries, unsafe campuses, and inhibiting cultural and patriarchal norms. In countries facing such challenges, the index scores are likely to be very low, but the parameters and evaluations should still be conducted to identify problem areas and facilitate progress.

Universities have a moral obligation to be pioneers for gender equality in society. In societies where one gender dominates in higher education organizations, it is evident that gender inequality persists in that society.

References
Science and Technology Information Center Foundation
https://hdr.undp.org/en/content/gender-inequality-index-gii
https://en.unesco.org/genderequality
https://hdr.undp.org/en/content/gender-inequality-index-gii
https://en.unesco.org/genderequality
GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE AND HUMAN RIGHTS

MAZNAH Mohamad
Associate Professor, Malay Studies
National University of Singapore

Today there have already been many arguments to state why it is necessary to have an agenda which eradicates gender-based violence in society.

The primary argument being that, if some members of society are the targets and victims of violence this will impact on their potential to flourish as a human being in the fullest sense of the word. We must make violence in society abhorrent, but gender-based violence even more so. Why?

Firstly, gender-based violence sits on the intersection between what we know to be public lives and personal lives. Laws are usually made when an offence is considered to be of public interest. The realm of the household where most gender-based violence is committed is considered “private” and therefore should not be regulated, so goes some dominant opinions.

Second, gender-based violence is committed among people who are either intimately connected to one another or live in a space that is supposed to provide shelter and protection to all within it. Those outside of this household may find it difficult to be convinced that family members can commit violence against one another.

Due to the intimate relations between perpetrators and victims, there is always an under-reporting. Often the wife is unwilling to report on her husband as this will impact on the livelihoods of the family, particularly if the husband is the only breadwinner in the family.

Third, gender-based violence is also committed against people who choose to love whomever they wish to. Increasingly we need to be sensitive to people who are in same-sex relations. Societal violence is often committed against them on the grounds that certain religions and traditions consider this to be a grave sin. Hence justifying violence against them. This need to enter into debates on gender-based violence.

As you can see gender-based violence takes on a very distinct perspective when the above factors are considered. Due to this we also confront specific problem in addressing and eradicating gender-based violence at a much faster pace and at a level which will be of benefit to a greater number of people.

In achieving our goal of eradication gender-based violence, we need to be aware of issues such as the following:

1) The ambiguity of family, domestic space and sexuality:
   a. Notions of the family can vary by historical periods, and not just confined to the idea of the modern nuclear family.
   b. The notion of ‘family’ may not necessarily be about people tied by biological connection, but can include domestic help and relatives who should be covered by laws on domestic violence.
   c. Heterosexuality or heteronormative relations between man and woman is not the only form of intimate and familial relations today. These need to be considered in any law which claims to be protecting people against gender-based violence.

2) The need to have a wide-ranging network of stakeholders in resolving the problem of domestic violence, which includes:
   a. Law reformers/parliamentarians to pass effective laws
   b. Implementing agency, particularly law enforcement agency or the police to act on the intentions of the law.
   c. Social support systems which can provide shelter and counselling to survivors of gender-based violence
   d. Formal and informal education system, including the Media to play their role in educating society on the importance of human rights and gender equality.

In conclusion I would say that the above are only snippets of what could, and should be done in order to address the issue of gender-based violence in society. I congratulate the Mongolian government for undertaking this very important task of paying attention to the problem of gender-based violence in society. The survey, law and support systems put in place is a commendable action plan towards realising the vision of gender equality and sustainability in society.
QUALITY AND GENDER INCLUSIVE EDUCATION IN THE KYRGYZ REPUBLIC

GULMIRA Kudaiberdieva
Former Minister of Education
of the Kyrgyz Republic

The development of the modern complex and diverse world requires the participation of all citizens of each country in solving the global challenges of our time. And only the equal participation of men and women in this process can ensure the achievement of goals in development area. That is why it is so important to take into account gender issues in decision-making and policy-making. In turn, this requires the achievement of equality between boys and girls, women and men in access to all levels of education.

During the years of independence, Kyrgyzstan has ratified more than 30 international conventions and protocols on human rights, including the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, and also became a party to the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action for the advancement of women. Since then, our country has taken legal, organizational and administrative measures aimed at raising the status of women and protecting their rights and interests. An important part of this work is to ensure the equal rights of girls and women in access to education.

The Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic guarantees the equality of everyone without distinction on the basis of sex, race and ethnicity, language, religion, social origin, political opinions and social status. The signing of the Sustainable Development Goals by the Kyrgyz Republic has intensified work on the inclusion of gender issues in the education system; The SDG indicators are included in the current Education Development Program for 2021-2040 and an action plan for its implementation for 2021-2023.

Kyrgyzstan is a young country. Currently, more than 50% of the population are children and youth (from 0 to 28 years old)\(^\text{19}\). A significant part of them are pupils or students at different levels of education. In total, the education system of Kyrgyzstan covers about 2 million people out of 7 million people (National Statistical Committee of the KR, 2022).

The indicator of enrollment in the basic general school up to grade 9 does not have a gender imbalance. The level of gender ratio in primary and basic education shows that girls at the level of basic general education (grades 1-9) receive less than boys. However, girls are more likely to be educated in secondary school (grades 10-11), while boys are more likely to drop out of school after grade 9. (National Statistical Committee of the KR, 2022)

We recognize that education is a driving force behind equality, poverty reduction, empowerment, peaceful and inclusive societies and economic growth in Kyrgyzstan. Education is essential for children who are out of school due to circumstances beyond their control - poverty, disability, developmental delays, migration, early marriage, violence.

What we are seriously concerned about is the quality of the education provided. Results of the National Assessment of students’ educational achievement in 2017 showed that more than 50% of students in Kyrgyzstan do not achieve a basic level in reading, mathematics and science (Testing.kg, 2017).

This raises concerns about their ability to “carry out the basic tasks that will enable them to participate effectively and productively in society”. Low functional literacy results in high levels of migration, unemployment, and young people’s vulnerability.

At the level of vocational education, there is a gender gap in the choice of professions among boys and girls:

For example, in higher education, only 26% of girls get professions related to technical sciences. The imbalance is even more pronounced in the field of secondary specialized education, where 88% of girls receive specialties in the field of education and 79% in

\(^{19}\)From 0 to 13 years old - 31.2% and from 14 to 28 years old - 23.6%
the field of health care. At the same time, among those who receive specialties in computer science, only 27% are girls, in the field of construction and architecture - 8.8%, in the field of energy - 6.2%, in instrumentation - 4.9%, and in the field of electrical engineering only 0.3% (National strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic to achieve gender equality until 2030, 2022).

This imbalance is one of the most important obstacles to establishing a gender balance in the labor market.

How are these problems being solved? The Ministry of Education and Science of the Kyrgyz Republic seeks to ensure equal access to education and overcome gender segregation at different levels of education through the implementation of an educational policy that takes into account the gender aspects of education:

The main activities of the Ministry of Education in the field of gender policy implementation are: development of institutional mechanisms for ensuring gender equality at all levels of education, keeping gender-disaggregated educational statistics, introduction gender components at all educational levels, the presence of a gender component in state standards, and also - at the level of vocational education - special programs, courses, an increase in the number of women in training in specialties in the field of natural and exact sciences, information technology, engineering, in general - in technological professions.

The development of the STEM direction will provide better opportunities in the future. According to predictions, a large increase in professions, as well as an increase in income, exactly in the STEM field. Therefore, the education system of Kyrgyzstan aims to improve the quality of teaching science subjects at school, integrate STEM education into curricula, and use STEM methods and tools.

Policy measures aimed at achieving gender equality are also ensured by the inclusion of gender issues in the content of education. In order to ensure that gender issues are taken into account in education, in 2019 new requirements for the development and examination of educational and methodological complexes were adopted. It was decided to conduct 4 types of expertise, including gender and anti-discrimination expertise. Its task is the analysis of normative documents in the field of education and teaching materials, through which the formation of the student's personal characteristics, focused on certain value orientations, is realized. At the level of vocational education, gender issues are also included in curricula within the framework of state standards.

So, for example, within the framework of the cycle "General Humanitarian and Socio-Economic Disciplines" read: "Gender Policy", "Gender Sociology", "Legal Anthropology", "Gender Policy in the Countries of Central Asia", "Human Rights and Democracy", "Problems of gender relations", "Sociology of the family", "Man and society".

The thematic sections on gender aspects have been developed and included by the Kyrgyz Academy of Education in programs to improve the skills of teachers at various levels.

Taking this opportunity, I would like to especially note and thank the Development Partners, UN agencies, the European Union, the Asian Development Bank, all partner agencies in supporting the efforts of Kyrgyzstan to achieve the quality and accessibility of education.

In recent years, successful initiatives have been developed and are being implemented to ensure equal educational opportunities for girls and boys.

For example, a project to overcome gender stereotypes in education and stimulate the participation of girls in science and technology subjects "Girls in Science" so that they can make informed career choices in information and communication technology, science, engineering and mathematics.

As a result, 30000 girls across the whole country have gained knowledge and tried their hand at science and technology. For three years, the project participants have shown an endless interest in knowledge in the STEM field and have taken their first steps towards obtaining the desired profession (www.unicef.org, 2022).

The Kyrgyz Republic, like most countries of the world, has been affected by the COVID-19 pandemic. The education system of Kyrgyzstan has faced an unprecedented challenge - in the context of unpreparedness teachers, often poor or no communication, and a lack of gadgets for schoolchildren, especially in the regions and remote corners of the country - to organize the learning process in a remote format.

Subject to emergency conditions of the pandemic, the Ministry of Education determined the most possible learning strategy and the majority of Kyrgyz school children managed to finish the school year and continue their education in the new school year. Access to distance education was provided through online
platforms, three national TV channels and applications for mobile networks.

It has to be noted that, despite the difficulties, we managed to retain the entire contingent of students - both girls and boys. The efforts made in a short time in the face of a pandemic in the education system have shown us that change is achievable.

In the “Global fact sheet on education during COVID-19” distributed by UNICEF, Kyrgyzstan was recognized as one of the countries that have made “progress in access to distance learning” (www.unicef.org, 2020).

We hope that participation in the PISA program, to which Kyrgyzstan returns in 2025, will allow us to evaluate our efforts, including in ensuring access to quality education for both boys and girls.
FACTORS INFLUENCING CAREER CHOICES

ARIUNAA Khashkhuu
Associate Professor, Ass. Prof. Dr.
Department of Business Administration
School of Business Administration and Humanities
Mongolian University of Science and Technology
E-mail: kh.ariunaa@must.edu.mn

Abstract
The study sought to investigate factors that influence the choice of career pathways among high school students. However, the study involved 150 people between the ages of 20 and 27, and it was determined what factors influenced their career choice after graduating from high school, and how satisfied they are now with their chosen profession. The study revealed that peers had an influence on the respondent (men)'s choices of careers. Although the influence of peers on the satisfaction of the career choice was significant, the influence of the peers is influenced by the school and the family members influence the choice of the school. However, this has not been proven to be significant for woman respondents. However, when this model is analyzed for male respondents, the above influence is proved by the significance indicator.

Keywords: career choice; family influence; school influence; peer influence.

Introduction
Career choice is one of the few important decisions a person makes in life. The choice of a student's career is one of the most important ones they will ever make. This choice will have an impact on them for the rest of their life. Their work plays a basic and important part in their lives since it determines how they will earn their money and affects their personality and outlook on life. Therefore, a career is a constant pursuit of achievement. Consequently, selecting a career is crucial for everyone. The research also indicated that peers had an impact on students' career decisions.

Peers have an impact on high school student’s career choices, according to a number of worldwide studies that have been reported in the literature.

Literature review
According to the literature, factors influencing students’ career decisions included family, school, gender, and classmates/peers. Numerous studies have shown that families have an impact on student's career decisions. The literature also shows that family affected students’ career decisions in several nations.

The literature also observed how the school had an impact on student's career decisions. Fisher and Padmawidjaja proved that high school students' professional decisions were impacted by their gender [1]. Studies conducted in the United States have shown that gender stereotypes may cause students to base their career decisions on gender. The impact of gender on students’ professional choices was validated by research conducted in the Netherlands [2]. In Nigeria, it was discovered that gender had a major role in influencing students’ professional choices [3].

Methods
Data was gathered using a quantitative technique to evaluate the impact of the aforementioned elements. The information was gathered using a survey approach. The survey had 150 respondents in its sample. Data collection involved the use of questionnaires. To examine the data, descriptive statistics were employed.

The questionnaire, which included the above criteria, was evaluated by 150 respondents, and the theoretical design sub-measures were grouped by factors influencing students’ career decisions using Principal Component Analysis (PCA) and Structural Equation Modeling (SEM). The total number of citizens aged 20-27 living in Mongolia is 375,473. A simple random sampling method was used to determine the research sample from this population, and the sample size for the study was determined to be 151. The
sample size provides a 5% margin of error for a 95% confidence level.

The respondents who participated in the survey were asked to assess the importance of the 49 criteria and the four sub-dimensions. The criteria were given as simply formulated sentences so that the Likert five scale could be used.

Table 1. Demographic Profile of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Freq.</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>37.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>62.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Demographics and age

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Freq.</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19-21</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22-27</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>93.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Result

Factor analysis results:

It can be deduced that the 41 criteria were properly grouped into the four sub-dimensions of the theoretical framework which was proposed to delineate the model of career choice. The KMO value was found to be 0.702, and the sample size was adequate for applying factor analysis. 0.702 or 70.2% of the respondents provided excellent sample reliability. In the factor analysis of the above questions, the averages are similar, grouping into 4 sets. The results of the survey correctly explain 52.3% (Eigenvalues) of the total sample.

Table 3. KMO and Bartlett’s Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin Measure of Sampling Adequacy.</th>
<th>Bartlett’s Test of Sphericity</th>
<th>Approx. Chi-Square</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.702</td>
<td></td>
<td>2061.434</td>
<td>820</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The outcomes of structural equation modeling

A good indicator for measuring a construct’s consistency is Cronbach’s alpha. A value above 0.7 indicates that the examined construct has consistency. Another valid indicator for measuring a construct’s consistency is that factor loadings, also known as λ, should receive values more than 0.7, while the component reliability (CR) and the average variance extracted (AVE) index should exceed 0.8 and 50% respectively. In Table IV, the proposed reliability measures along with each factor loading are presented.

Table 4. Loading calculations and reliability measures for each construct, including Composite Reliability (CR), Average Variance Extracted (AVE), and Cronbach’s alpha (α).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Y</th>
<th>Loadings (λ)</th>
<th>Reliability measures for each construct</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>Loadings (λ)</th>
<th>Reliability measures for each construct</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family influence on career choice</td>
<td>School influence on career choice</td>
<td>Family influence on career choice</td>
<td>School influence on career choice</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM04.</td>
<td>.827</td>
<td>Cronbach’s alpha</td>
<td>0.850</td>
<td>GEN03.</td>
<td>.784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM11.</td>
<td>.799</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>GEN07.</td>
<td>.752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM03.</td>
<td>.784</td>
<td>AVE</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>GEN02.</td>
<td>.719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM09.</td>
<td>.876</td>
<td>CR</td>
<td>0.906</td>
<td>GEN08.</td>
<td>.781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM06.</td>
<td>.819</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GEN05.</td>
<td>.776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM05.</td>
<td>.724</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GEN10.</td>
<td>.803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM08.</td>
<td>.709</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GEN09.</td>
<td>.780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAM07.</td>
<td>.761</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GEN11.</td>
<td>.764</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEN04.</td>
<td>.731</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>GEN01.</td>
<td>.724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School influence on career choice</td>
<td>Peer influence on career</td>
<td>School influence on career choice</td>
<td>Peer influence on career</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCH09.</td>
<td>.859</td>
<td>Cronbach’s alpha</td>
<td>0.824</td>
<td>PEER02.</td>
<td>.890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCH08.</td>
<td>.838</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>PEER01.</td>
<td>.846</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCH10.</td>
<td>.811</td>
<td>AVE</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>PEER03.</td>
<td>.808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCH11.</td>
<td>.807</td>
<td>CR</td>
<td>0.934</td>
<td>PEER04.</td>
<td>.743</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion

Peer influence accounts for 34.2 percent of the variation in career choice satisfaction. Peer influence is shaped by the high school one attends. This regression analysis proves that family members have an influence on the choice of the high school they attend. But this model is proven only for men. However, the model was not confirmed for female respondents.

References

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT POLICY ALIGNMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION STUDY

(a Case Study of Mongolia)

ENKHTOGTOKH Amgalan
1Mongolian National Institute for Educational Research, ESD-II project
SANJAABADAM Sed
2Mongolian National Institute for Educational Research
BAYARMAA Bazarsuren
2Mongolian National Institute for Educational Research

Abstract

Addressing global sustainability challenges through the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) is a top priority for many governments around the world. Since the United Nations Decade of Education (2005-2014), UNESCO has spearheaded the United Nations Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) initiative, and in 2022 adopted the SDG-2030: Roadmap, and member states are committed to each priority area of action.

A research was conducted to find out whether the main policy and training documents to be followed in updating the development policy and general education curricula of Mongolia include the sustainable development, sustainable development goals and education for sustainable development (MECSS, ITPD 2018; MEDS, MIER, 2020; 2021). Mongolia has included the concept and content of ESD in its long-term and medium-term development policy documents. As part of “Vision-2050” Long-term development policy of Mongolia, the Government of Mongolia has been developing 7 target programs for 2020-2030, which include "Human development" and "Environmental target program”.

It has the advantage of integrating long-term and medium-term policies and programs that were distinct and separate from each sector into national long-term development policies, and sectors to cooperate, take joint responsibility. Several Ministries are working together under the leadership of a specific Ministry to ensure the participation of each sector in the development of targeted programs.

Since 2000, projects and programs to introduce ESD into training and activities have been implemented in the field of education. In 2016, the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology approved and implemented the main directions and requirements for the implementation of the ESD concepts in general education training and activities.

Besides, the whole school approach has been implemented in 30 ESD model schools starting from 2020, and the progress has been made at school governance, curriculum, teaching and learning, human resource capacity development, school and learning environments and partnership level which is an opportunity to disseminate to other schools at the national level.

Keywords: Development policy; Curriculum; School based curriculum; Whole school approach.

Research methodology

A document analysis was conducted on policy documents, national research reports, national curriculum, and the results of activities implemented in the education sector by the ESD-II project.

When analyzing the curriculum, a total of 255 learning objectives, 171 topics, and 119 methods, approaches, and techniques were selected within the framework of the 8 comprehensive competencies and 17 goals of the curriculum given in UNESCO’s “SDGs: Learning Objectives” (2017). A matrix was created and used to
evaluate the core curriculum of all general education subjects with a total of 553 indicators.

The first initiative to carry out "a whole school approach" was implemented in 2019-2022 within the framework of the Sustainable Development Education-II project implemented by the Government of Mongolia in cooperation with the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation.

Introducing the "whole school approach" to schools was a new concept for Mongolia. Each school has different needs and different starting points for training and activities. Therefore, the introduction of the "whole school approach" was able to help the school community find optimal solutions to their needs and problems, and laid the foundation for the development of a school-based curriculum based on the characteristics of the locality, the school, and the different needs of each student.

Therefore, criteria were developed and evaluated to identify good practices of introducing project-based learning methodology in the school-based curriculum implemented in 30 model schools of the Sustainable Development Education-II project.

Research results

Long-term Development Policy of Mongolia and Sustainable development, ESD

Mongolia’s 30-year development policy until 2050 is determined by "Vision-2050" approved by Resolution No. 52 of the Great Khural of Mongolia.

The Objective 2 of Long-term development policy of Mongolia states "Groom a healthy, socially active Mongolian through creation of an enabling environment where everyone leads a happy life enjoying social protection as an assurance of quality life and having an access to quality education - the foundation for the country’s development and a secure family life". The three stages of the implementation of this objective fully reflect the concept of sustainable development and ESD. For instance,

- I Stage (2020-2030): The period for creating an equal opportunity for all to receive quality education, and reforming the system to ensure equal access.
- II Stage (2030-2040): The period to strengthen lifelong learning system and provide quality education.
- III Stage (2040-2050): The period to strengthen an open education system that supports lifelong learning.

Out of a total of 12 goals related to education in the above stages, 10 of them included direct and indirect goals related to the concept of ESD, its implementation mechanism, management, evaluation, and monitoring.

Mid-term Development Policy and SD/ESD

The United Nations SDG 2015, it was specially warned that education for sustainable development will play an important role in the implementation of 17 goals and 169 targets, and the " UNESCO Global Action Programme on Education for Sustainable Development" approved by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (2015-2030)" was recommended to member countries to develop and implement their national policies and programs.

The study examined 5 medium-term development policy and planning documents approved by the National Assembly and the Government of Mongolia. The policy documents included, a total of 123 measures related to the content and program policies of primary and secondary education and 9 indicators for evaluating them.

Section 4.1.7 of the Action program of the Government of Mongolia for 2016-2020 states "Elaborate and implement the "Sustainable Development Education Program" and raise public awareness and knowledge on cherishing the Mother Earth and respecting traditions and customs and forge environment-friendly behaviour and habits".

Four medium-term development policy and planning documents approved by the National Assembly and the Government of Mongolia were considered within the framework of the research. Total of 123 measures related to the content and curriculum policies of primary and secondary education and 9 indicators for evaluating them are included in these policy documents.

Curriculum and SD/ESD

A curriculum is a comprehensive document for the design, planning, and organization of learning activities, including learning goals, content, methodology, assessment, and tools.

Considering the learning objectives of the core curriculum implemented at the national level for the years 2014-2023, 142 (25.0%) of primary education,
217 (38.3%) of basic education, and 208 (36.7%) of secondary education relate to education for sustainable development goals.

46.7% of learning objectives in the core curriculum relate to cognitive learning. In general, regardless of the level of education, the concept of ESD is evenly integrated in the core curriculum, but the results show that it is integrated differently at each level of education, depending on the characteristics of each goal of sustainable development.

"Whole school approach" School-based curriculum and SD/ESD

Applying a Whole School Approach can help schools to find optimal solutions to their needs and challenges. According to UNESCO’s International Bureau of Education (2023), it addresses the needs of the entire school and learning environment, students, staff and the community, not just within the curriculum.

As part of the Education for Sustainable Development-II project, 30 model schools were selected and a school self-assessment checklist was developed and tested to implement the Whole school approach.

In Mongolia, usually external and higher-level organizations conduct assessments, so it was a new task to conduct independent assessments at the school level.

The process of independent self-evaluation of 30 model schools was carried out through the following stages:
- Analyze the current situation of school life and identify the challenges
- Identify solutions to current problems
- Plan actions to be taken to meet expectations and organize training activities

Therefore, the above 30 model schools have successfully implemented 130 small projects aimed at solving the social, economic and environmental
problems at the local and school levels, and have been able to involve local citizens and parents in this activity.

Also, in order to sustain the small project that has been implemented, we have developed a school-based curriculum and applied in trainings and activities. School-based curriculum development is the process of developing, implementing, and evaluating curriculum at the school level. The school-based curriculum will develop as a hidden curriculum because the localization of the learning objectives included in the national curriculum to adapt the local and school characteristics, and different cultures becomes the distinguishing feature of other schools.

The teachers of 30 schools jointly planned training and activities based on the principle of “3W1H” and developed a school-based curriculum. Ways to implement school-based curriculum are:

- Enriching the content of the curriculum with local characteristics and different contents: To enrich the content of the national curriculum with new ones such as, geographical features, historical and cultural values, animal and plant features, ESD, etc., and bring the content closer to life and use.
- Based on local community participation: To invite local people who work in the area to classes, to create conditions for learning from their work and life historical experiences, new ideas and works
- Conduct trainings: to conduct trainings outside the classroom, harmonizing it with practical application, empowering human resources by integrating the content and methodology of training, and introducing innovative learning technologies and tools that meet the needs of students.

We developed a methodology for evaluating school-based curricula, evaluated the curricula of 27 schools, and have begun the process of disseminating good examples to other schools. Changes in the knowledge, skills, and attitudes of students and parents of schools that implemented school-based curriculum can be seen from the results of the initial and final surveys of the ESD-II project.

Graph 3. Changes in student and parent knowledge, skills, and practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Initial Assessment</th>
<th>Final Assessment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student's Knowledge</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>30.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student's Skill</td>
<td>37.2</td>
<td>42.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent's Awareness</td>
<td>26.7</td>
<td>39.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

According to the analysis of Mongolia’s long-term and medium-term development policy documents and some legal acts, these documents have the advantage of being well developed and consistent. In addition, these policy documents incorporate the concept of sustainable development and education for sustainable development, and it is believed that the education program for sustainable development is one of the foundations for developing medium-term policies and plans for the development of the education sector.

From the analysis of these policy documents, it can be determined that Mongolia’s education policy is to provide equal opportunities and support for every citizen throughout his life and to obtain quality education.

According to the conclusions and recommendations of the research conducted in recent years, a lot of work is being done in Mongolia in the field of development of SD/ESD, but the implementation and results are not sufficient.

We need to pay an attention to the common issues such as (i) inclusive education and the different needs in education (ii) the competences that Mongolian children must acquire, (iii) human resources at all levels of education, and (iv) life-long education which are reflected in the conclusions and recommendations of the research works. Further we should consider the suggestions given in this field when updating the curriculum of general education.

Applying a Whole school approach was the biggest challenge in changing the attitudes and perceptions of the school community. By involving everyone in the school management and decision-making process, school action plans can be developed, and it is becoming important to introduce a new culture to all schools in Mongolia, so that each school's plan is tailored to its unique situation.
References

Mongolian

БШУЯ. (2020). ТХБ-ын үзэл баримтлах туссан байдла: баримт бичигий шинжилгээний тайлант
БШУЯ. (2020). Сургушуу бүхлээрээ ажиллах багц гарын авлага
БХ. (2021). Дээшний нийт төсвийн түвшинд болов Монгол үлс дээр ТХ ба ТХБ-ын хөгжлийн замнал. Хөгч ном
Төрөлсөн боловсролын талаар баримтлах болдолго (МУ-ын Их Хурлын 2015 оны 01 дугаар сарын 29-ны өдрийн 12 дугаар тогтоол)
МУ-ын 2021-2025 онд хөгжүүлэх таван жилийн үндсэн чиглэл (МУ-ын Их Хурлын 2020 оны 08 дугаар сарын 28-ны өдрийн 23 дугаар тогтоол)
МУ-ын 3Г-ын 2020-2024 оны үйл ажиллагааны хотөлбөр (МУ-ын Их Хурлын 2020 оны 08 дугаар сарын 28-ны өдрийн 24 дугаар тогтоол)
Боловсролын салбарын хөгжлийн дунд хугацааны төлөвлөгөө 2021-2030 (БШУСайдын 3Г-ын 2020 оны 10 сарын 09-ны A/96 тоот тушаал)
Тогтвортой хөгжлийн боловсрол үндсэн хотөлбөр (3Г-ын 2018 оны 209 дугаар тогтоол)
Мэргэжлийн социологчдын зөвлөө. (2023). Тогтвортой хөгжлийн боловсрол-II төслийн эцсийн үнэлгээний тайлант
Социологийн боловсрол төв. (2021). Тогтвортой хөгжлийн боловсрол-II төслийн суурь судалгааны тайлант

English

FURTHER DEVELOPMENT OF "ALTAI STUDIES"

ENKHBAT Avirmed
Ph.D., associate professor, Director of the School of Business Administration and Humanities,
Mongolian University of Science and Technology

The term "Altai Studies" is commonly used to associated with "linguistics" by researchers and the public all around the world. But this time, we intend to put forward our proposal about the possibility of using and developing the name "Altai Studies" in a wider scope.

Therefore, we intend to first consider it in the geographical context and integrate it politically and economically. The Altai Mountains span the territory of four countries: Mongolia, Russia, China, and Kazakhstan.

The Mongolian Altai Mountains constitute a major and central part of the Altai mountain range located at the junction of Central Asia and Siberia. The Mongol Altai has many summits around or even exceeding 4000 meters above sea level (m.a.s.l.) and stretches for some 900 kilometers from the north-western part of the country to the south, through the territories of Bayan-Ulgii and Khovd provinces. Over 20 peaks are snow capped in the Mongol Altai Mountain Range. These include Altai Tavan Bogd, the highest peak of Mongolia at 4,374 m.a.s.l., Munkh Khairkhan (4,204 m.a.s.l.), Sutai Khairkhan (4,226 m.a.s.l) and Tsambagarav khairkhan (4,195 m.a.s.l.). Towards the southeast, the Mongol Altai Mountain Range gets smaller and transitions into the Govi-Altai mountain range. In the Chinese and Kazakh parts of the Altai, the slopes in the montane and sub-alpine belts are covered in forests, whereas the Mongolian Altai has a much drier climate. The high ridges of the Altai descend to large basins and dry steppes, that extend eastward across vast areas dominated by great inland seas in ancient times.20

The geographical boundaries of the Altai Mountains have the advantage of clarifying the study of the Altai Mountains region, which is the main research object. On the other hand, researchers are given more limited opportunities. Politically, the population of this region, which is under the administration of four countries, has very little in common and have little to none unification. However, this provides an opportunity to cooperate and develop relations under the name of Altai studies in demography, preservation and protection of Altai’s natural environment, physical cultural heritage, tourism, transportation, and logistics. But in terms of economics, it is possible to cover Altai studies on a wider scale. First of all, it is necessary to evaluate the natural resources of the Altai region, and then putting them into economic circulation. In this, many issues such as urban areas in the Altai region, labor force opportunities, and education can be taken upon. Tourism is one of the fastest growing economic sectors in this region and requires small amount of investment. The Altai Mountains are a region with resources that can be called a mountaineer’s paradise that attracts climbers like a magnet. Mongolia has the opportunity to take the initiative and turn the Altai Mountains into another Everest of the world.

Now let’s consider the concepts of Altai language theory and Altai culture. One of the advantages of these concepts is the understanding of the possibility of "Altai studies" to cover a wider scope, overcoming the geographical boundaries.

Altai languages, group of languages consisting of three language families—Turkic, Mongolian, and Manchu-Tungus—that show noteworthy similarities in vocabulary, morphological and syntactic structure, and certain phonological features. Some, but not all, scholars of those languages argue for their genetic relationship based on putative systematic sound correspondences, while the consensus among general linguists is that this hypothesis is at best speculative and by no means proven. The group contains more than 50 languages, spoken by more than 135 million people spread across virtually the entire breadth

of Asia and from the Arctic Ocean to the latitude of Beijing. The Turkic languages are spoken principally in a nearly continuous band from Turkey, Armenia, and Azerbaijan through the Central Asian Republics of Kazakhstan, Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan, Kyrgyzstan, and Tajikistan to Xinjiang in China. The Mongolian languages are concentrated in the adjacent, roughly oval region formed by Buryatia, Mongolia, and Inner Mongolia (China). The Manchu-Tungus languages are spoken by widely dispersed populations farther to the north and east—that is, across Siberia in Russia and in the Northeast in China.21

The spread of the Altai language gives us another new idea. Esperanto is an artificial language that is popular around the world. It was invented by Polish scientist and doctor Ludwik Lejzer Zamenhof in 1887. Similar to his work, with three main languages of the same Altai origin - Mongolian, Turkic, and Manchu – it is my proposition to the linguistics ‘to create an “Altai language” with input from Korean and Japanese which is also Altai origin language as well. It is quite possible to create a new artificial language that be understood by the people of Altai. In terms of culture, this can provide a new opportunity to preserve and protect Altai culture and traditions since the Altai region is at the crossroads of Confucian, Orthodox, Islamic and Buddhist cultures.

Our Altai studies, which can cover such a vast space in terms of language, will cover an even wider space in the field of history and cultural studies. French scholar Jean-Paul Roux says, “For many religious historians, the Altai religion belongs to the Tungus, Mongolian and (broadly speaking) Turkic world living in Central Asia today (XIX and XX centuries).”22 Therefore, the Altai culture and religion influenced the lands and the people that these Tungus, Mongolian, and Turkic ethnic groups settled or dominated in broad extent. In addition, the Altai Mountains themselves contain many cultural heritages of paleontological and archeological value.

The Altai is not only famous for its rich biodiversity but contains rich overlay of different cultures from the late Paleolithic through the Turkic period. This is represented by thousands of burial mounds, among them the Scythian burial tombs, hundreds of standing stones including Deer Stones and Turkic image stones and hundreds of monumental structures of khirigsuur type. Both nominated areas can fully represent this rich cultural diversity. The existing World Heritage site, the Petroglyphic Complexes of the Mongolian Altai is within Altai Tavan Bogd National Park and in the buffer zone of Siiłkhem mountain National Park. In addition, the frozen burial complex in Oloñ nur, Siiłkhem mountain National Park which was discovered in 2006 by archaeologists D. Tseveendorj (Mongolia), H. Parzinger (Germany), V.I. Molodin (Russia) of Mongolian-Russian-German joint expedition. The partially mummified corpse of a warrior, which was found undisturbed and preserved in ice, provided important insight. This kurgan contained one of the latest burials of the Pazyryk Culture known today and dates to the early 3rd century BC, as confirmed by the finds as well as dendro-chronological analysis.23

Therefore, one of the important branches of Altai studies is paleontology and archeology, where international scientists can work together without differences of opinion. In this regard, Mongolia should show its support and establish an independent institute of Altai studies and create a way to develop cooperation with the cultured people of Altai.

Conclusion

Summarizing the propositions that I have advanced, I believe that it is necessary to study and develop Altai studies in the framework of nature and social sciences, not limited to linguistics, but in a way that has political and economic benefits. In this way, based on geographical factors, it is possible to create a new research direction in the world, including many countries within the framework of Altai language and culture, not limited to four countries: Mongolia, Russia, China, and Kazakhstan. If this is done, it is believed that, like the Silk Road, a new field of research called Altai Studies will come to the attention of the region as well as the world.

21 https://www.britannica.com/topic/Altaic-languages
23 https://whc.unesco.org/en/tentativelists/5955/
THE GENDER PROBLEM IN THE CONTEXT OF THE EPIC “KOROGLU”

AYNUR Ibrahimova  
Ph.D., Associate Professor  
ANAS Institute of Folklore  
Head of the Women’s Organization

A woman is the most beautiful work created by God. The Creator estimated her with the honor of being the highest title – mother. The word “woman” means motherland, land, peace, freedom, tranquility, love. Many glorious and bright pages of our history and culture have been connected with the name of a woman.

Studying the history of any nation, along with history books, historical monuments, historical sources one should refer to folklore – folk literature. Because an epic is a history created by the people themselves. It is an Ergenekon memory, it is an exit from darkness to light, from narrow to wide, it is salvation. The epic “Koroglu” is a living past of the people on the scale of idealization of heroism and it is a monument of immortal art. According to the opinion of the majority of scientists the development of the ancient Koroglu myth towards the epic was associated with the Oghuz-Turkman hegemony in the Middle East (during the 14th – 15th centuries). At a later stage, due to the different political-historical processes taking place in Anatolia, Azerbaijan, Central Asia, where Oghuz people settled, this epic gained different dimensions and thus a series of epics “Goroglu” – “Koroglu” was formed. All “Koroglu” texts in Azerbaijani Koroglu studies are classified into two groups in terms of image, structure, plot and motives: 1) Azerbaijani or Western version 2) Central Asian or Eastern version. The epic “Koroglu”, being a link in the process of continuous continuation of the Turk-Oghuz epic, directly or indirectly repeats the old models. In the Azerbaijani version of the epic Koroglu is a more central figure. Coming out of the common people, the hero protects more of his revenge character. He is a kind avenger, a brave man among his people. Like Robin Hood from English folk ballads. At the same time, he is the master ashiq who is able to improvise. In both versions the origin of the image of Koroglu is connected to the archetype of the son of God in Turkic mythology.

According to the its function Koroglu is the savior of the ethnos. Koroglu’s fame in Asia is as high as Homer’s fame in Greece. Koroglu is the “knight of great roads”, the patron of the Silk Road, Chanlibel [Ibrahimova: 2014-113].

No doubt, the epic ”Koroglu” is a heroic epos. The origin of this monumental word monument was formed with the bravery and heroism of Koroglu and his fighters. In 1959 year all the heroic deeds shown in eight of the 17 chapters included in the edition by M.H.Tahmasib are about love and affection. It should not be forgotten that love scenes in the Azerbaijani version of the epic are no less than heroic scenes. The ladies such as Nigar, Telli, Huru, Rugiya, Shirin, Mahbub, Dunya, Merjan were brought to Chanlibel because of their love and immortal love for Koroglu and fighters [Islam Sadig – 1998:5].

In the epic “Koroglu” there are no sharp contradictions and conflicts in intersex relations. In this society the moral values are able to maintain their own health, a woman with her own struggle allows to follow the rise. In the epic the people describe their desires and wishes, create the highest form of attitude to the women. In the epic “Koroglu” the place and position of the heroic female characters along with the heroic Oghuz fighters are very interesting. The women are connected with the events and stories in the different chapters. The woman characters such as Nigar, Telli, Mehbub, Rugiya, Dunya, Dona, Huru, Zernishan are the daughters of the noble families, they differ from the fighters due to the social origin. In fact, the women described in the epic have come from the different countries and are symbols of that native lands, bearers of peace, symbolizing peace.

In the epic “Koroglu” a woman is actually a goddess of love, self-sacrifice, mercy and a source of love. In the epic the female characters are active and their numbers are numerous. In the epic the old Turkic warrior women’s lines are clearly visible in female characters.
Girls are brave, heroic, able to show bravery, riding horses, playing swords, shooting arrows and wrestling. But all these heroic lines do not interfere with their femininity, feminism is not observed. They are very beautiful and pretty.

In addition to the themes of battles in the epic, the plot of the Bahadir is in the epic activity of all peoples, the hero’s marriage journey is also widespread, in which the woman is in the center.

Among the more archaic and especially widespread plots we can note the heroic races that take place between a boy and a girl. The last type of marriage competitions is about the image of a warrior girl. In its more archaic forms this image belongs to the matriarchal family relationships. The warlike girl, defeated by the hero, becomes his betrothed or mistress. Each of the women in Chanlibel comes to the mentioned place with their own wishes and dreams, they send a message saying “dear Koroglu, if you are brave, come and take me and they reached joining. Each of them has own epos. Sometimes in order to bring them, the heroes go to a hostile land, where, after a lot of adventures and bravery, they manage to get the girl they want.

In the Azerbaijani version Nigar, who is Koroglu’s lover, is at the center of the female characters. Nigar is a lifelong friend of the legendary Koroglu, who is known from the East to West. One can observe that Nigar has an equal status as Koroglu in Chanlibel. As Koroglu is the head of the fighters, Nigar is also the head of the women. He is in a conciliatory position when there are certain misunderstandings in the matriarchal family relationships. The warlike girl, defeated by the hero, becomes his betrothed or mistress. Each of the women in Chanlibel comes to the mentioned place with their own wishes and dreams, they send a message saying “dear Koroglu, if you are brave, come and take me and they reached joining. Each of them has own epos. Sometimes in order to bring them, the heroes go to a hostile land, where, after a lot of adventures and bravery, they manage to get the girl they want.

In the Azerbaijani version Nigar, who is Koroglu’s lover, is at the center of the female characters. Nigar is a lifelong friend of the legendary Koroglu, who is known from the East to West. One can observe that Nigar has an equal status as Koroglu in Chanlibel. Nigar is the mother of the nation, born from the spirit – desire, inner energy of folk, who passed through the fate of all fighters and women in Chanlibel. She is a symbol of the Ottoman Turkish Empire.

In the epic “Koroglu” in Azerbaijan there are many qualities inherent to men – fighters and women, one of them is their singing and telling poem. Most of the women in the Azerbaijani epic “Koroglu” are able to sing in the instrument “saz” and to compose poetry. In the epic one can see female heroes expressing their desires in poetry in the saddest, fragile moments and sometimes in the moments of excitement and bustle: “Koroglu turned and looked at Nigar. He saw that Nigar was in a bad mood and her apple cheeks turned white like Samarkand paper. Her grey eyes were filled like a spring cloud. Ruby lips faded in a minute so that it seemed as if she was dumbfounded and fell into the frost. Koroglu wanted to speak to her but Nigar got up. She looked at neither Koroglu nor his fighters, he did not look at the madmen, she came to the very edge of the hill slowly. She looked at the roads and then observed the snow-capped mountains in the distance. She took three strands from her hair, pressed them on the marble chest, and said...” [Koroglu 1965: 128-129].

In the Uzbek version of the epic Yunus Peri is associated with extraterrestrial beings, but she is an image with the same character and function as Nigar in the Azerbaijani “Koroglu”. Along with them, in the versions of the epos there are other female characters who are wise, show the way to the heroes and become a spiritual mother to the fighters. It is interesting that if in the Azerbaijani version the father Ali is a man who admonishes and guides the teenager Koroglu, then in the Turkmen-Uzbek versions this function is performed by his grandfather Jigali bey and stepmother Gulennam, who looked after him for many years. In accordance with the character of the heroic epic, in all versions and variants of the epos Koroglu, including the Azerbaijani and Uzbek versions, the first sign that women value when choosing their spouses is courage, heroism. Their proposal to marry Koroglu or his fighters (“if you are brave, come and take me!”) forms a heroic test. The hero must come to the enemy

(Translation: It is difficult to look at the house. My wounded soul is cold. The empty cradle covered in dust, No one plays sweet lullaby). Here the unique fragile love poems are the poetic expression of Koroglu - Nigar love. In general, Koroglu and Nigar’s love is observed in all chapters of the epic. Nigar is the mother of the nation, born from the spirit – desire, inner energy of folk, who passed through the fate of all fighters and women in Chanlibel. She is a symbol of the Ottoman Turkish Empire.

In the epic “Koroglu” in Azerbaijan there are many qualities inherent to men – fighters and women, one of them is their singing and telling poem. Most of the women in the Azerbaijani epic “Koroglu” are able to sing in the instrument “saz” and to compose poetry. In the epic one can see female heroes expressing their desires in poetry in the saddest, fragile moments and sometimes in the moments of excitement and bustle: “Koroglu turned and looked at Nigar. He saw that Nigar was in a bad mood and her apple cheeks turned white like Samarkand paper. Her grey eyes were filled like a spring cloud. Ruby lips faded in a minute so that it seemed as if she was dumbfounded and fell into the frost. Koroglu wanted to speak to her but Nigar got up. She looked at neither Koroglu nor his fighters, he did not look at the madmen, she came to the very edge of the hill slowly. She looked at the roads and then observed the snow-capped mountains in the distance. She took three strands from her hair, pressed them on the marble chest, and said...” [Koroglu 1965: 128-129].

In the Uzbek version of the epic Yunus Peri is associated with extraterrestrial beings, but she is an image with the same character and function as Nigar in the Azerbaijani “Koroglu”. Along with them, in the versions of the epos there are other female characters who are wise, show the way to the heroes and become a spiritual mother to the fighters. It is interesting that if in the Azerbaijani version the father Ali is a man who admonishes and guides the teenager Koroglu, then in the Turkmen-Uzbek versions this function is performed by his grandfather Jigali bey and stepmother Gulennam, who looked after him for many years. In accordance with the character of the heroic epic, in all versions and variants of the epos Koroglu, including the Azerbaijani and Uzbek versions, the first sign that women value when choosing their spouses is courage, heroism. Their proposal to marry Koroglu or his fighters (“if you are brave, come and take me!”) forms a heroic test. The hero must come to the enemy
city and meet him, show heroism, fight with opponents and win.

One of the heroic women in the epic “Koroglu” in Azerbaijan is the image Telli, who wears the clothes of a wrestler in order to rescue Ashiq Jun from the dungeon, “dressed from the top and locked from the bottom, girds a sword, hangs a spear, takes a shield” [Koroglu 1965: 63]. She kills the dungeon guards alone and frees Koroglu’s ashiq. Even at that time, she introduces herself as Koroglu and panics the city. “After that, when he tells about himself once, let him speak about us five times!” – telling it she sends regards to Koroglu. In many versions of the Azerbaijani epic there are even images of women fighting against Koroglu. One of them is observed in the epic “Koroglu and Aypara”, rejecting her love, she fights against Koroglu as an army warlord [Koroglu 2021:239].

Chanlibel is a society and a very just society, in which gender relations are maintained, which are a priority in our world. In the epic “Koroglu” a woman is a faithful friend, support, lover and the basis of a joint life of a man. The images “Nigar” in the epos get rid of the hometowns they represent, their ancestral native lands and enter Chanlibel with great pleasure and love. At the same time, the arrival of Nigar in Chanlibel is an expression in the epic language of the idea of the unification of Turkish hometowns under one flag.

Reference
Görogly epposy – https://www.kitaphana.net/book/1725/read
Ruzimboev 2016 – Ruzimboev Khorazm-Goroglu epos. Urganch, Khorazm publishing
Altai, as a toponym, is the name of the mountain ranges in both the Central Asia and the Inner Asia regions of Eurasia. These mountain ranges extend into the borders of today’s Russia, Mongolia, Kazakhstan and even China. The most important feature of this region, where the Altai mountains are located, is that it is a homeland where nomadic peoples have lived together for centuries. In this respect, nomadic peoples played an important role in shaping Eurasia. In this context, Altai is a region where the myths, legends, traditions, epics, customs and cultural elements of nomadic peoples are formed. In this respect, Altai has become a sacred region with its historical events. This sanctity is better understood in the "Bozkurt Epic", one of the most important epics of Turkish mythology. In addition, the beginning of the epic of Manas, the world’s greatest epic, in Altai with its material and spiritual cultural elements is another indicator of this holiness.

The name Altai, the sacred place of nomadic peoples in Eurasia, appears for the first time in the Chinese chronicle Zhou-shu 周書. In the following record mentioned in the related source, the name Jin-shan 金山 is also mentioned, while the gray wolf epic of Turks is mentioned, as well.

The Turks are a separate branch of the Hsiung-nu. Their surname is Ashina. They lived separately on their own. They were later defeated by the neighboring country. All of the people were completely destroyed. Only a ten-year-old boy survived. When the soldiers saw that he was small, they did not bother to kill him. So they cut off his feet and threw them on the grass. A she-wolf fed the boy with meat there. When the boy grew up, he was with the wolf. After a while, the wolf got pregnant. When the ruler of the neighboring country heard that the boy was still alive, he sent his men again and had the boy killed. When the men saw the she-wolf next to the boy, they wanted to kill her, too. The wolf then fled to the east of the West Sea to the North Mountain in Gao-chang country. There was a cave in the mountain. There was a wide plain covered with rich grass inside the cave. It was hundreds of miles wide. The plain was surrounded by mountains on all four sides. The wolf hid inside the cave and gave birth to ten sons. The ten children grew up. They each took a girl from outside and got married and their wives became pregnant. Then each of them had a lineage. Ashina was one of them. Their sons and grandchildren multiplied and gradually became hundreds of families. After several generations passed, they came out of the cave. And they were subject to the Rourans (Juan Juans). They became the blacksmiths of the Rorans in the southern foothills of the Jin-shan Mountains (Linghu Defen 令狐德棻, 1974).

The word Jin-shan 金山 (< jin 金 “gold” + shan 山 “mountain”) in this record means "Mountain of Gold". It is understood from the above information that the Turks lived in the grasslands to the south of Jin-shan, that is, Altın Mountain, before the Göktürk State was established.

* Professor Dr., Istanbul 29 Mayıs University, Istanbul, Turkey
The word Altai is associated with the words altan in Mongolian and altun in Old Turkish. It is generally accepted that both of these words are related to the word "gold" (Golden, 1992). This usage of the word in the Turkish and Mongolian languages is also in harmony with the word in Chinese sources. It is possible to see this relationship in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Németh</th>
<th>Tkc. altun ~ Mo. altan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ramstedt, Şcherbak, Räsänen, Baskakov</td>
<td>Tkc. al ‘red’ + Chin. ton (cf. Kor. ton ‘precious metal’)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poppe</td>
<td>Mo. altan, Kalm. alτn15, Mogr. xardam15, xardan &lt; *haltan &lt; *haltun &lt; *paltun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Räsänen, Rassadin</td>
<td>Yak. altan &lt; Mo. Altan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clauson</td>
<td>Mo. altan &lt; Tkc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doerfer</td>
<td>reject to → [Tkc. al ‘kızıl’ + Chin. ton] ve [Yak. altan] &lt; Mo. altan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Golden</td>
<td>Mo. altan &lt; Tkc. altun &lt; Proto-Altaic *altañ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pronounced as Altay Mountains in Turkish, Altaynnuruu (Altainnuuruu) in Mongolian, the mountain’s relationship with the meaning of “gold” can also be determined from ancient Turkish sources. The Altai Mountains are referred to as Altunyish in the Orkhon inscriptions. This is clearly seen in the following record taken from the Tonyukuk inscription:

“... ol üç kagan oglądaşı altun yış üzü karşılam temiş. Ança öğleşmiş. Önge Türk kagangaru süelim temiş ...”

T1 D 3 (20).

Those three khans agreed and said, Let’s unite in the Altai Mountains. Let’s send soldiers to the east, towards the Turkish khan, he said” (Aydın, 2018).

This shows that the Altai Mountains mean “Golden Mountain” in Turkish, as well as in Chinese. The Kyrgyz, On-ök and Tabgaç (Chinese) armies talk about a plan to gather on Altun Mountain and attack the Göktürk capital in the Orhon-Selenge region. In the relevant record, the region where Altun Mountain is located indicates the west of the Orhon-Selenge region, that is, the geographical region where the Altai Mountains are located. The geographic locations of the two regions are shown on the map below.

Altai, where many nomadic tribes and people have been on the stage of history throughout time; has common history, culture and civilization values that are shared in a boiling cauldron; it is known as the place where various nomadic groups came together and played an important role in the shaping of Eurasia with the states and empires they established by migrating to other geographical regions. In this respect, it is noteworthy that the people who lived in Altai and migrated from there to various regions were called Altai peoples in the scientific literature.

In the studies carried out to date, the linguistic aspect of the relationship between peoples has come to the fore. In this context, a theory called Altaic Languages has emerged, which suggests that the Turkish, Mongolian and Tungusic languages come from a common source.

It should be underlined that the core of this theory is Philip Johan von Strahlenberg’s (1676-1747) rough classification of languages spoken in northeastern Europe and parts of Siberia, based on his own observations. For this language family and community, five languages are meant- narrowly, Turkish, Mongolian, Tungusic, including Manchu, and, broadly, with the addition of Korean and, for a short time, Japanese. In this context, Karl H. Menges classified the Turkish, Mongolian and Tungusic languages as Inner Altaic languages (Inner), and Korean and Japanese as Outer Altaic languages (outer) (Menges, 1995). This situation reveals the fact that

---

24 The relevant table has been taken from Hüseyin Yıldız’s related article. Regarding the etymological connections of the word Altai, see Yıldız (2017). Some Notes on the Etymology of the Word Altai / Altay, Dil Araştırmaları, 11 (20), p. 191.

25 Strahlenberg, a German-born Swedish officer, was exiled to Siberia when he was captured by the Russians in the Battle of Poltava in 1709. When he returned to his country, he published his information and observations in Siberia under the name Das Nord und Ostliche Theil von Europa und Asia, Stockholm, 1739.
Altai Languages are spoken in an area close to twice the width of the European continent.

Although researches are carried out and opinions are put forward by expert scientists on this subject, it should be noted that the institutional meetings on the subject are held by PIAC.

PIAC, which stands for The Permanent International Altaistic Conference, is a series of meetings initiated by Mongologist Walther Heissig (1913–2005) and continued by Denis Sinor (1916–2011). Before D. Sinor's death in 2011, Barbara Kellner-Heinkele took over as secretary general of PIAC. PIAC held its first meeting in 1959 in Mainz, Germany, and its 64th annual meeting in Budapest in 2022. PIAC, which is an informal meeting of old and young Altaic scholars interested in Altai and Inner Asian studies, is rather a meeting that focuses on the language and linguistic issues of the Altaic peoples and communities.

Besides PIAC, another series of meetings on Altaic studies are the symposiums held under the name of The Academic Society of the Altaic Community (ASAC). These symposiums were started locally in Bishkek, the capital of Kyrgyzstan, together with our Japanese and Korean colleagues, including myself, and later turned into a series of international symposiums that brought together Altaist scientists working on Altai, Central Asia, the East and the Far East, and the Balkans. This series of symposiums, which are normally held every two years, are also held every year as interim symposiums if there is demand. The main purpose of this series of symposiums organized by ASAC is to discuss the history, culture and civilizational values of the Altaic peoples that shaped Eurasia and to present these values comparatively. As a matter of fact, it is quite interesting that recent studies have suggested that many words borrowed in the early periods of Korean spoken in the easternmost part of Asia and during the Mongol rule in the middle of the 13th century are of Turkish origin (Choi, 2004). Besides, in recent studies on Japanese history, a period of roughly 300 years from the end of the 4th century to the end of the 7th century is called the Kurgan Period. It is stated that various items and tools in these kurgans show similar characteristics related to the nomadic equestrian culture in North Asia. This situation reveals the importance of conducting research on the cultural and civilizational values of the Altaic peoples and organizing serial symposiums in this context.

In this regard, the languages of the Altaic Communities Symposium series organized by ASAC are Altaic, Russian and Western languages. In addition, a specific topic is determined in each symposium and the presented papers are published in English summary and the original presentation language.

After the first two local meetings of ASAC in Bishkek, the Third Altai Communities Symposium was held on 18–19 July 2011 in Istanbul under the name of The Migrations and Emergence of Nations of the Altay Communities. In the symposium, subjects such as the history and birth of the Altaic peoples, their migration, culture, language and literature were handled and discussed comparatively. The proceedings of this symposium, in which Altaist academics showed great interest, were published (Choi et al., 2014).

The Fourth Altai Communities Symposium was held on 11-12 June 2013 in Seoul, the capital of Korea, on the cultural and economic dimensions of the Silk Road. This symposium was followed by the Fifth Altai Communities Symposium held in Antalya on 20-22 July 2015. Religion and belief rituals, language and history issues were discussed in the symposium. Altaist academics also had the opportunity to see and observe the Antalya Yoruk (nomads) within the framework of the symposium program. The papers of this symposium were published in three books according to their subjects (Şahin et. al., 2017a, 2017b, 2017c).

Following these symposiums, the Sixth Altai Communities Symposium was held in Istanbul on 24-26 July 2017 with the participation of 230 scientists. The subject of this symposium was dwelling and dwelling culture, family and family values among Altaic peoples. Papers presented to the symposium were published under the title “House and House Culture and Family and Family Values”. The papers presented at this symposium were published in two volumes according to their subjects (Şahin et. al., 2019a, 2019b).

On the other hand, the Seventh the International Symposium on Traditions- Customs-Traditions and Laws of the Altai peoples was held in Ulaanbaatar, the capital of Mongolia, on 6-10 August 2018. Papers were given on the application areas of oral and written

[26] In this regard, see Namio Egami-Shin Sahara, *Kibaminzoku ha Rita? Konai?* / Did the cavalier nations come to Japan or not? (Japanese), Tokio 1996; Shigeki Matsuura, *Saitama no tsu to Sakitama Kofungun / Saitama harbor and Sakitama kurgans* (Japanese), Saitama 2011.
values such as customs and laws, their reflections on human and social life, their effects on individual-society and individual-state relations, their applications in family and society, and their role in maintaining social order. Proceedings of this symposium have been published (Şahin et. al., 2022a).

The Eighth International Altai Symposium was held on 19-23 August 2019 on animals and livestock, in Bishkek, the capital of Kyrgyzstan, and Cholpon-Ata under the auspices of the Kyrgyz Presidency. In the symposium, places related to livestock culture, types of food, folk veterinary medicine, folk calendar, oral folk literature, customs and traditions, folk training, craft (leather, wool, wood, metal, etc. processing), agriculture-livestock relationship, animal species, shepherd, stamp and stamp types, folk sports, hunting, protective ancestors (Kambar ata, Cholpon ata, Zengi baba etc.), trading and trading methods, markets were discussed.

The Ninth Altai Communities Symposium was held on September 27-30, 2021 in the historical city of Bursa, Turkey, on epics and epic culture among the Altai peoples. In the symposium, epics and genres of Altai peoples and communities; birth and formation processes of epics; customs, traditions and customs; identities from family to nation in epics; state and administration; heroes and hero typologies in epics; life, culture and economy; onomastics and toponyms in epics (names of people, animals and geographical objects); symbols and cults in epics; papers were given on various topics such as epics and interdisciplinary relations, and the papers presented to the symposium were published and presented to the scientific world (Şahin, et. al. 2022b).

The Tenth Altai Communities Symposium was held on 27-30 September 2022 in Tashkent, the capital of Uzbekistan, on food and nutrition culture among Altai peoples. In this context, in the symposium, the sources of food and nutrition culture among the Altai people and communities in the prehistoric and post-historical periods and the information in these sources; hunting period in the historical development of food and nutrition, natural plants, domestication and use of plants; terms related to food and nutrition and their etymology; food preparation, cooking, storage methods and development; food and nutritional drinks (such as kumiss, kefir, ayran, shoro, kymran); the tradition of orun (position) and şiş (meat share) at the tables of families, especially khans, khans and rulers; papers were presented on topics such as religion, belief and special days (such as birth, engagement, marriage, death and holy days), food and nutrition culture.

The Eleventh Altai Communities Symposium will be held in Almaty, Kazakhstan, on July 4-7, 2023 on the subject of place and water names in Altai peoples. At this symposium, which is a continuation of ones we have previously organized under the name "International Altay Communities Symposium", subjects related to place and water names (toponymy), which can provide information about history and ecology, serve as a reference and resource for social sciences, and ensure the melding of people with the environment and geography where they live, will be taken up.

In conclusion, it is possible to say the following: For the historical process, Altai is a place where nomadic peoples live and gain common culture and civilization values in many points, especially in language. These common values and concepts played an important role in their establishment of states and empires and shaping the history of Eurasia. In this context, the languages spoken by these peoples in the scientific literature are Altaic languages; The peoples of the country are also called the Altai peoples. Nomadism, which constitutes at least half of human history, has an important place in the lifestyle of these peoples. In this respect, it is of great importance to conduct research and studies on these peoples by living on the spot, including all branches of social sciences. It should be underlined that if these researches and studies are done, not only the Altai peoples, but also the history of humanity will be better understood, especially in terms of culture and civilization history, and in this context, political, social and economic relations will develop in a healthier manner.

**Bibliography**


NATIVE AMERICANS (NA-DENE) ARE A PART OF THE ALTAI CIVILIZATION

ABDRASUL İsakov

International Medical University, Kyrgyzstan

Abstract

Native Americans share many similarities with populations belonging to the Altai family. This report talks about the Native Americans being a part of the Altai civilization.

Keywords: Native Americans, Na-Dene, Altai Civilization.

During the last year and a half, we had the opportunity to visit the US states of Arizona, Illinois, Indiana, Ohio, Kentucky, Nevada, New York, New Mexico, and Utah as part of the scientific research project "Kyrgyz-Native American Commonalities". We went to reservations where Native Americans live and collected information from the local population. Here, we will try to prove in a few articles that the American Indians are a part of the Altai civilization.

Native Americans migrated from Asia to America

The idea that Native American tribes crossed from Siberia to North America through the Bering Strait was first written about by the Jesuit missionary Joseph de Acosta in 1589 (Jaffe, 1992: 20). In the following centuries, such opinions began to be expressed frequently (Васильев et al, 2011: 105). Some claim that the last migrations from Siberia to America were made by people of Altai origin in the Middle Ages (Stewart, 2000).

A. F. Nazarova notes that due to climatic changes, reindeer (caribou) and bison, which inhabited southern Siberia, moved from Siberia to the American continent, and people followed them to the new continent (2005: 136). According to one study, 48 of the 54 animals that live in the Americas are Asian (Ahmedov, 2021: 20). According to Olivia Vlahosun, the Athabaskan tribes were the last to settle in America from Asia (1973: 20).

Migration from Asia to America

Scientists like Mark A. Sicoli, and Gary Holton (2014: 1-8), Christophe Began, Pascal Bailly, Jacques Chiaroni, and Stephane Mazieres (2015: 9) hypothesized that people migrated from North America to Siberia after examining the linguistic characteristics of the Yenisei and Na-Dene language groups. The DNA of 3 people found in the archaeological excavations in Kamchatka proved that there were migrations between the two named continents (Price, 2023).
Altai is the common homeland of the Native Americans and peoples of Altai origin in Asia

In the past, the Siberian region was a place where humanity spread in various directions. V.G. Volkov stated that the first people belonging to haplogroup Q1a3 (ancestors of the Native Americans) may have reached South Siberia through the Pamir and Tien-Shan Mountain ranges (2013: 83).

A tooth of a man who lived 14,000 years ago was found during excavations in the Lake Baikal oasis. DNA analysis of the tooth confirmed that the man was of Native American, East Asian, and Eurasian ancestry (Price, 2020). Many genetic studies prove that some Native Americans lived in the Altai region in ancient times. In the genes of modern Native Americans included in the “ qpAdm outgroup list”, genetic features related to Altai hunter-gatherer communities have been confirmed (Wang et al, 2023: 3).

According to the research led by Theodore Schurr from the USA and Lyudmila Osipova from the Russian Federation, a similar Y chromosome was identified in the DNA of 500 people living in the present Altai region and 2500 people from the USA, Canada, and Mexico. Scientists have discovered a mutation in a paternal line that appeared 18,000 years ago in the Altai people. This genetic marker is also found in modern Native Americans. Professor Schurr, based on this study, said that the ancient homeland of Native Americans could be the Altai region (Dellamore, 2012). Other investigations have also been published that confirm that the populations of Siberia are cousins (Y chromosome) to the Native Americans (Dulik et al, 2012: 229).

Na-Dene

Another factor that connects Native Americans to Altai is the linguistic affinity of the populations living in the two regions. The Athapaskan (Athabaskan) language (Na-Dene) of the Native Americans is a language related to the Siberian Kets. Merritt Ruhlen compared and studied the main words (plants, animals, body parts, cultural heritage, etc.) belonging to the Enisey and Na-Dene language groups and determined that these words all have the same root. According to Ruhlen, tribes speaking the Enisey and Na-dene language groups lived together in Eurasia in ancient times (1998: 13994-13996).

Some elements confirming the Native Americans’ belonging to the Altai civilization

Legends: The legend of the Incas, "KAPAKTOKON" is 95 percent similar to the legend of Ergenekon of the Altai people (Türkkan, 2008: 99-100, 173). According to Navajo understanding, White Mountain (Sisnaj-n) is in the east; Blue Mountain (Tsótz-lh) is in the south; Yellow Mountain (Dokóöslit) is in the west, and the Black Mountain (Dpénśa) was created in the north. The Navajo land of "Dine bi Keyah" is surrounded by four mountain ranges that are the largest in the world. These holy places are called the four holy mountains. In the legend of Ergenekon, Turko-Mongol people spread out from the land surrounded by mountains on four sides and spread out into the world.

The Kachins have a legend that the bird god created the world from the mud he brought up from the bottom of the ocean. The myth that the world was created by mud from the bottom of the ocean is preserved in many Native American tribes (Каримуллин, 1995).

Calendar: Some Native Americans, like the Altai peoples, have animal mythology that discusses how the calendar should be and who is included in the years. In Native American mythology, unlike Turko-Mongolian mythology, animals also discuss what the seasons and months should be like. However, the mythology that discusses the nature of the months and seasons of the animals, the main characters of which are the bear and the mouse, exists among the Altai, Khakas, and Yakuts, as well as the Kazakhs (Васильев et al, 2011: 88-89).

Professor Türkkan proved that the Mayans, Toltecs, and Aztecs used a calendar with the names of 12 animals. Their calendar is depicted in a 24-ton stone carving kept at the Archeology Museum in Mexico City. Four of the animals shown in this calendar are also on the calendar of the Altai people. The other three consist of similar animals (2008: 109, 110, 165-169, 187-188).

Directions: The directions were important to the nomadic Turko-Mongols and Navajo people. Therefore, the Turko-Mongols and Navajos knew the directions well, regardless of the day and night and the bad weather and attached different meanings to the directions. Among the Native Americans, the east meant blue, the south yellow, the west white, and the north black (Arslan, 2007: 79). Directions and colors also had a symbolic meaning for the Altai people.
**Tamgas:** The oldest trouser tamgas found on the Turpan were also found on Native Americans in the United States (Powell, 2014; Yates, 2015). Mustafa Aksoy published articles on similarities in tamgas (2018).

**Mongoloid:** Some scientists say that Native Americans were proto-Mongoloid (American Indian, 1986: 7). Anthropologist W.W. Howells and other scientists expressed the opinion that the Native Americans may belong to an unspecified type of Mongoloid race (1959). Investigations have been published on whether the Native Americans belong to the Mongoloids of the three major races (Roychoudhury, 1978). Indeed, the native population of North America is like the Asian Mongoloids. Native Americans were mostly beardless, rarely having beards like Asians belonging to the Mongoloid race (Türkkan, 2008: 25).

**Mongolian spot:** Among Native Americans and Asian peoples, the blue mark, scientifically known as the "Mongolian spot", is common in newborns. According to the results of a study, 80 percent of Asian babies and 80-85 percent of Native American babies have Mongolian spots (Giger, 2016: 176).

**Yurt (Ger):** It should be noted that Native Americans mostly lived in conical houses. Adil Ahmedov says that the houses of the people of Siberia are similar to the houses of the Native Americans named "tipi", "vighvam", and "hogan", which proves that the origins of the Native Americans are in Altai (2021: 151). The doors of Navajo houses always face east. They believe that they receive the blessings of the Holy Spirit every morning from the east-facing door (Iverson, Denetdale, 2006: 16). The doors of the nomads in Eurasia, including the Khakas, faced the east (Byrgin, 1999: 591).

**Rainmaking:** Native Americans also had the art of making rain. Rainfall is not only used in times of drought. It can be said that even during the war, the medicine man used this advantage against their enemies. It is also a common belief among the Altai peoples to rainmaking or "yada tashy".

**Conclusion**

The shared information points out that the Native Americans belonging to the Na-Dene group are a part of the Altai civilization. New interdisciplinary studies are needed on this subject.

**References**


American Indian life. (1986). University of Nebraska Press.


Dellamore, Ch. (2012). Is This Russian landscape the birthplace of Native Americans? National Geographic. https://www.nationalgeographic.com/science/article/120203-native-americans-siberia-gen... (Date received: 06.02.2023).


Волков, В. Г. (2013). Древние миграции самодийцев и енисейцев в свете генетических данных. Томский журнал ЛИНГ и АНТР. 1(1), 83.


AN EVALUATION OF STUDIES ON MONGOLIAN HISTORY IN TÜRKİYE

Prof. Dr. KÜRŞAT Yıldırım
Istanbul University
Faculty of Letter, History Department
kursatyildirim@istanbul.edu.tr

Studies on Mongolian history in Türkiye started in the 19th century as a part of Turkish history studies with modern methods. Historical texts prior to this period were mainly case reports and sometimes narrative in style. These texts gave very little reference to the Mongols and mentioned them in so far as they were relevant to the history of the formation of the Turkish presence in Türkiye. On the other hand, in the Seljuk and Ottoman sources, there were mentions of the Mongols and Genghis Khan, albeit in a sentence. As interest in the general history of the Turks increased, the history of the Mongols began to be researched. Especially since the beginning of the 20th century, the Mongols and Genghis Khan were mostly considered Turks. With the influence of the idea of Turkish nationalism, articles were written giving information about Mongolian history. After the establishment of the Turkish Republic, the Mongols were also included in historical studies and ideas. Except for a few studies, studies that are the product of modern historiography and that analyze Mongolian history away from ideological concerns began to be seen mainly from the beginning of the 1940s. Until today, a significant accumulation has been achieved in studies on Mongolian history, especially in terms of Ilkhanid history in Türkiye.

During the Ottoman Empire, historical records were kept, and many works on history were written. However, it is very difficult to obtain compact information about the Mongols in these works. The understanding of history at that time was within the framework of classical Islamic history. These texts did not contain much information about the ancient history of the Turks and Mongols.

Firstly, early modern Turkish historians equated Turks and Mongols; they emphasized the unity of history and culture. According to them, Turks and Mongols are not separate races in terms of ethnography; Genghis Khan was a Turk who united all Turks. According to them, the empire of Genghis was the "Turkish-Mongol Empire". Genghis Khan is also mentioned among the founders of Turan in the first years of the Turkish Republic founded in 1923. At that time, great importance was given to the Mongols.

It can be said that a new era has begun in Mongolian studies in Türkiye since the early 1940s. It has entered a period in which research on Mongolian history is written in more scholarly ways, based on main sources, without considering ideological motives and avoiding romantic interpretations. Accordingly, the Mongol Empire, founded by Genghis Khan, was accepted unanimously as the most important turning point in Mongolian history. The Mongols established a great state based on the nomadic traditions of the Huns, Xianbei, Tabgach, Rouran (Juan–juan), Turks, and Uighurs.

Secondly, Genghis Khan and the Mongol Empire were among the first subjects of interest to modern Turkish historiography, which began in the 19th century. Early Turkish nationalists and romantic historians regarded the Mongols as one with the Turks, and Genghis as a Turkic khan. These views were voiced or contested on various occasions until the 1930s, but from the 1940s onward, there were very few researchers who persisted in relying on the main sources and modern historical methods.

Thirdly, many studies have been carried out in China and in the world on the Yuan Dynasty period that the Mongols established in China. Almost all the historical sources of this period, which is far from the field of view of Turkish historiography. Yuan went down to the southern coasts of China and sent darugas to rule these places. Therefore, the history of the Yuan Dynasty is the entire Chinese history of that period, and in order to understand this period, it is necessary to know the geography, society, culture and general
history of China well. In Turkey, however, there are a few experts on Chinese history. So, this time, knowing Chinese is not enough.

Fourthly, Mongolian studies in Türkiye were mostly conducted for the Ilkhanate period. This situation is not only due to the fact that the Ilkhanids were a part of Türkiye’s history; at the same time, learning Persian, the first main source language required for Ilkhanid studies, and the fact that Persian historical texts are easy to access, compared to languages such as Chinese, also play a role in this.

Fifthly, the Golden Horde State established by Cuci ulus. There were transformations with Berke who ascended to the throne in 1257. He became a Muslim, and in the time of Üzbec Khan, İslam became the official religion. This state, which became Turkish in time, was literally a Turko-Mongol state. From this point of view, Golden Horde studies have a great importance in terms of both Turkish and Mongolian history. Moreover, the relations between the Ottoman Empire and the Golden Horde and documents related to it are in question. There are many studies on this subject.

Sixthly, the Chagatai Khanate ruled mainly in the cities of Turkestan. The power of the Khanate was mainly in East Turkestan and Transoxiana. Chagatai Khan Tarmashirin (1326-1334) accepted Islam. It was very important in terms of urban culture and literature. There are a few studies on that period.

Seventhly, there are studies on the period after the collapse of the Yuan Dynasty in 1368. It was the direct successor of the Great Mongol Empire. It meant that the legacy of the great Mongol Empire was completely dissolved.

Golden Horde State, founded by the Cuci ulus, soon became Muslim and Turkish. The Islamized Ilkhanate State, founded by the Hulagu nation in Iran, ended in 1353 and the Chagatay nation, which became Islamized and Turkic, ended in 1370. After the disintegration of the Yuan, the period of small khanates began in the Turkestan area. Relatively small Mongolian khanates began to rule. After the Mongol Empire, the most powerful structure established by the Mongols was the Cungar Khanate. In Türkiye, mainly on Mongolian tribes and Cungars, research was done on the post-Yuan Mongols.

Studies giving information on the culture, religion, social life, etc. of the Mongols in Türkiye were mainly carried out in connection with those of the Turks. There are very few studies focusing directly and exclusively on Mongolian culture. There are hardly any cultural studies directly on the Mongols based on field studies.

Turkish historians have also mentioned the Mongols in their work on general Turkish history and in their various research. It is a fact that the history of the Turks is intertwined with the Mongols. For the Mongols, it is inevitable to meet the Turks in terms of both their homeland and national history. As information on Mongolian history in the works of Turkish historians got closer to Anatolia, it seems to have increased through the Mongol Empire, Ilkhanate, Golden Horde, Chagatai and Timur states.

References
APPLICATIONS OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE TO MONGOLIAN HIGHER EDUCATION SECTOR

TSOLMON Gombo1
NAMUUN Ulziibilegt2
YESUI Barjav2

Mongolia, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolian University of Science and Technology
School of Business Administration and Humanities
Department of Business Administration, Major in Marketing
1Senior Lecturer; 2 Senior undergraduate students
Email address: tsolmon07@must.edu.mn; unamuun096@gmail.com; barjavyesui@gmail.com

Abstract

In this study, experimental research was conducted in order to examine the applications of AI tools that suitable and interesting to use in teaching and learning activity. AI related two short videos were prepared in advance. 6.35 minutes video content, which interacted by virtual avatar created with AI video makers like D-Id and Synthesia was presented to the experimental group while the control group had another 7.00 minutes video recorded in Microsoft teams by a lecturer. Teaching faculty’s perception towards virtual avatar was also taken into account. During the online learning, lecturer’s facial expression and body language at the time is visible to all students. Lecturers were uncomfortable to teach in front of camera in a studio setup. Virtual avatars can be one possible solution to facilitate this situation. In order to evaluate the effects of the virtual avatar in teaching, student’s learning outcomes were measured using end-of-course assessment questions. In this experiment, total 176 students in the School of Business Administration and Humanities of MUST were participated. Microsoft Excel, SPSS22 was used for data analysis such as descriptive statistics, difference analysis and regression analysis. The result of paired sample t-test concluded that the appearance of a virtual avatar had improved student’s perception of course satisfaction by 11.4 percent than control group members.

Keywords: AI; Virtual avatar; D-id; Synthesia; AI powered personal assistant.

1. Applications of Artificial intelligence in Mongolia

According to the Vision 2050, following objective was formulated between 2041-2050. Enrich the content and curriculum of open education and introduce artificial intelligence-based technologies at all levels of education. (MV3Г, 2019). Two undergraduate programs titled “Artificial intelligence” and “Robots and artificial intelligence” were added by the School of Information and Communication Technology (SICT) of MUST in 2020. The table given below shows the number of students enrolled in these programs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Undergraduate programs</th>
<th>2020-2021</th>
<th>2021-2022</th>
<th>2022-2023</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Artificial intelligence</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robots and artificial intelligence</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SICT, MUST
Mongolian general education school students can now utilize the math learning digital platform “Eduten” of Finland, the world leader in educational success. As part of this cooperation, the intelligent system that accommodates 1.3 million teachers and students from more than 50 countries will be translated into Mongolian. The "Eduten" platform is an intelligent system with a library of more than 200,000 mathematical exercises and tasks developed on artificial intelligence and games to reduce teachers’ workload. The platform received UNESCO’s "ICT for Education" award for best practices in supporting education through artificial intelligence in 2020 and the "Outstanding Edtech" Award in 2022 (Buyanaa, 2022).

2. The result of experimental research

This study provides an insight on the faculty’s and student’s perception towards virtual avatar in educational video content. In this experiment, total 15 faculties of MUST and 176 students which make up about 17.7% of all undergraduate students in the SBaH of MUST were participated.

Although 80% of faculties watch video recordings of previous online classes just 13.3% is satisfied with their facial expression. 85.7% of faculties were uncomfortable to teach in front of camera in a studio setup. During the online class 86.7% of faculties give special importance for their appearance, but 60% deals with negative feelings of nervousness, embarrassment, self-doubt and self-criticism while 31% faces problems such as using empty words repeatedly, negative body language expression. Therefore, all faculties totally agree with the statement that using virtual avatar in online class will facilitate lecturer’s work making it more interactive and engaging.

Table 2. Number of students (2023.03.23)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Departments</th>
<th>Number of students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Department of Business Administration</td>
<td>638</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Technology Management</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Social Science</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Department of Humanities</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1007</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

At the beginning of the study, the participating students were divided into experimental and control groups on purpose. 6.35 minutes video content, which interacted by virtual avatar created with AI video makers like D-Id and Synthesia https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=56XBFKNIEPE (Namuun, 2023) was presented to the experimental group while the control group had another 7.00 minutes video recorded in Microsoft teams by a lecturer https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AyK5ID4CjJI (Tsolmon, 2023). In order to evaluate the effects of the virtual avatar in teaching, student’s learning outcomes were measured using end-of-course assessment questions. Synthesia is a synthetic media generation platform used to create AI generated video content.

Users create content via the platform’s pre-generated AI presenters or by creating digital representations of themselves, called artificial reality identities (ARI), using the platform’s AI generation tool. These avatars can be used to narrate videos generated from text. As of August 2021, Synthesia’s voice database included multiple gender options in over 60 languages. Synthesia is most often used by corporations for communication, orientation, and training videos. It has been used in advertising campaigns, reporting, product demonstrations, and to create chatbots. https://www.synthesia.io/ D-ID’s Generative AI enables users to transform any picture or video into extraordinary experiences. Their technology is used by creators, leading marketing agencies, production companies, and social media platforms around the world. They are on a mission to enable full video production, using just AI. Over 110 million videos have been created using their technology. https://www.d-id.com/

This study was conducted to compare student’s perception towards AI related two short videos. Generally, 83.3-98.2% of students had clear understanding and positive perception about the topic.
The perceptual gap was narrowest for the following aspects such as AI applications in daily life (0.6%) and fast-growing nature of the industry (0.7%), but the most striking perceptual gap was found in the importance of big data in artificial intelligence (18.8%) and scientist who coined the term AI (13.4%). The appearance of a virtual avatar had improved student’s perception of course satisfaction (M=3.91) by 11.4 percent than control group members (M=3.51).

Table 3. The result of paired sample t-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Student’s perception towards video content recorded in Microsoft teams by a lecturer (Control group)</th>
<th>Student’s perception towards virtual avatar in educational video content (Experiment group)</th>
<th>Perceptual gap (percentage)</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How are you interested in AI related short video?</td>
<td>3.51</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>11.40%</td>
<td>p=0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How confident are you to enjoy with virtual avatar based, paid contents?</td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td>4.70%</td>
<td>p=0.674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How engaging was the content?</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>10.20%</td>
<td>p=0.367</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p<0.05 **p<0.01 ***p<0.001

Since P=0.001<0.05, there is statistically significant difference between the treatment and control group. Generally, students gave above the average rating for all questions, not depending on which content they viewed.

In this experiment, total 176 students in the School of Business Administration and Humanities of MUST were participated; of which 58 belonged to the experimental and 118 belonged to the control groups respectively. Of these participants, the most of students (96.7%) were sophomores for the experimental group, while majority of students (54.9%) were juniors, followed by sophomores (26.5%) and seniors (15.9%) for the control group. In terms of the student’s major field of study, 85% belonged to the department of business administration.

Student’s perception of course satisfaction was assessed through questionnaire based on 5-point Likert scale. Descriptive statistics were used to analyze the responses. Using virtual avatar in educational video content provided the students with positive learning experience such as innovative (3.87), interesting (3.66), exciting (3.55), just like real person (3.27). But negative feelings such as sleepy (2.53), boring (2.23), annoying (2.09) were much lower. Moreover, this also plays significant role to enhance university image as pioneer, modern and innovative (4.13).

Table 4. The result of regression analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Collinearity Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>2.62</td>
<td>0.343</td>
<td>7.65</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual avatar interesting</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.078</td>
<td>0.514</td>
<td>6.05</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual avatar distracting</td>
<td>-0.21</td>
<td>0.077</td>
<td>-0.237</td>
<td>-2.79</td>
<td>0.006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R²=0.339; adj R²=0.325, F=23.59 (p<0.001), DV= How engaging was the content?

*p<0.05 **p<0.01 ***p<0.001

Since F=23.59, p<0.001 regression analysis was statistically significant. Using virtual avatar made the content more interesting and had a significant positive impact on student’s perception (β=0.514) however this might be difficult to capture a student’s attention and focus (β= -0.237).
Conclusion

In order to develop artificial intelligence tools, the potential of SICT and other affiliated schools of MUST should be fully utilized and the collaboration between industry (IT companies, business entities) and academia should be fostered.

AI tools can help faculties save time on performing the tasks associated with the lower-level domains of Bloom's taxonomy such as to construct and correct an exam and to track attendance. Thus, the faculty can spend more time on tasks which engage some of the "higher-order" domains. For educational institutions it is vitally important to equip classrooms with AI cameras and brainwave trackers and to explore effective strategies to avoid plagiarism and academic integrity violations.

This study provides an insight on the faculty's and student's perception towards virtual avatar in educational video content. In this experiment, total 15 faculties of MUST and 176 students which make up about 17.7% of all undergraduate students in the SBaH of MUST were participated. All faculties totally agree with the statement that using virtual avatar in online class will facilitate lecturer's work making it more interactive and engaging. Generally, 83.3-98.2% of students had clear understanding and positive perception about the topic. The appearance of a virtual avatar had improved student's perception of course satisfaction (M=3.91) by 11.4 percent than control group members (M=3.51). In future, more faculties should be encouraged to participate in the experimental study.

Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world. Nelson Mandela.

References


CAN PARTNERSHIP HELP ENGLISH TEACHERS TO IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF EFL CURRICULUM?

ENKHTSETSEG Terbish
English lecturer (Master of TESOL)
School of Foreign Languages, MUST
Email:t.enhe77@gmail.com

Abstract

Along with socio-economic changes, the government funding that granted to the universities has considerably reduced in Mongolia, so it is impossible for universities to respond to industrial needs and solve social challenges with their scarce resources. Therefore, it seems that a new partnership approach is needed. In this article, I want to identify what roles the teacher plays in tertiary education institution and whether they need to work collaboratively with different partners. Also, it will discuss why partnership is important at tertiary level English education. Finally, it will demonstrate what strategic partners are needed in our context.

Introduction

Nowadays, having the ability to communicate effectively in English both orally and in writing is regarded as one of the most important skills for job applicants regardless of their qualified fields. English is extremely needed to raise a qualified specialist these days. Indeed, English language skills have become one of the main abilities “of the person of the knowledge society” (Smokotin et al., 2014, p.512). In order to successfully enter the professional world, students need strong English communication skills. Therefore, it is vital for the university’s future development to be achieved high standards of English communication skills. However, the government funding that granted to the universities has considerably reduced along with socio-economic changes. The Mongolian universities have to conduct their activities with their limited scarce resources, but they need to prepare highly qualified specialists that can respond to industrial needs and address the social challenges. Clearly, only one sector does not have enough resources or capacity to appropriately solve any social challenges. This is beyond the capacity of a single teacher, so it seems that a new partnership approach is needed to develop a creative and practical learning environment. The universities need to address and collaborate with a variety of stakeholders in order support their needs.

Research materials and methods

This study consists of an analysis of two main types of data: 1) documents, reports and 2) two surveys (with relevant questionnaire). Based on these data, this study will discuss the current situation of tertiary organization, the challenges in our English curriculum, why the new leadership concept is important, whether this change can introduce innovation, creativity and entrepreneurship. It will also demonstrate what strategic partners we need in our context and whether it is possible to establish mutually beneficial partnership with academics, entrepreneurs and community partners.

Actually, documents were collected from general and academic sources. The collected documents included: policy documents related to Mongolian higher education since 1990s, websites of Mongolian University of Science and Technology (MUST) and international mining corporations operating in Mongolia, official reports by the Immigrant Agency of Mongolia, and previously published articles written in...
English. The findings revealed that there are many good opportunities to collaborate with different stakeholders in the Mongolian context. The surveys were developed based on the main objectives of this study. I asked English majoring students of MUST whether they want to join any social-oriented activities, conducted in English outside the class in order to practice their language skills and knowledge in real life. Also, I asked from English lecturers of MUST about the challenges in teaching English for Specific Purposes (ESP) courses for engineering students and attempted to analyze the main problem.

**Role of the teacher at tertiary level education**

Nowadays, the role of teachers has been changed significantly in comparison with the 20th century. In the past, the teacher had focused on transmitting the accurate knowledge to the students based on the teacher-centered learning. Providing academic knowledge was the priority, so this was the main business for the university lecturers. However, this attitude has been changed along with the socio-economic changes. The new century requires different learning environments and different learning skills. Also, it highlights context learning that focuses on real world examples, applications, and experiences (Partnership for 21st Century Skills, 2004). Therefore, we need to embrace these new trends.

In addition, employers want the workforce that can address their challenge these days. Thus, we need to prepare students differently for an uncertain future that requires solutions to problems that we do not know yet. Therefore, we need to form a practical and creative learning environment. From the other side, the costs of formal education have constantly increased, but the government funding has significantly decreased (Smith, 2012). As Kania and Kramer (2011) claim, any single organization’s capacity is not sufficient to finance an innovative solution. This is beyond the capacity of a single teacher, a single classroom or a single school. Nowadays, the most important objective of Mongolian University of Science and Technology (MUST), where I work is to reeducate high level specialists who can work at the international level. Therefore, MUST should develop effective English curriculum and improve the quality of English training. According to Eckel et al., (2008), any single organization is not able to accomplish it on its own. Thus, we should build effective teams and cooperate with different partners to support our needs in order to achieve this goal and keep our sustainability.

**Why is partnership important at tertiary level education? What strategic partners do we need in our context?**

Nowadays, the following skills are required in the workplace such as critical thinking, problem solving, innovation, collaboration, life and career, information and media in the new century (Partnership for 21st Century Skills, 2004). Therefore, in developed countries, a number of colleges and universities pay particular attention for the impact of educational practice. They integrate theory and practice for community engagement to create appropriate curricula (Kane et al., 2013). In the current situation, colleges and universities are expected to address social needs and add professional programs, but they do not have sufficient resources to respond to the social challenges. Institutions of higher education are limited to generate additional funding and efforts (Eckel, 2003). However, one of the promising vehicles of developing new capacities is the establishment of strategic partnerships between institutions of higher education (Eckel & Hartley, 2008). Partnership can bring many opportunities at tertiary level education, so effective partnerships can open new gates to the market. Alliances can increase our capacity, improve the quality of knowledge delivering by sharing facilities and capacities as well as invest in new innovations and technology together. Also, they can ease the development of new ideas and service. For partners, it is possible to learn from one another. It is much more Advantageous instead of buying expensive knowledge and service in the marketplace (Gulati & Singh, 1998, Hagadoorn, 1993). Therefore, strategic partnership can be a very important point to develop new capacities and improve the curriculum focusing on innovation and creativity.

Another important issue to take into account is how to choose appropriate partners that will collaborate sustainably. What strategic partners do we need to achieve our goal and keep our sustainable development? In any collaboration, business partnership (whether nonprofit or profit) do not succeed by chance (Jamali & Keshishian, 2008). Forming partnership can be a very complicated process, in particular, when parties have different
strategic orientations. Therefore, decision makers should consider carefully which issues are more important when choosing a partner. (Makower, 1994). Sagawa and Segal (2000), and Austin (2000) have clearly identified this issue. According to their perspectives, we should take the following issues into account when choosing suitable partners: a consideration of suitable partner, mission connection, alignment of values, a clear assignment of management responsibility also relevant competence areas, resource dependency, transparency, constructive communication and so on. As Eckel & Hartley (2008) consider, it is better to choose familiar partners who have common ambitions and objectives. It is easier for institutions to establish complex of shared values and to reconcile any disruptive differences. Therefore, strategic partnerships encourage appropriate results for all involved parties such as entrepreneurs, NGOs, and particularly the society and community (UNDP National Research Report, 2003).

Nowadays students need strong English communication skills in order to successfully enter the professional world. Due to this requirement, they want authentic language samples in use. Thus, it is important to give students the opportunity to make use of their language skills and to communicate satisfactorily in real life. According to Eckel & Hartley (2008), the curriculum and instruction can be the most important issue for any academic institutions. Therefore, we should create a practical and creative learning environment for English learners by improving the curriculum. In order to achieve this goal, we should collaborate with different stakeholders such as local community, entrepreneurs and academic enterprises.

Community partnership

In Mongolia students tend to experience a lack of native speaker models due to the fact that there is no real environment to practice their English in a variety of activities beyond the classroom. In addition, the geographical isolation from English speaking countries influences significantly. However, “foreign language learners” want to feel and experience about the culture, social aspects and other events and articulate their feeling about it through the target language (Nunan, 2012). Thus, we should choose and cooperate with local communities that most of their activities are conducted in English. In this case, we should cooperate with international humanitarian organizations as they organize a number of activities for the social welfare and community development in Mongolia, so they can be another important partner. According to the Immigration Agency of Mongolia, there are more than seventy international non-profit (NG) organizations officially operating in Mongolia. Therefore, working with local NG communities especially Christian community may bring many advantages for our students. According to the survey among English majors, it is clearly seen that students have a great desire to get involved in community service but they do not know well about these organizations and they are hesitant whether it is possible to join and how to cooperate with these organizations. Thus, English teachers should encourage and support students to engage in community development project and make their own contribution to their social oriented-activities. In addition, they will experience natural casual conversation by communicating with English native speakers and improve their listening and speaking skills. This collaborative learning can give more opportunities for students to broaden their horizon and make them understand the world around them. Also collaborating with the local community can create a new learning experience and inner motivation for English learners (Korobanicova et al., 2015).

Entrepreneur partnership

Moreover, business role can be also important to improve the quality of English training. In fact, business engagement may be very important to create a practical learning environment for English learners. Certainly, their role is not teaching for students, but establishment of sustainable partnership with business organizations is also very essential to keep sustainable development and achieve more success. Nowaddays, entrepreneurs want the workforce that can respond to their industrial needs. Their engagement can be helpful for students to obtain the relevant knowledge and skills that are needed for their future career (Smith, 2012). Thus, the partnership with business fields can bring many advantages to the university. According to Sigurdardóttir (2010), this collaboration will integrate a gap between theory and practice. Indeed, MUST is one of the biggest public technological universities in Mongolia that offers the degree programs in the IT, civil engineering, construction, geology, mining, car mechanics, electricity and power engineering fields. Also, these
fields are very popular career choices in the job market. In our country, international big corporations, for example, Rio Tinto, Turquoise Hill Resources Ltd, Erdenes resources Ltd (Canadian companies) have run their business in geology and mining fields due to the discovery of big mineral resources like copper, gold and coal. Therefore, geology and mining companies conduct their everyday activities in English. Therefore, it sounds that these fields might be a suitable place to practice communicative English skills. Unfortunately, their operation sites are located four or five hundred kilometers away from the university campus. Probably, this is not a big problem to collaborate with these big corporations in engineering and technological fields, but for language practice, it does not sound a good place.

**Partnership with academic enterprises**

As a technological university, MUST aims to prepare highly qualified engineering specialists with good English skills that can respond to the current economic needs and meet employers’ demands. Thus, English programs can be special at MUST in comparison with other universities. English teachers need to teach professional ESP courses in the specific engineering field. However, teaching staff is very debatable. According to the survey, almost all English teachers do not have the background of the specific engineering field. This makes them feel unconfident as the position of career guidance counselors (IET, 2008). As Arya and Salk (2006) claim, cross-sector partnership could be the best way of managing this uncertainty. Further to this, Ljunggren also (2009) claims that quality enhances when all institutions of higher education collaborate with the surrounding society. Lemon & Willer (2015) also point out that strong relationships of partnership in research and development can be found within the university. Therefore, it seems that we need to collaborate with the relevant engineering departments at MUST to develop and implement the professional ESP curriculum effectively. Also, all participants in the survey support to collaborate with the engineering lecturers in teaching ESP courses, so sharing knowledge and experiences with each other may bring creative and practical outcomes. This can increase our competiveness and expand the enrollment of the university as well. This also may suit students’ need.

**Discussion**

Actually, this study has attempted to explore why partnership is important in higher education organizations, what appropriate strategies are needed to build effective partnership at the institutional levels with different stakeholders. However, more in-depth research is clearly needed in order to gain greater insights into how the effective partnership should be established at the institutional level. Due to some limitations in this study, a more in-depth study including interviews with the faculty members, NGOs and company directors should be conducted to have a more complete view.

**Conclusion**

All in all, knowledge of English has become extremely important for communicating with and understanding the outside world. The growth of English has left a deep impact on all aspects of the society for last two decades since English was introduced into all levels of the education systems of Mongolia. In order to keep pace with these social and economic changes, the education systems have been renovated, also the role of teachers has changed a lot compared to the last century. However, the reforms have not completely fulfilled yet. It seems that there are still some problems in English education development. Students tend to lack of a creative and practical learning environment. Therefore, it is vital to introduce a new concept focusing on innovation, creativity and entrepreneurship in the curriculum. In order to achieve these goals, we need to address diverse stakeholders. We need to develop effective curriculum that suits our specific purposes, cooperate with different stakeholders to support our needs and create effective partnership strategies.

**Literature**


Smith, A. (2012). Learning is everyone’s business: Educational partnerships between schools, philanthropic, business and third sector organizations. East Melbourne, Victoria: Centre for Strategic Education.


RESEARCH ON ACCESSIBLE INFRASTRUCTURE FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES: A CASE STUDY OF MONGOLIA

MARLAA Baigalmaa1, MANDUKHAI Bataa1, DULGUUN Norjinbat2
1 Secondary School No.11, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia {marlaashka09@gmail.com, l1anduha1@gmail.com}
2 Dalhousie University, Halifax, Canada {d.norjinbat@gmail.com}

Abstract

This study investigates the current situation and possible solution to enhance accessibility for people with disabilities in Mongolia. Through the analysis of public data and interviews with individuals with and without disabilities, our study reveals significant challenges in achieving equality, primarily stemming from societal perceptions and inadequate infrastructure. However, we identify potential avenues for policy improvements that can lead to greater equity for individuals with disabilities, aligning with the United Nations’ Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs).

Keywords: sustainability; children with disabilities; educational infrastructure; accessibility.

Introduction

In today’s interconnected world, global efforts are being made to address critical issues such as poverty, hunger, and climate change. The United Nations has established seventeen SDGs to be achieved by 2030, uniting nations in their commitment to ensure health, justice, and prosperity for all. Our research focuses on SDGs 10 and 11, examining the marginalization of people with disabilities due to the lack of inclusive policies and accessible infrastructure, leading to inequalities in Mongolia. Specifically, we explore the challenges faced by individuals with disabilities in education and employment, which serve as indicators of progress towards SDGs 10 and 11 [1].

Children with disabilities often encounter difficulties in accessing education compared to their non-disabled peers. Our study reveals that a lower percentage of enrolled students with disabilities complete college within a given timeframe compared to non-disabled students. One potential solution to this issue is the implementation of a separate school system that provides a more flexible curriculum tailored to the specific needs and learning pace of students with disabilities. Moreover, we conducted interviews with non-disabled children to understand their perceptions and attitudes towards including students with disabilities in their classrooms.

Methodology and results

Education plays a vital role in promoting equality and empowering individuals with disabilities. However, children with disabilities face difficulties in accessing quality education compared to their abled peers. Research indicates lower completion rates among students with disabilities, highlighting the need for specialized educational approaches and longer time frames to accommodate their diverse learning needs[1]. The implementation of a separate school system tailored to the requirements of disabled students has the potential to provide a more accessible learning environment, leading to greater equality[2]. In this study, we focused to identify societal perception towards children with disabilities by conducting interview with non-disabled students. We also interviewed parents with children with special needs.

Social perception of non-disabled peers

To assess the potential impact of integrating disabled students into mainstream classrooms, we interviewed non-disabled students from various public schools. Our interview included five very important and yet delicate questions as below:

Q1. How would you interact with students with auditory impairment?
A1. Would like to learn sign language/ or learning it.
A2. Would try to communicate in other means.
A3. Would not communicate.

Q2. Would you befriend a person with intellectual impairment?

Q3. Would you befriend a person with visual impairment?

Q4. Would you support parasport events for impaired person?

Q5. Would you welcome a classmate with impairment and help them on their day-to-day obstacles within the school environment?

The findings related to above five questions are shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1. Results of a questionnaire survey which was conducted on non-disabled students

Our interviews with non-disabled children indicate a generally positive willingness to assist their peers with visual disabilities. However, there still exists a stigma surrounding disabilities, particularly visual impairments, which can contribute to negative stereotypes and emotional biases. Additionally, a UNICEF report suggests that parents sometimes shield their children with disabilities from the wider society, exacerbating their challenges. It is crucial to address these negative perceptions and promote greater societal acceptance and support for children with disabilities.

Expectation of employment opportunities for students with disabilities

Employment remains a significant obstacle for people with disabilities, with a lower employment rate compared to the general population. In Mongolia, as in other countries, individuals with disabilities often face limited job opportunities and are more likely to work part-time. To improve accessibility, we might need measures such as reducing the retirement age for individuals with disabilities who have experienced challenges since a young age [3].

In this study, we did interview with disabled students about their employment opportunities when they become adults and what should the society to do to enhance accessibility and promote equity in employment. A questionnaire survey was conducted on teenage children with disabilities. Its result is shown in the Table 1.

Table 1. A questionnaire survey was conducted on children with special needs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Student 1</th>
<th>Student 2</th>
<th>Student 3</th>
<th>Student 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>School</strong></td>
<td>Special</td>
<td>Special</td>
<td>Special</td>
<td>Normal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age/ Grade</strong></td>
<td>14 years old 10th Grade</td>
<td>15 years old 10th Grade</td>
<td>20 years old 10th Grade</td>
<td>15 years old 10th Grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Daily problems</strong></td>
<td>During winter, the braille tracks are difficult because it because slippery.</td>
<td>Injuries are often caused by poor lighting.</td>
<td>Braille books are in shortage. Although there are traffic lights, it is very difficult to get through the exit.</td>
<td>Teachers do not give adequate attention and support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Future occupation</strong></td>
<td>IT engineer</td>
<td>Actress and music teacher</td>
<td>Public speaker</td>
<td>IT engineer, work in studio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Leisure activities</strong></td>
<td>Read adventure stories online</td>
<td>Stays at home</td>
<td>Judo, marathon, writing poetry</td>
<td>Admiring and creating music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What would you like to change?</strong></td>
<td>Stop seeing blind people as sad people</td>
<td>Increase lighting and reduce the amount of school assignments</td>
<td>Attitude of drivers and braille road material</td>
<td>More interactive lesson</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The analysis of questionnaire responses highlights a significant interest among visually impaired students in the technology field. Our study suggests emphasizing coding and programming lessons in their school curriculum to enhance their skills and future employability. Promoting businesses owned by individuals with disabilities can contribute to greater equality and employment opportunities according to the interview results upon parents group [3].

Needs of accessible infrastructure

Accessible infrastructure plays a crucial role in enhancing the quality of life for individuals with disabilities. Our interviews with visually impaired children revealed challenges such as slippery street braille during winter, obstructions in pathways, and the lack of auditory cues at pedestrian crossings. Similarly, individuals with intellectual impairments face difficulties due to non-standardized signs and ambiguous wordings. Mongolia need to implement the standardization of infrastructure signage to improve accessibility and minimize confusion [4].

Conclusion

To conclude, Mongolia faces significant challenges in achieving SDGs 10 and 11 for people with disabilities by 2030. Our study demonstrates the need for separated school systems yet, awareness campaigns, and employment-related policies to enhance accessibility and inclusivity. While progress has been made in certain areas, stigmas against intellectual impairments and existing inaccessible infrastructure remain hurdles to overcome. Through concentrated efforts and collective action, Mongolia can work towards achieving greater equality, prosperity, and justice for individuals with disabilities.

Acknowledgments

We are grateful to all of those with whom we have had the pleasure to work during this project. Members of Down syndrome committee, Members of Parents group of children with hearing disabilities; Members of Non governmental organization for children with visual disabilities have provided us extensive guidance and taught us a great deal about this study. We also appreciate our mentors from Mitchell Foundation in Mongolia.

References

STUDYING WATER USAGE PATTERN FOR RESIDENTS IN ULAANBAATAR, MONGOLIA

A. Misheel¹, B. Binderya², S. Temulun³, A. Emujin¹, B. Erdenechuluun⁴

¹Russian Embassy School, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
²Shine Erin International Laboratory School, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
³Hobby Secondary School, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
⁴Mitchell Foundation for Arts and Sciences, Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia

Abstract

The UN Sustainable Development Goals were approved in 2015. There are 17 goals covering all aspects of sustainability. The Goal number 6 is on Clean Water and Sanitation and Goal number 13 is on Climate Action. The capital city Ulaanbaatar is home of 1.5 million residents, nearly half of the population of Mongolia. We studied water usage of apartments 124 residents of Ulaanbaatar. More than 60 percent of people in Ulaanbaatar live in the ger district where they collect drinking water every day. This study aims to help solve the soil degradation and provide a way to improve grey water resource supply in the ger district.

Keywords: water usage; waste water; water filter; ger district.

Motivation and background

In Ulaanbaatar, approximately 500 thousand people in apartments and modern houses and one million people live ger district. Those who live in ger district are often under a constant water shortage. There is no clean or waste water infrastructure, no running toilets, no modern shower or bathroom facilities in vast majority of ger district households. The water they collect from the wells are used for drinking, cooking, and basic cleaning. Usually, children and women go fetch water from the wells. According to the survey [1], a person living in a ger area consumes an average of 10 liters of water per day. Yet, these families live on the majority of land in UB. The used water is dumped into the toilets filling them up so the families must dig more waste holes. The alternative is the waste water is dumped into the streets making thick ice surfaces all winter long. In the spring, these heavily polluted streets pose public health hazard not only to those who live in the neighborhood, but entire city through the soil pollution and dust storms. We conducted the detailed study of water usage pattern in three ger district families. Also, we interviewed 126 families living in modern apartments and houses to investigate areas of water usage inefficiency. This study aims compare water usage pattern of people living in apartments and in ger districts. It also aims to help solve the soil degradation and provide a way to improve grey water resource supply in the ger district. In order to study that, we tested simple water filters and compared results of waste water and filtered water. Our conclusion is that by filtering waste water in ger district, families are able use the filtered water for gardening and tree watering, thus have a micro scale grey water management.

Questionary from families living in apartments and modern housing

We developed the survey questionary in order to understand the water usage of households living in apartments and modern houses. The survey included 22 questions such as number of people in the household, number of children under 16, area of the apartment unit in square meters, average monthly income, average water bill, average monthly usage of water in cubic meters, whether they have water meter, number of bathrooms, number of toilets, bathtub and showers, whether they use water filter, and spending for bottled water, and how many loads of laundry the family does per week, whether they have fish and how...
often water tank is changed, and estimate of water usage for different purposes. The questionnaire also included the respondents’ behaviours-related questions such as whether they turn off faucet while brushing their teeth, shaving, preference to shower over bathtub etc. Results from the survey are shown in Table 1.

Table 1: Questionary and responses by apartment residents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>District and khoroo</td>
<td>BZD, CHD, SBD, HUD, BGD, USA (CHICAGO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family size</td>
<td>about 1 to 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>about 1 to 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total area of the apartment m²</td>
<td>about 18 to 220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average monthly household income</td>
<td>about 550'000 to 20'000'000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average monthly water bill</td>
<td>about 5000 to 4'500'011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average monthly water consumption m³</td>
<td>about 2 to 350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How many water meters they have</td>
<td>51.1%-2; 20%-1; 13.3%-4; 3.3%-3; 12.3%-0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of toilets</td>
<td>61.1%-1; 33.3%-2; 4.4%-3; 1.1%-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of toilet seats</td>
<td>63.3%-1; 28.9%-2; 5.6%-3; 1.1%-4; 1.1%-0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of faucets</td>
<td>47.8%-3; 34.4%-2; 11.1%-4; 2.2%-6; 2.2%-1; 2.2%-0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of showers and baths</td>
<td>68.9%-1; 25.6%-2; 4.4%-3; 1.1%-0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they have a water-efficient fixtures</td>
<td>88.9%- YES; 11.1%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they have a dishwasher</td>
<td>75.6%- YES; 24.4%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they have a washing machine</td>
<td>98.9%- YES; 1.1%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How many times a week do they wash their clothes</td>
<td>40%- 1-2; 38.9%- 3-4; 14.4%- 5-6; 3.3%- 7-8; 3.3%- EVERYDAY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they have a fish as a pet</td>
<td>94.4%- NO; 5.6%- YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How many liters do they have in their aquarium</td>
<td>25%- 200; 25%- 250; 25%- 14; 25%- 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How many times a month do they change the water</td>
<td>53.6%- 1; 26.6%- 2; 20%- 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they turn off the water when they brush their teeth</td>
<td>92.2%- YES; 7.8%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they service their residential plumbing</td>
<td>53.3%- YES; 46.7%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are there any leaking faucets or lines. Water dripping, faucet not closing completely, etc.</td>
<td>98.9%- NO; 5.6%- YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Would you rather take a shower instead of taking bath because it uses less water in the shower</td>
<td>79.8%- YES; 20.2%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free Question: How do they save water? Their opinion on water conservation</td>
<td>use water responsibly and recycle it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do people agree that it is up to everyone to keep the world’s water clean</td>
<td>97.7%- YES; 2.3%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which of the ger districts and apartments uses more water</td>
<td>97.8%- APARTMENTS; 2.2%- GER DISTRICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do people agree that the price of clean water is too cheap in Mongolia? (1 liter of water costs 1 MNT 82)</td>
<td>79.3%- YES; 20.7%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are you satisfied with the quality of drinking water</td>
<td>66.3%- NO; 33.7%- YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they have a water filter (If so, how much does it cost to change the filter on average per month)</td>
<td>64%- YES (15'000-300'000); 36%- NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do they buy bottled water (If so, how much do you spend on average per month)</td>
<td>78.4%- NO; 21.6%- YES (5000-100'000)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to the Water Authority of Mongolia, the average usage per person for apartment residents decreased from 350 liters per day in 2000 to 140 liters per day in 2020. The average spending for water is 45500 tugrik for apartment residents. 67 percent of respondents indicated that they use water filtration system in their homes.

**Questionary from families living in ger district**

We developed the survey questionnaire in order to understand the social and economic situations of water usage in the ger area. Each student partnered with a family from the ger district in the study and grey water experiment.
Table 2. Questionary and responses by ger district residents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Family A</th>
<th>Family B</th>
<th>Family C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>District and khoroo</td>
<td>SKhD</td>
<td>ChD</td>
<td>BZD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family size</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekly frequency to fetch water</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total amount of water from well weekly (liters)</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who goes to water?</td>
<td>adult</td>
<td>adult</td>
<td>children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Means of water transportation</td>
<td>car</td>
<td>Wheel barrow</td>
<td>Wheel barrow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water container type</td>
<td>plastic</td>
<td>plastic</td>
<td>plastic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The total amount of money spent on water per month</td>
<td>1600 mnt</td>
<td>1920 mnt</td>
<td>1800 mnt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance to well by meter</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total time to fetch water by minutes</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any injuries while fetching water</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily water consumption per person by liter</td>
<td>10-15</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>10-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily wastewater amount</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where do you dispose the wastewater?</td>
<td>Sewage pit</td>
<td>Sewage pit</td>
<td>Pit latrine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you grow any vegetables and trees in your yard?</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>20 birch trees</td>
<td>Currant bushes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*while carrying the water from the well to home, a car hit one of the children (14 years old) then drove away. There was no camera in the area, they never found the perpetrator.

According to our survey of households, an average person consumes 8 liters of water per day and generates 3 liters of wastewater. Comparing to apartment occupants who are using 140 liters of water per day, the ger district occupants using only 8 liters per day. Which is 17.5 times less than apartment occupants daily water usage. In addition, households spend an average of MNT 1,800 per month on drinking and potable water. A person living in a ger area uses 240 liters of water per month and spends about 300 MNT on water.

**Easy water filter experiment**

We tested a simple water filter using the following commonly available materials.

- Plastic soda or juice bottle
- Gravel or small stones
- Clean Sand
- Activated Charcoal or tree bark
- Cloth or coffee filter
- Water sample

Inspired by the use of wood parts in some wastewater treatment studies [2], we also used wood bark as a filter component.

**Availability and production**

The above filter components are available in the market and could be found easily except the activated charcoal which was sourced from the Mongolian Institute of Chemistry in this experiment and we are grateful for their support of our project.

**Instruction**

Cut off the bottom of a plastic water bottle and it upside down into the bucket. Place cloth, or a coffee filter 3 centimeters inside the bottle as the first layer. Add 2.5 cm of activated charcoal or tree bark as the second layer on top of the cotton layer. Over the charcoal, add about 4-5 cm of gravel or small stones as the third layer. Add about 6-8 cm of clean sand on top of the gravel. Add gravel to the bottle as the final layer. Testing of the water filter can take anywhere from an hour to several hours depending on how fast the water drips.

The experiments and measurements were performed independently by each student and host family. Wastewater from host families in ger areas was used as a sample for the experiment. The physical and chemical parameters of wastewater and filtered water were measured using a kit used by Industrial Test Systems LLC to determine water quality.

**Results**

We used test apparatus [3] to determine a total of 10 physical and chemical parameters in the wastewater and filtered water samples. The measurement results
are shown in Table 3. To the naked eye, the highly polluted, foamy, white water becomes clear and yellowish after filtering.

The measurements compared the well water sample with the drinking water standard [4]. Our experiments confirmed that the well water in the ger areas meets the drinking water standard. Our experiments also showed that the levels of hydrogen sulfide, pH, heavy metals and free chlorine level in filtered water decreased. We concluded that the increase in the total hardness was due to the impurity of the sand and gravel, which are components of the filter.

Table 3. Physics and chemical characteristics of the waste and filtered water

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Waste water</th>
<th>After filtration</th>
<th>Waste water</th>
<th>After filtration</th>
<th>Waste water</th>
<th>After filtration</th>
<th>Well water</th>
<th>Drinking water Standard</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>H2S</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Total Chlorine level</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>0.015</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Nitrat</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Nitrit</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Total hardness</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>pH</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.5-8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Free Chlorine</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.2-0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Metal</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Iron</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Manganese</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conclusion**

Because of increased use of water saving technology, water efficiency has been increasing. However, the per person limit is still too high for apartment residents yet residents in ger district is still under constant water shortage. 70 percent of respondents indicated they are not satisfied with water quality. We interviewed the Water Authority and found that the water quality at the source is excellent. Yet, majority of apartment residents are dissatisfied with water quality which could be indication that the water piping system may need repair and improvement. More work needs to be done to educate people in apartments to learn to save water and demand from construction companies to have better water saving facilities. Our study also suggests that grey water from ger area can be filtered using a simple filter, reused for laundry, and water plants and trees in the backyard. Such a micro water recycling will help people in ger district have better soil conditions, less soil and air pollution due to waste water contamination on soil surface. Minimizing waste water will have added benefit of having more trees, in line with national initiatives such as a “Billion Tree Initiative.”

**References**

1. Overview of Mongolia’s water resources system and management, A country water security assessment, Asian Development bank, 2020, p.69
3. www.sensafe.com Industrial Test Systems LLC’s website

MNS 0900: 2018 Water standards for drinking and household use at each stage of the water supply network from centralized and decentralized water supply sources (water extraction, storage, quality improvement, distribution, transportation, storage) to water users and consumers
DECONSTRUCTING WATER SCARCITY IN WATER-RICH HIMALAYAN REGION: A CASE STUDY OF SIKKIM, INDIA

VILINA Engheepi

Abstract

Sikkim falls under the Eastern Himalayan Region (EHR) and in spite of being seated in a volumetrically water-rich region with torrential rainfall and abundant water sources, the people living in this mountain state face acute water scarcity not only during the dry season but also during monsoons. While difficult terrain makes engineering facilities for better access to water difficult, the focus on this physical aspect has overshadowed other major shortcomings in the provision of providing water. Contrary to the belief of these mountainous regions which boast of ‘water towers’ do not face water scarcity or if it does, it is only because of biophysical reason, the paper argues and entails to understand the cause of the existing paradox of “too much, too little” water. Such a complex water system in the hills has been a problem with no or little solution for decades as it has to be looked upon from regional-based solutions in order to have secure water distribution systems.

Water scarcity in mountain regions such as the Himalayas has been studied with a pre-existing notion of scarcity justified by decades of communities’ suffering from physical water shortages combined with difficulties of access. The Eastern Himalayan Region (EHR) of India receives significantly high amounts of annual precipitation. Studies have nonetheless shown that this region faces a strange dissonance: an acute water scarcity in a supposedly ‘water-rich’ region. The main objective of this paper is to decipher various drivers of water scarcity by locating the contemporary history of water institutions within the development trajectory of Gangtok, Sikkim particularly focusing on Gangtok Municipal Corporation wards. A key feature of the region’s urban water governance that defines the water scarcity narrative is the multiplicity of water institutions and the intertwining of formal and informal institutions at various scales. These factors affect the availability and basic access to domestic water by communities in various ways resulting in the creation of a preferred water bundle consisting of informal water markets over and above traditional sourcing from springs and the formal water supply from the formal system.

Introduction

Most water scarcity studies typically provide a very narrow view of the contextual reality, describing them as physical water shortages, perhaps distinguishing them as either physical, economic or institutional scarcity (Falkenmark & Lundqvist, 1998; Seckler et al., 1999; Government of West Bengal, 2012; Hoekstra & Mekonnen, 2012; Molden et al., 2014; Vaidya, 2015). Locally, scarcity almost always manifests through a combination of all three typologies both spatially and temporally, and is also differentiated based on social class and geographic location (Bandyopadhyay & Gyawali, 1994; Ohlsson & Turton, 1998; Anand, 2001, 2004, 2011; Wolfe & Brooks, 2003; Mehta, 2006; Mehta et al., 2011; Srinivasan et al., 2013; Badiger et al., 2014). Concerns related to domestic water scarcity often overlook social-institutional drivers which influence access. Translation of physical water availability and accessibility for communities depends on the current state, scale, and ability of the water infrastructure to overcome seasonal changes and reduce the burden of water collection. This process requires a detailed understanding of the functioning and organisation of multiple water institutions (Agrawal & Yadama, 1997; Anand, 2001, 2004; Badiger et al., 2014).

Institutions are rules, norms, and practices which govern decision-making in a society (Kiparsky et al., 2013). Formal institutions are associated with the State and are present at central, provincial, regional and local levels. Informal institutions are based on social networks which emerge from the need for social safety nets triggered by the absence of State-driven initiatives (Lebel et al., 2005; Hillmann, 2013). The intertwining or hybridization of these institutions can be observed here in the way formal (in this case, Water Security & Public Health Engineering Department or PHED) and informal (samaj – self-help group, described below –
and private water suppliers) work in cognizance of each other’s abilities to monopolise, dominate or complement. This intertwining and overlapping are also evident in the way households are able to create their own ‘water bundles’ using a combination of water sources that they can access or afford and prefer. We use the term ‘water bundle’ in a similar context to the ‘optimal consumption bundle’ (Brunnermeier, 2004) of goods in microeconomics – where a consumer (a household in our case) is able to meet the net requirement of their goods (here, the total domestic water requirement) needs through a particular combination of different goods (various water sources); where each of them has a known rule of preference over the other and has a differential cost (monetary or non-monetary) associated with acquiring them.

A different story of “too much, too little water” in the mountain region

Mountains are often referred to as natural ‘water towers’ for humanity, highlighting their importance as a prominent water source for the arid and semi-arid lowlands but with little reference to water security in the mountains themselves. The Himalayas in the Indian context are perceived as an inexhaustible freshwater source but only a small fraction of the streamflow is stored and consumed by the communities living in these mountains. Water scarcity in these mountains is largely influenced by the unique local hydrogeology, climate and social characteristics. Harnessing and storing water in large quantities is also impossible in this seismically active mountain range. Hence, springs have historically been an important primary source of water for a significant proportion of the population, both for rural and urbanising communities (Khawas, 2002; Sharma et al, 2010; Boer et al., 2011; Mahamuni & Kulkarni, 2012; Tambe et al., 2012; Tiwari & Joshi, 2012; Mukherjee, 2013; Agarwal et al., 2015; Ghatani, 2015; Basumajumdar, 2016; Drew & Rai, 2016). Urban political ecological studies and their focus on water. Water is provided as the starting point for discussions within Urban Political Ecology (Heynen, 2014). "Environmental crisis unfolds in relation to historical and spatial patterns of inequality that, in the context of increasing urbanisation, are manifest within the city" - spatial differentiation in urban areas (Broto et al 2012). First, it advances research of urban political ecology in terms of the manifestation of water scarcity (Mehta, 2010; Millington 2018) from the macro to the micro level. Additionally, looking at the manifestation driven by the interactions between the state and the private water markets along with the socio-economic and political aspects that lead to disproportionate burden (Birkenholtz, 2010; True love 2019). Second, it deconstructs the notion of how water availability is conventionally associated with physical shortage rather than a product of underlying socio-institutional drivers. This perspective creates an image of water abundance in the mountains which is contrary to the water insecurity faced by the mountain communities (Joshi 2018). Third, it is one of the first comprehensive comparisons of two similar study areas in the EHR, while providing baseline household water (in)security data, which the team will leverage for future research.

Using the theoretical framework (table1) on orders of water scarcity (Mehta, 2006) it will argue that the issue of water scarcity in the region has been wrongly equated to water shortage rather than searching for and finding solutions in the economic and institutional space – so, the problem, often misconstrued as a paradox, is actually more of a conundrum. The paper will primarily look at various drivers of water governance and social organisation that translate to domestic water scarcity in Gangtok which is catered for by a centralised formal water supply, as well as the surrounding sprawl whose water comes from multiple informal sources including water tankers and directly from springs. A description of methods and the selection of Gangtok as a study site and its history are presented first. This is followed by a presentation of the history and current scenario of formal and informal water institutions in Gangtok. Next, the paper draws insights into the coverage of the various institutions, their multiplicity in some cases and their intertwining in others, contributing to water scarcity at the household level.
Lastly, the associated risks, uncertainties and conflicts surrounding the creation of water bundles to handle the water scarcity so created are presented. Informal institutions emerge due to circumstantial constraints like the absence and/or unwillingness of the state (Hillmann 2013; Lebel, Garden, and Imamura 2005; Cleaver 2000). They are driven by the force of necessity to take up ventures individually or use kinships for the redistribution of social goods and opportunities, and cultural and political autonomy (Bayat 2000). The majority of the population in the developing world depends on informal water providers (Burt and Ray 2014; Joy et al. 2011; Meehan 2013; Samsom 2006).

The limited formal water supply focuses on middle and high-income households or areas (Samsom 2006) because the state lacks political will and funding for supplies to distant areas or ‘informal settlements’ where the urban poor lives (Wutich 2006; Anand 2012). In areas with formal water supplies, their availability depends on the household’s legal residence (Hellberg 2014). In spite of a functioning and reliable formal water supply, it only partially replaces the pre-existing informal water setups (Burt and Ray 2014). The informal is embedded within the formal so that the functioning of one requires the support of the other; for example, the state relies on the informal water suppliers to provide water for the population as they are unable to do so themselves (Meehan 2013). The creation of scarcity in the developing world is enmeshed in the preconditions required to even apply for a formal connection (Anand 2011b). One of the direct consequences is the reliance of socio-economically weaker sections of the society to stay out of the formal systems because of rigid bureaucratization and difficulties of access to the formal systems in comparison to the ease of access and reliability of the informal systems, which comes at a huge financial cost.

The socio-economically weaker households have the least access to drinking water due to the uneven distribution of physical water infrastructure (Schmidt 2020). Uneven experiences of scarcity manifest due to differentiated historical and contemporary water infrastructure, and capabilities of the households (Millington 2018; Bjorkman 2014). An example of this is the unequal distribution of water within urban areas in South Africa - a legacy of Apartheid (Bakker 2003; Gandy 2006). Access to water highlights distressing social inequality at one end and the difficulties faced by the governments to improve urban conditions at another; questions of governance therefore must not be understood as separate from but as an integral part of the larger discourses on equality and justice. Elite access to piped water supply and the socio-economically weaker sections relying on informal water sources is a pattern across the world (Bakker 2003). In addition to these developmental and governance factors, access to resources is also affected by marginalisation. Marginality is “an involuntary position and condition of an individual or group at the margins of social, political, economic, ecological or biophysical systems, preventing them from access to resources, assets, services, restraining freedom of choice, preventing the development of capabilities, and eventually causing extreme poverty” (quoted in Braun and Gatzweiler 2014: 70). It can be categorised as spatial or societal. Social factors denote the human dimensions such as demography, religion, social structure, economics, and politics; spatial factors indicate environmental and geographical settings such as the physical distance from the development centers (Ibid: 70).

The process of acquiring urban citizenship under the rules, laws, and policies of the cities and states make differentiated, informal, and abject populations (Anand 2012). Places with colonial histories of rules and regulations get imprinted and reproduced in the postcolonial forms of citizenship (Björkman and Harris 2018). Additionally, the belongingness of a city based on ownership of property and tenancy drives the policies which make the ‘unrecognised’ residents disconnected citizens (Anand 2011). Water scarcity is

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Physical/First Order</th>
<th>Economic/Second Order</th>
<th>Adaptive Capacity/Third Order</th>
<th>Socio-Political Processes/Fourth Order</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Volumetric quantities;</td>
<td>Population growth; Projection of future demand; Industrial growth</td>
<td>Inadequate development of water infrastructure; Poor management and institutional arrangements</td>
<td>Social, political and economic context of water management*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Adapted from Orders of water scarcity (Mehta, 2006)
unique in mountain towns due to biophysical and social characteristics. The topography of the mountains poses a difficulty to harness and retain water for use with energy being a limiting factor (Bandyopadhyay and Gyawali 1994). Another significant characteristic of mountainous regions is the springs which everyone depends upon. Mountainous regions have the altitudinal aspect to the pattern of urbanisation and strong seasonal water demand, too. The structural backwardness of the mountainous regions, the unavailability of infrastructure to harness their resources, and the skewness in development in the favour of other regions push them into underdevelopment. It can also be attributed to their inaccessibility, fragility, marginality, and heterogeneity (Jodha 1990). The mountainous urban areas of India are dependent on funding from the provincial and central governments (Munsi et al. 2006). Low coverage of formal supplies, proximity to the forests and springs, and vast prevalence of informal supplies especially in the urban areas makes the case all the more unique. Issues of water scarcity are faced by the mountainous regions within the state of Sikkim, which fall in the Eastern Himalayan Region (Barua et al. 2012; Joshi 2014; Lepcha 2013; Thapa 2017; Tambe et al. 2012) along with the Western and Central Himalayan Region (Madan and Rawat 2000; Kelkar et al. 2008; Domenech, March, and Sauri 2013; Shrestha and Shrestha 2014).

**Study Area and Filling the Gaps**

It was reported that nearly half the perennial springs in the Himalayan region have dried up or become seasonal in nature, due to natural dynamism, erratic rainfall, seismic activity, and ecological degradation associated with land use change for infrastructural development impacting mountain aquifer systems (Gupta and Kulkarni, 2018). When considering the case of Sikkim, it was important to identify the traditional and natural wetlands and water bodies such as village ponds, dhara/pandhera (springs), kuwa (shallow wells), khola/kholsa (small rivers or rivulets arising from a spring), and devithan (water sources, abode of local deities) which have all been rapidly degrading over the last few decades (Sharma et al., 2012; Tambe et al., 2011, 2012). In Spite of rural water security projects like “Dhara Vikas” implemented by the government of Sikkim (Tambe et al., 2013) little or no research has been done on Gangtok water insecurity, most studies focused on physical scarcity, water quality, and on the rural landscape (Tiwari, 2012). This paper will be the first of its kind on domestic water insecurity in Gangtok. Gangtok, the capital of Sikkim (Fig 1) falls under the East district of Sikkim which houses 46% of the state population making it the most populous district. The Water Security & Public Health Engineering Department (PHED) supplies the town with water from the Ratey Chu glacier which is around 16 km away. Ratey chu, which is the only source of formal water supply caters to the domestic water needs of the city with a population of more than 1.6 lakhs without including the influx of tourists and other floating population. The inability to meet the water demands by the government has led to the formation of informal water markets which in return has affected the availability and accessibility of domestic water for the citizens of Gangtok. 

*Figure 1: Map of Gangtok (Source: Maps of India)*
Methodology
Focus group discussion, stakeholders interview and household survey were conducted to understand the demand-supply gap, water markets (if existing as similar to Darjeeling- our other study area), change in water source pattern and address the major research objectives. The field survey was covered during the non-monsoon season and extensively during the lean season from February to April. A household survey with a stratified sampling technique was used along with a structured questionnaire consisting of both closed and open-ended questions. A pilot survey was conducted in 3 wards and transect walks were done in order to identify the problem and construct a structured questionnaire for the survey. A target of 200 households was taken into account given the paucity of households across 17 wards under Gangtok Municipal Corporation (GMC), Sikkim. I carried out pilot visits and fieldwork in December 2018, followed by a prolonged period of fieldwork from January 2019 to April 2019. I undertook topic-guided interviews with key stakeholders. I did transect walks to understand the layout of the city and constantly reviewed available public records and secondary literature. After building up my knowledge base, I created a questionnaire and was tested in different parts of the city, updated, and implemented. I used stratified sampling to select the wards using two spatial variables: (1) Average altitude of the ward (smallest administrative unit of the municipality) and (2) distance from the main supply tanks within the town for stratification. The questionnaire included household details, socio-economic and housing conditions, water sources used, water storage and quality, water usage, satisfaction and sufficiency levels, and grievances handling. While carrying out the questionnaires, I also recorded them with the respondents’ consent which acted as a reference for cross-checking. Topic-guided interviews were undertaken with key informants such as officials from the PHED, Gangtok Municipal Chairman, staff of the water department and associated staff/lineman and middle agents in/with the operation and maintenance of the water supply infrastructure. Focus group discussion was conducted in 5 different wards to understand the complexities within each area. Secondary data were gathered from official municipal reports, archives, existing public documents and literature. Using the guidelines of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) (Ministry of Urban Development Government of India & Asian Development Bank, 2007), the status and performance of the PHED as a water utility provider was assessed. I also used GIS to map the elevation, mark the household and show the spatial variations if or any differences were that to the access, distribution or any intertwining relationships with the households.

Findings

Governance: multiplicity and hybridity of institutions

Water, unlike a classic commodity, is a multifaceted resource that reflects on the nature of institutions that govern it and their intertwining in terms of governance and access by communities (Mehta, 2006; Kiparsky et al., 2013). Institutions that govern a water resource vary and so do associated property regimes. The fluidity of water creates competitive and overlapping water rights, which leads to a mix and intertwining of informal and formal arrangements (Mehta, 2006) which we refer to here as hybridity, since no single institution on its own is capable of meeting communities’ demands for domestic water. In the case of Sikkim, water is a public, private, or common property resource depending on the location, presence, or absence of an institution and the nature of these institutions. Multiplicity and intertwining of institutions make urban water governance complex because the institutions involved have overlapping and fragmented responsibilities, jurisdictions and decision-making method silos (Anand, 2001; Hillmann, 2013; Kiparsky et al., 2013; Fuenschilling & Truffer, 2016). The fragmentation of institutions can be political, and issue-based, due to gaps in the design and implementation of programs, and as a result of a mismatch between biophysical and political boundaries. Political fragmentation is created here with multiple sources of funding and multiple institutions responsible for the implementation of projects (Kiparsky et al., 2013). Issue-based fragmentation occurs because the land and water resources of Sikkim and the surrounding areas lie with different State-affiliated organisations such as the military, Forest, fire or medical department, which

---

28 Community-based organisations
increases a physical constraint on the town and restricts access to the resources under the other organisations. The city municipality only manages the sewage system and the formal supply and water infrastructure is maintained by PHED but the areas served by springs which a large section of the city is dependent on fall outside the jurisdiction of the municipality. The multiplicity of institutions leads to an interrupted transition from planning to execution to implementation with a different institution being involved at every other step. Another way of locating the multiplicity of institutions is through the infrastructure of the states formal water supply system (Kiparsky et al., 2013), from source to taps. The water harnessing infrastructure falls under the GTA and PHE, whilst the water supply distribution system falls under the PHED (Samanta & Koner, 2016). The water supply lines pass through forested areas under the Forest Department or army cantonment areas under the Indian Army. This multiplicity of formal institutions denotes a political fragmentation through an overlap but at the same time a conflict of responsibilities among various levels of government and agencies, making complex governance structures for urban water (Kiparsky et al., 2013). This shows the dominance of an engineering outlook with ‘add more’ as the only solution, without reining in an adequate knowledge of ecology or socio-economics. The stress has to be shifted towards distribution infrastructure and effective institutional functioning to enable better access, which needs support from both political and executive departments. Lack of incentives for positive performances in the public sector makes that sector more conservative and risk-averse to innovations. The absence of innovation restricts initiatives for mountain regions especially to overcome the constraints posed by the topography of the region to build sufficient, effective and less energy-intensive water distribution systems (Bandyopadhyay, 1989; Kiparsky et al., 2013).

As water users, communities have to work around these multiple institutions and interact with both formal and informal, to cushion the water scarcity they face. The cushion is generally in the form of a water bundle created using a combination of water sources, as noted above. The composition and proportions of a water bundle are primarily dependent on the financial resources available to a household, and its spatial proximity to the water sources. In the presence of multiple institutions, and the amount of time and resources they have to spend navigating around them, we observed that the higher the number of resources households had access to, the more secure they felt, i.e. the more varied a water bundle was, the more secure a household felt because they could have an array of resources to turn to if they had insufficient water. With the low frequency of PHED supply, if a household can afford a private supply, the frequency increases because they can ask for water to be delivered to their households. If a public spring is present in the household water bundle, a household feels more secure, regardless of the time and effort involved in fetching water from the spring (Shah, 2015).

Any external or non-local interventions tend to overlook the informal and social institutions which have emerged over the years to manage common water resources, such as samaj, which makes the interventions counterproductive (Bandyopadhyay & Gyawali, 1994). Problems occur at various levels pointing to the need to understand the interconnectedness of biophysical, socio-economic, political and institutional issues at each level and across various levels to enable integrated planning (Badiger et al., 2014). The Case of Informally Formal System

Formal and informal institutions handling water resources in Sikkim and the rules with which these institutions are governed influence how they understand and handle issues of resource access, in this case, communities’ ability to access water. Emphasis on resource access is necessary because it helps individuals and communities shape their development but the institutions might enable or curb such development processes (Mell & Sturzaker, 2014). The intertwining or hybridity occurs at the institutional level where the State-run PHED supply and non-State entities work together and, at times, against each other to cater to the water requirements of the communities. The low coverage, low frequency and quantities of supply make it imperative for the state to seek ways to fulfill the demands of households who are dependent on its distribution lines. The PHED as a formal institution interacts with the private water suppliers, especially the water tankers in times of supply deficit in their system. Vehicles used for private water supply, such as carts and tankers, have to work around the traffic police of the town, underlining the interaction of the formal and the informal. When the PHED seeks
tankers, traffic rules are relaxed accordingly. *Samaj* looks after the springs which are ignored by the formal institutions, hinting at the emergence of informal institutions in the absence or negligence of a formal body. *Samaj* also approaches the PHED on behalf of their members when there is a need for public standpipes in their vicinity, and even collectively pays for the installation costs which in most cases are borne by the department – highlighting their importance as a conduit between communities and the State.

Informal institutions which do not fall under the ambit of the state have emerged due to their absence, inability, or unwillingness of the state to provide formal institutions as public goods. These include a variety of private suppliers - water porters, hand-drawn carts, 6000-litre tankers, households that share/sell their spring water or surplus water, 2000-litre pick-up trucks, direct self-drawn supplies from springs and streams in forested areas at some or zero cost, indirect self-drawn supplies via private suppliers who draw from springs and streams or tankers, military cantonment, landlords who give water to the tenants, and all other water which is bought. Though Cantonment is a state body, provisioning of water is not their primary function, but they do provide water to the communities around them. These water setups sometimes act like appendages and sometimes are in direct competition with formal water supplies. The emergence and prevalence of the informal structures can be attributed to (1) the inability of the PHED to scale up; (2) inefficient project implementation; and (3) informal being considered more dependable. Rigid bureaucratic processes that prevent the households to apply for PHED connections such as documentation, high costs, corruption, and red-tapism further contribute to the growing presence of these informal structures.

The private-public dualism breaks down in urban water supply of Southern cities (Bakker 2003). Where formal water systems exist, they cannot work without informal ones. Informal networks actively work within formal institutions to enable the provisioning of formal waterconnections. The bureaucratic process is lengthy where once a household has filed an application for a private connection with the PHED, its movement within the office requires connections and networks. Informal institutions like *samaj* actively interact with the state for acquiring connections. The PHED is responsible for assessing the needs for public taps and setting them up. In many cases, *samaj* (where they exist) write applications for a public tap. Materials for sanctioned connections need to be provided by the PHED but are provided by the *samaj* in many cases due to the dire and immediate needs of the communities.

Respondents across town said, “Public taps come and go with PHED commissioners.” Some specifically mentioned, “There used to be one in the front of a household (pointing in the direction) and in the last five years it has appeared twice and disappeared both times.” Public officials with power take over the ownership of the public taps diverting for their use. PHED public taps are put in charge of individuals to curb theft, thereby emphasising the need for the state to resort to the informal to keep their systems functioning effectively. The informal institutions such as *samaj* or smaller groups interact with the formal by creating rules of access over formal resources such as P-shared taps and public taps. Rules are in place for public taps in parts of the city in the local language; Nepali. Access to public taps isn’t always inclusive. Public taps guarded by the *samaj* are vested with the power to (dis)allow access only to members based on their residential location. In some areas, only house owners have access with tenants being denied. Such practices, while maintaining some form of water availability balance, also exacerbate socially embedded discriminatory practices, reproducing class/caste/ethnic and other hierarchies. Some households, for instance, shared their experiences of facing discrimination from the residents based on their origins or the change in residence as a consequence of getting married to someone from outside demarcated households. This shows how free-for-use public taps installed by the PHED get overridden by the rules of informal norms and socio-cultural practices of the *samaj*. The rules of access are justified by the *samaj* members by invoking their active participation in acquiring the public tap. The justification implies that members who had taken the initiative for applying for their public taps and have acquired it have ‘more’ rights on the taps. The setting and enforcement of rules make them controllers of the source. Apart from setting of rules of inclusions/exclusions for accessing water sources, the access is also physically restricted by locking the public taps and springs during the dry season. This reveals that resources that are designed for the public or thought to be a common property resource do not function as such but are now parts of
new hierarchies and power systems overridden with socio-cultural and customary patronage.

Who is the “Water Mafia”?

Tankers have been used by the PHED during the 1990s (Interview with the author, 08.03.2019) due to the disturbances in their supply. Tankers are also said to have mafia-like behaviour. This terminology was used by respondents across the city with agreements and disagreements with it. Mafia in this context ascribes to those who control the resource and its supply. The tankers do not have ownership and rights over the water sources. When the tankers first came into business in the 1990s, the tanker drivers used to set up ponds for water collection in the forests and collect water for free. But, now they have to make payments to middlemen in the forest areas who provide access to the water sources along with No-Objection Certificates (NOCs) from the forest officials after paying a certain fee. The tankers association highlighted that payment for water sources in the forests is a recent phenomenon, suggesting the entrance of new actors into private tanker water supply systems with the costs of accessing water in the forests. The fee began at Rs. 10 and currently stands at Rs. 200. The payment systems can be done per access, per month, or per year (Interview with the author, 28.02.2019). The tankers are in active and passive confrontation with the formal bodies (Shahand Badiger 2018), facing financial costs for water access in recent times where none existed before. They believe that the PHED has the power to control all this. But, the PHED is said to neither work towards alleviating these issues nor in providing water to the communities. The PHED might have the power to stop what is termed the mafia and are acquainted with the politics of resource control for tankers, but are also cognizant of their shortfalls, which draw them back from taking any action.

Pseudo-department Systems

‘Uhiley ra ahiley’ (the past and the present) are not so different for water issues in Gangtok city. Institutions other than the PHED, such as the cantonment or samaj, function as pseudo-department systems. Across Gangtok, primarily in slum areas, households depend on samaj water systems. It has a water distribution infrastructure similar to the PHED. This area has very few formal connections and depends on private water suppliers throughout the year. 6000-litre tankers are the most commonly used private water suppliers here followed by 2000-litre pick-up trucks. These vehicles cannot reach the households because there are no roads in the dense settlements. The samaj has hence created their distribution network. This network has an inlet at the road and multiple outlets below inside the settlement. A household can be connected by making changes at this network junction. Vehicles come to the road and connect to this network inlet and release the water.

The Police Dhara Water System is another system. It utilizes the Police Dhara located lower than the village. The samaj has constructed a water storage and pumping system. Water delivery is systematised streetwise for a group of households, with a nodal person for each group. Gram Water System is another where the water is pulled from a spring into a reserve tank with multiple taps. It was set up for the comfort of the villagers and has a defined opening and closing time. These samaj water supply systems are in areas officially defined as slums where the absence of a dependable water supply has forced communities to create their own supply systems. Households located in slum areas do not get a permanent holding number without which they cannot get the necessary land and valuation documents to apply for a PHED connection. This is another example of a pseudo-department system coming into play because of the lack of functional, formal structures.

My fieldwork unveiled many different kinds of water setups on which the communities of Gangtok city are dependent to fulfill their daily water requirements. Household-based water suppliers are also common across the town. A water supplier in the central upper part of town said that tankers, which supplied water to him, could no longer come to his doorstep because the morning walkers who used that road had expressed their disappointment with the water supply vehicles. The morning walkers had installed one-and-a-half to two feet iron pillars on the road to prevent tankers and other vehicles from using that road. The prevalence of informal water suppliers and the inefficacies of the formal suppliers indicate marginalisation and lack of development of the region. The lack of political willingness of the state to actively upgrade their system as well as curb the systems which they term
‘mafia’ is evident. Even where the formal supply is present, it is hard to let go of the informal processes by the state themselves as well as by the citizens. Communities are forced to come together to create water sources for themselves in the absence of strong formal water supply sources with ease of access and accountability. The communities have to meander through this mix of formal and informal institutions and processes to get a basic amount of water. The socio-economic and physical location of the households affects the creation of water bundles highlighting differentiated experiences of scarcity throughout the town.

*Modern water; local springs and disconnected citizens*

Most studies on urban citizenship and the making of informal and abject populations are focused on the megacities of the developing world and within them the poor squatter settlements as sites of inquiry (Wutich 2009; Bjorkman 2014; Anand 2012; Hellberg 2014). In the case of Gangtok, the making of abject populations occurs for the region/town as a whole with further differentiation within the town. The creation of abjection occurs through repetitive actions of marginalising the people through a social and political process that they are no longer considered subjects of the government (Anand 2012). It can also be interpreted as the exclusion of people by the state such that the state is not accountable for them (Agamben 1995). Being disconnected, unlike unconnected, involves a process through which people are gradually pushed out of a system. The ethnic grievances of the communities stem from multiple sources of alienation and deprivation - access to decent living standards and basic public amenities being one of them. This happens through the many requirements to get a formal PHED water connection. The provisioning of a formal water connection is attached to the legality of one’s residence - a problem for a majority of the hill population with no access to land rights and papers. This illegality, as defined by the state, prevents them from acquiring basic entitlements (Anand 2012; Hellberg 2014). The demand for land rights continues to remain in the heart of the statehood movement. Despite endless promises for *parja-patta* (land deed) all that it has been reduced to is mere political gimmicks for sectarian and electoral gains, obscuring the precarious position of the people and their everyday harassment due to lack of such documentation in the first place. The application requires three different documents and Rs. 250 only but the actual amount that goes under the table is dependent on how fast, how much or how you access or through whom you get the water. Such requirements disallow residents from even beginning the application process for a legal water connection. The waiting time for getting a connection depends on whether the connection is *tatkal* or regular. For a regular connection, it can take one to three years also depending on one’s social and political networks within the PHED to expedite the process.

With no solution in sight for the past decades, the people have come to terms with the scarcity. For Gangtok, water scarcity has been normalised and internalised along with the experiences of marginalisation. Statements such as "our water issues are not as bad as the households a little ahead of the turn" were prevalent upon asking about their experiences of water scarcity and which regions in the town experience the most scarcity.

Communities create varied water bundles (Shah and Badiger 2018) as coping measures outside the PHED sources due to inefficient, irregular, and insufficient formal supplies. The top three water bundles used in Gangtok are single-source private water supplier, two-source bundle of public tap and private supplier, and private individual connection and private supplier. Private water suppliers are not only the highest used water source; they make up all the top three water bundles. Households with PHED connections need to be supplemented with other sources to have a sufficient amount of water. The formal supply or PHED supply has not reached all households. Only when the connection reaches the vicinity of a household, do they fathom applying for a connection because the more the distance from the nearest municipality network the more the labour and materials costs. The high costs and lengthy time taken to get a PHED connection disables people from the lower socio-economic strata from applying. The proof of legality further cuts off a section of the population such as the migrant population and those living in informal settlements and slums. In most cases, these two sets of people overlap, hence creating a disproportionate disadvantage for access to formal
water systems. PHED usually provides public taps in informal settlements and slums which all the households depend upon. The residents in such areas face disconnections and interruptions because they had been included in the water services, but as an element of exclusion/ marginalisation (Hellberg 2014). When basic services become inaccessible in this way, people find alternate ways to acquire them. The alternate means are illegal connections provided by middlemen or private water suppliers where the citizens end up paying higher rates. Due to the hassle of acquiring legal documents and the uncertainty of water availability, residents prefer the informal over the formal despite it coming at a price (Anand 2012). Communities prefer them for ease of access and are free from rigid bureaucratic centralization. They are also satisfied paying similar labour and material costs for informal water suppliers which are certain and frequent than the PHED suppliers (Anand 2012).

As informal water suppliers find legitimacy, it also disconnects people from formal structures of governance, with red-tapism and corruption becoming the norm. The decay and deterioration of formal governance structures on the other hand contribute to a growing sense of disconnect and alienation from the people. They become disconnected citizens (Anand 2011b, 2012) as they are unable to access state supplies due to their legality as citizens of the municipality. The ethnic tension of the Indian Nepali community, ethnically Tibetan but originally Sikkimese, the Lepchas and many other communities emerge from a sense of disconnection and alienation from the mainstream and a sense of deprivation from the state of Sikkim. Malgovernance is not merely an outcome of bureaucratic red-tapism but is often an outcome of shrinking democratic spaces and the collapse of formal structures of governance and civil society in conflict-ridden societies. The state has a pertinent role to strengthen these systems to establish a permanent sense of peace and stability in such spaces. In the absence of the political will to do so, the void is bound to be filled by informal structures of power defined by a political culture of violence, corruption, and instability. The outcome is glaring inequalities contributing further to a sense of alienation, deprivation, and disconnect, as is evidenced by this paper through the growing disparity in access to water in the region.

Conclusion

Despite being located in a volumetrically water-rich region, Gangtok has faced water scarcity for a number of decades now. We argue that the crisis is the result of a conundrum due to the interlinked problems across political unwillingness, insufficient investments, failure of cooperation between the state and regional institutions, and inadequacies in local governance including institutional capacity. Translation of physical water availability to access for communities is an important factor that alleviates or reinforces water accessibility. The multiplicity of water institutions and the way in which they are intertwined reveals the complexity of urban water governance. The creation of a household water bundle by communities through complex interactions with these institutions illustrates the difficulties they face in acquiring a basic amenity such as water. Water scarcity here is cushioned to a certain extent by the presence of springs and private water suppliers, both of which fall under the ambit of informal institutions. As an exclusive dependence on PHED or formal supply is not enough to meet basic water needs, communities create a water bundle from a combination of available sources which are in turn dependent on a variety of factors such as socio-economic status and the spatial location of households, among many others. In a similar way to other global experiences, engineering solutions have been the order of the day, with supply augmentation the only route pursued in Gangtok. The success rates of such augmentations have been low and have not been enough to close the gap between increasing water demands and augmented supply. Low success rates show the need to look at aspects of both harnessing and supplying water. An acknowledgment of natural, social, and traditional knowledge is needed to provide better solutions and water rights and, in this case, existing systems such as springs and the array of private water suppliers should not be left out. Various departments need to work together for a better solution to the increasing water crisis.

There is an absence and reluctance on the part of the government to push for development schemes with a thorough study. Difficult terrain, lack of funds, and an imbalance between urban growth and the provisioning of services might intercept any initiatives taken or render them futile after a certain period of time. However, with these progressive developments and
many projects under the various National schemes, initiatives seem to be making positive headway, with the former looking at reforms in water governance (specifically at the formal water distribution system) and the latter at harnessing rainfall. The implementation of these projects might lead to the alleviation of water scarcity in Gangtok and will additionally provide pointers for effective intervention in similar cities/towns within the EHR.

References


Detailed Project Report for National Adaptation Fund: Rain Water Harvesting and Sustainable Water Supply to the Hilly Areas in Darjeeling as an Adaptive Measure to Potential Climate Change Impacts.


Annexure

Some excerpts from the stakeholder’s interview

• “For years we have assumed that there is enough water but how long is that water going to be enough? If you look at it now, the water issue has been here for the longest time but we were not able to dissect it because the hills are blessed with spring water but our pipelines are always leaking, the roads are filled with leakage and we hardly have any maintenance. The service is poor from the water department”

• “Water is diverted from the consumers to the hotels by bribing the revenue and maintenance departments of Water Supply department”

• “The shortage is because of less awareness amongst the community and people are also self-centred. Here the issue of ‘my property’ has stopped a lot of developmental work. People do not allow others pipes to be laid through their property, the pipes are routed through government property like through roads, jhoras and open drains and the damages that occur because of them are uncountable”

• “We should find alternative ways to conserve the water in the hills. We have been blessed with abundant water and the cleanest source of water from the hills but all sources are finite and hence, it is important to conserve and educate people about it”

• “I have seen water thefts countless times and tried to stop it. What can be done when the politics is played within the system?”
• “No, we are not able to cater to 135 LPCD but the current amount of supply is more than enough for the domestic needs of the consumers”

Source: Authors interview with government officials

Narratives from FGD

“Everyone has water scarcity but no one talks about it. The problem is that we have solved the issue ourselves. We are lucky that there are alternative sources in our state so somehow we are able to find ways to but for how long? Is it not the duty of the government to be able to provide water to its citizens? During peak tourist seasons we have acute water scarcity and we buy water from commercial water trucks (Syntex-2000 litres) at the cost of 1500 rupees every dry season. The government water supply here does not last for more than an hour and the pipeline system here is complex. I have to store water near the main road in the tank (his house is located below the road) and supply it back to my house using an almost 1.5 km pipe stretching from the storage tank to the overhead tank above my house. If I don’t do this, by the time the water reaches my house there will be 80% pipe loss or sometimes people tend to steal connection midway and since we do not use pumps, the force is comparatively less to those living in higher elevation. The problems and complexities of the water system are many and it is not new, it has been this way for years now”, narrates 46 years old residents of the Development area ward.

“We get water for 40 minutes maximum and it gets less and less as the season fades to monsoon. It is the worst during monsoon. The pipelines are already in a horrible condition and the government does not do anything about it even after multiple complaints. I live on the 3rd floor across the road so the pipeline has to be passed through the footover bridge (pic 1) and by the time the water reaches my house, either the pressure is too less or the water supply time is reduced by half. We have to buy water from the nearby villages. At least 50% of the houses here buy water from the villages. Water pipes are connected to the nearby villages and a lump sum of 600-700 rs is given depending on the need/amount and the frequency of the water required by the consumer. It is an easy way, unlike the water dept who does not bother to come even after endless complaints about no water and pipe leakages. Most of the houses here are renting out commercially as well so it becomes difficult for us to get rents if we do not provide the most basic requirement”, says a 32 years old resident from Ranipool ward.
CONTRIBUTION OF “ULAANBAATAR RAILWAY” TO THE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT OF MONGOLIA SUPPLIED COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION

A. TUULSAIKHAN

Doctoral student of the University of Science and Technology

Abstract

Briefly mention the contribution of Ulaanbaatar Railway Joint Stock Company to the sustainable development of Mongolia, strengthening the infrastructure base to meet the future needs of cargo and passenger transportation, and increasing the competitiveness of the national transportation system on the international stage, transit and export cargo. shows the current status of shipping.

Keywords: sustainable development; railway transport; society.

One. Introduction

Dramatic changes are taking place in the legal environment, organization, and economic aspects of public relations in Mongolia and the world. One of the important goals of the country’s long-term and medium-term economic policy is to support economic growth and maintain it at a stable level.

Due to the above trends, the main goal of the activities of the "Ulaanbaatar Railway" joint-stock association, which is one of the main pillars of Mongolia’s society and economy, is to strengthen the transport infrastructure base to meet the current and future needs of freight and passenger transportation, and national aims to support the stable development of Mongolia by increasing the competitiveness of the transportation system.

"Ulaanbaatar Railway", a joint venture between Mongolia and Russia, was established on June 6, 1949, according to the agreement between the Government of the People’s Republic of China and the Government of the USSR, with 2450 employees and a capacity of 0.3 million tons of cargo. was established as an organization.

"Ulaanbaatar Railway" with a history of 70 years has become a major national employer with about 16,000 employees, as well as freight and passenger transportation, construction and maintenance of railway infrastructure, maintenance services, assembly and repair of rolling stock, railways and artificial equipment, has expanded into a large organization engaged in more than ten types of basic activities and more than 60 other types of services, including the development of comprehensive designs for buildings and structures, production of construction structures, production of machinery, mechanisms, and equipment spare parts, transportation, mountain production, operation, emergencies, pre-school education, higher education, and health services).

In other words, the association greatly contributes to the country's export of mining products, energy and heat production, oil and oil products, food, consumer products, and construction materials import process, and helps the public institutions, enterprises, households and citizens. daily railway transportation needs are met.

Currently, the joint-stock company "Ulaanbaatar Railway" handles 73.6% of the country’s freight traffic and 15.6% of the passenger traffic, respectively.

Cargo transportation, which is the main activity of the society, has seen a sharp increase over the last three years (+40.2% from 2020, +8.22 million tons). As of 2022, 14% of cargo transportation through the territory of our country, 38.9% of local communication transportation, 36.7% of export cargo transportation, and 10.4% of import cargo transportation are accounted for by 2022. On the other hand, 98.8% of passenger transportation is domestic. in local routes and 0.2% in international routes respectively.
Two. The main part

2.1 Development of the national brand “Transportation through the territory of Mongolia”

For the Ulaanbaatar railway, transit transport is the most profitable type of transport, with its low cost, long tariff distance, and direct foreign exchange income. To increase the benefit of Mongolia from the large flow of trade between Russia and Europe, to raise the country’s reputation in the international transport market, to attract foreign exchange flows, In order to develop the national brand “Transportation through the territory of Mongolia”, improve organizational management and management methods, take measures to organize all types of transportation, and invest a large percentage of the annual investment in a high-depreciation infrastructure (a third of the main roads are more measures are being taken to guide the renewal of rolling stock (overdue for repair) (47.2-69.2% of service life has ended) and to implement a competitive tariff policy.

The reason for the significant increase in the volume of rail transport between Asia and Europe in recent years is related to the “Belt and Road” initiative put forward by the People’s Republic of China. One of the goals of the Belt and Road Initiative is to accelerate the movement of goods from sea to rail through the development of rail transport corridors, and international transport organizations are taking advantage of this opportunity to compete for profits from transit transport. In 2013, only about 80 container trains traveled from China to Europe, but in 2019, there were 2,880 trains, a 35-fold increase. As of the end of 2022, the number of railway container shipments reached 482,506 or 11,201,127 tons, which is an increase of +43.2% from the same period of the previous year. In order to implement this measure, China’s Development and Reform Commission approved the “China-Europe Container Train Development Plan for 2016-2020” in 2016. In the plan, the corridor passing through Mongolia was identified as the central corridor of the China-Europe container express train.

As a part of the main railway corridor of the “Mongolia-Russia-China Economic Corridor”, the main line of the Ulaanbaatar Railway actively participates in the competition of the transit market based on this advantage in the trade, economy, transport and logistics sectors of the region. Since Mongolia can use its geographical location not only to connect its two neighbors, but also to be the shortest route connecting Asia-Europe, create a "Development Road" that will connect the growing trade and economic cooperation between China-Russia and China-Europe. In 2016, the "Mongolia-Russia-China Economic Corridor Program" was established in coordination with China’s "Belt and Road" initiative and the Eurasian Economic Union led by Russia.

As a result of these measures, the volume of this type of transportation, which was interrupted as of 2015, has been increased several times, and the number of container trains passing through the territory of Mongolia will reach 1450 trains in 2020. increased again, from 2016 to +1283 trains nine times, from 2017 to +894 trains three times, from 2018 to +595 trains 1.7 times respectively.

By the end of 2022, the total cargo transported by rail is 27.68 million tons, a decrease of 3.58 million tons or -11.45% from the previous year. Total cargo Domestic cargo accounted for 43%, export cargo for 31%, imported cargo for 14%, and transit cargo for 12%. According to the railway cargo structure, import cargo increased by +16.27%, but export cargo -21.43%, domestic cargo decreased by -5.56%, transit cargo decreased by -25.1%, mainly due to affected. Exports and transit cargo decreased in Russia and Ukraine directly affected by the situation.

Today, the community uses the revenue generated from the profitable operation of the transit service to compensate for the losses caused by the operation of freight and passenger transport of social importance.

2.2. Expansion of the railway network in Mongolia

The development of modern transportation infrastructure in Mongolia has two main trends.

The first direction of transport development is related to the government’s policy to increase the role of Mongolia’s transit transport in trade between Russia and China, as well as between Europe and China through Russia, and the second direction is mineral extraction. , the development of an important basic structure that ensures the circulation of production and transportation is taking place.

Based on these trends, the participation of the “Ulaanbaatar Railway” Association in the expansion of the Mongolian railway network, which is being carried out within the framework of the long-term policy approved at the government level, is defined as follows.
• UBTZ participated as the general contractor in the construction work of the 26.6 km railway connecting the oil refinery to be built in Desvger, Altanshreee Sum, Dornogovi Province, with the city of Sainshand.
• For the construction of the Tavantolgoi-Zunbayan railway line, a base for the assembly of railway joints was established at the Zunbayan station and the construction of 170 km of superstructure was completed.
• Participated as a contractor for the ballasting and stabilization of the superstructure of the construction of the Dzhunbayan-Khangi railway.
• The "Technical Development and Reform Program of the Society until 2030" is being developed and implemented in order to ensure the smooth passage of additional cargo from the Tavantolgoi-Zunbayan route and other future directions through the railway line of the "Ulaanbaatar Railway" community.

With the implementation of the program, the carrying capacity of the main railway line in Sukhbaatar-Ulaanbaatar-Zamin-Udin direction will increase by 2.2 times to 56.7 million tons by 2030, which will have a positive effect on the new pace of economic growth in Mongolia.

References
1. Year-end statistical compilation of the road and transport sector in 2022
2. Technical reform and development program of "UBTZ" CPP until 2030
3. Rules of operation of railway transport brokerage
4. Government policy on railway transportation
5. Mongolia-Russia-China economic corridor construction program
ARTICLE 6.2 OF THE CONSTITUTION OF MONGOLIA IS THE BASIS FOR THE EFFICIENT USE OF NATURAL RESOURCES AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF ITS SUSTAINABLE MANAGEMENT

TUUSHINTUGS Adiyasuren
the first author, LL.M, Ph.D. candidate
GUNBILEG Boldbaatar
the last author, Ph.D. in Law

Abstract

This study aims to determine whether the goals of developing sustainable management of efficient use of natural resources are reflected in the amendments made to Article 6.2 of the Constitution of Mongolia. Following the abovementioned purpose of the study, we will consider the concept of the Democratic Constitution of Mongolia was adopted in 1992. Goal 12 of the 17 Sustainable Development Goals adopted by the UN General Assembly (UNGA) includes responsible consumption. One of the goal’s objectives is to achieve sustainable management and efficient use of natural resources by 2023. The content of this objective is clearly reflected in the amendments of 2019 to Article 6.2 of the Constitution of Mongolia. However, in the future, there is a need to strengthen this regulatory concept with organic laws, use natural resources efficiently, and provide the majority of its benefits to the people.

Concept of the Article 6.2 of the Constitution of Mongolia and its amendments of 2019

The 1992 Democratic Constitution of Mongolia is a political and legal document that is the foundation of the Mongolian people’s history and traditions, unique conditions, and long-term existence, was developed by Mongolians without the participation of any foreigner, taking into account the common standards of the democratic countries of the world and was repeatedly discussed and approved by the permanent parliament, the People, and the People’s Great Khural elected by them. According to the above concepts and ideas, the Constitution is not only a legal document but also a basic document for the development of the country, including politics, the ideologies, and perspectives of political parties, and political organizations that hold the state power. This concept was confirmed in Article 6.1 “In Mongolia, the land, its underground resources, forests, water, animals, plants and other natural resources shall be protected by the State” and Article 6.2 “The land, its underground resources, their wealth, forests, water, and animals unless owned by citizens of Mongolia, shall be the property of the State” of 1992 Democratic Constitution of Mongolia. These 2 provisions of the Constitution are the basic norms regulating the economic relations of the Constitution. The basic principle of the relation between the distribution of profits generated by the extraction of natural resources to the host country and other investors is this provision in the Constitution of Mongolia that confirms who owns the natural resources.

Based on Articles 6.1 and 6.2, as well as 38.2.4 “The government will exercise its full authority to undertake measures for the protection of the environment and for the rational use and restoration of natural resources” of the Constitution, it is interpreted systematically that when granting the authority to protect the environment, rational use and restoration of natural resources to the Government by Constitution, the protection of the environment, which is a human value, is given priority, followed by the proper use of the host country in natural resources and the technical and economic feasibility of mining law. Rule of Law Journal, Series 42, No. 2, 72

32 Bayarmaa, N. (2013). A brief consideration of the legal consequences of the principle of permanent sovereignty of
natural resources of the host country, as well as the principle of restoration and it is a concept to take into account. Because it is intended to reflect the concept of appropriate responsibility which means that the human right to live in a healthy and safe environment should not be violated, natural resources should be restored under the conditions of proper use, and recovery methods should be used when using natural resources. Also, the emphasis on "rational use of natural resources" is related to Articles 6.1 and 6.2 of the Constitution and the legal basis of how Mongolia and its sovereign government will use its minerals, how to deliver its benefits to the people who own the wealth and how to efficiently cooperate with domestic and foreign enterprises and governments have been determined in its scope.

On July 16, 2019, the President submitted a proposal to amend the Constitution as follows: "The land, its underground resources, ... unless owned by citizens of Mongolia, shall be the public property. The principle of equality, justice, national security, and ensuring sustainable development shall be followed in the use of natural resources. Underground resources may be used by legal entities of Mongolia on the basis of a special license issued by the government in accordance with the principles set forth in this article. In the case of joint use of underground resources with particular importance by the state, the investor will be responsible for the expenses, and at least fifty-one percent of the profit after tax will be allocated to the state of Mongolia. Investor expenses will be real. The government will monitor the investor's expenses and report it to the people. The income from the joint use of underground resources with the investor will be collected in the wealth fund and spent. The conditions for using natural resources, the organization and operation procedures of the wealth fund will be determined by law." This proposal was agreed upon by Parliament members, and on November 14, 2019, Article 6.2 of the Constitution was revised and the following amendments were approved.

"The land, its underground resources, their wealth, forests, water, and animals unless owned by citizens of Mongolia shall be the State public property. The state policy on use of the natural resources shall rely on the long-term development policy to endorse the rights of each citizen in current and future generations to live in a healthy and safe environment and consolidate returns from land subsoil wealth at the Sovereign Wealth Fund for equal and fair distribution. A citizen shall have the right to know about the impact on the environment from the exploitation of land subsoil wealth as part of the right to live in a healthy and safe environment. The legal basis for the use of strategic mineral deposits shall be determined by the law so that the majority of its benefits allocated to the people in compliance with the principle that natural resources are owned by citizens of Mongolia."

Currently, the mineral sector ranks first in our country according to the proportion of the domestic product, exports, tax revenue, and budget, and researchers have warned that the country's economy is too dependent on one sector.

Although the main source of budget revenue is the mineral resources sector, it has not achieved sufficient results considering the profits made by the sector, the costs and losses caused by the sector, and the expected benefits. A research report issued by the World Bank in September 2020, "Mines and Minds: Leveraging Natural Wealth to Invest in People and Institution" concluded that our country has become too dependent on the mining industry due to not investing the profits from mining in the optimal sector, and that only 1% of the income from the mining sector is left for future generations. Therefore, it became the basis to amend the clause that "benefits of subsoil resources will be concentrated in the Sovereign Wealth Fund and aimed at equal and fair distribution" in Section 6.2 of the Constitution. Therefore, it became the basis to add the clause "consolidate returns from land subsoil wealth at the Sovereign Wealth Fund for equal and fair distribution" in Section 6.2 of the Constitution. Article 112 of the Constitution of Norway, which deals with the efficient management of natural resources, states "Everyone has the right to live in an environment that is healthy, environmentally friendly, and preserves its productivity and diversity. Will preserve natural resources for future generations and use natural

---

33 Proposals for amendments to the Constitution of Mongolia were submitted by the President on July 16, 2019. Clause 3.1
34 In 2018, more than 23% of the GDP, and in 2019, 24% of the GDP is the income from mining, which is the highest among other sectors that make up the GDP. https://1212.mn
resources within the framework of a comprehensive long-term policy" and Article 29 of the Constitution of the State of Qatar stipulates that "The government is responsible for saving and spending it in the most efficient way". Similar to these regulations, Article 6.2 of the Constitution of Mongolia includes the implementation of "rational use of natural resources and development of its sustainable management" which is an objective of the sustainable development goals adopted by the UN General Assembly (UNGA).

**Article 6.2 of the Constitution includes "the rational use of natural resources and develop its sustainable management" which is one of the goals of sustainable development.**

Article 6.2 of the Constitution has been amended to state that "the legal basis for the use of strategic mineral deposits shall be determined by the law so that the majority of its benefits allocated to the people in compliance with the principle that natural resources are owned by citizens of Mongolia". This provision shall be interpreted in conjunction with other clauses of Article 6.2 of the Constitution. For our country, it is reflected to create a wealth fund, concentrate and increase the benefits, and the source of concentrated income will be strategic mineral deposits. It is significant that the law specifies that the government will develop and manage the policy for the use of natural resources, but it will be based on the principle that the wealth and its benefits will be owned by the citizens of Mongolia. Before the amendment to the Constitution, it was not clearly stated what percentage of the benefits of natural resources should be shared with the people. However, the amendment adopted in 2019 clearly stipulates that the majority of the benefit are provided to the people. In connection with the above-mentioned regulation, there is a need to approve and implement the primary law that reflects the new management of the wealth fund, and drafting of the law is underway.

Section 4 of "Vision 2050" long-term development policy, provisions related to the Wealth Fund reflected. For example, as a goal, an internationally recognized wealth fund capable of supporting the goals of economic diversification, innovation, new technology, human development, and green development will be created. According to the objectives and stages of the above development policy, by establishing a wealth fund, investments will be made in financially efficient projects and programs and planned to gradually introduce the work of enriching the assets of the wealth fund and build an internationally recognized wealth fund into economic circulation. This policy is in line with the clause of Article 6.2 of the Constitution "The state policy for the use of natural resources shall be based on long-term development policy and the benefits of resources shall be concentrated in the Sovereign Wealth Fund for equal and fair distribution".

A strategic mineral deposit is a mega project. A mega project is risky because it requires long-term planning and complex operations. The project term often extends beyond the originally planned period. A study by the University of Oxford found that 77% of total projects take 40% longer term than originally planned. Therefore, the content of "based on long-term policies" included Article 6.2 of the Constitution of Mongolia for the purpose of ensuring the rational use of natural resources and developing its sustainable management. Also, by reflecting that it will be based on a long-term development policy, it means that every citizen of the present and future generations, as the owner of natural resources, will gain benefit from it in the long term.

When using natural resources, it is important to ensure national security, and economic and financial stability, to lay the foundation for the country's long-term development, to create resources for future generations, and to set and implement optimal economic development goals. One of the main ways to achieve this goal is the Sovereign Wealth Fund. Through the Sovereign Resources Fund, many countries (Norway, Chile, Botswana) have created rational use of their natural resources and sustainable management. Therefore, for our country, it is necessary to have a special wealth fund for natural resources and to create sustainable, specialized management that conforms to international trends like other countries.

37 Бямбацогт, Ц., Цэнддорж, Д. (2017). Мега төсөл: Олон улсын түршлэгээ, Монгол Улсын одоогоийн нөхцөл байдал, эдийн засаг үзүүлэх нөлөө. Монгол банк. Улаанбаатар хот., 29

38 Хууль зүйн үндсэн үгээр бүрхийг тахтай сахган амжилттай эрх зүйн зохицуулалт. Улаанбаатар хот., 2
Conclusion

The Constitution of Mongolia was amended on November 14, 2019. The main purpose of this amendment was to clarify the legal basis for the rational use of natural resources, the provision of its benefits to the people, and the development of sustainable management. Goal 12 of sustainable development adopted by the UN General Assembly (UNGA) covers "the efficiency in use and management of natural resources". The content that the benefit of natural resources belongs to the people of the country, the efficient and rational use of natural resources, and its sustainable management were in the 1992 Democratic Constitution of Mongolia. But there was no specific regulation in Article 6.2 of the Constitution.

The amendment adopted in 2019 is significant because the principle "The state policy for the use of natural resources shall be based on long-term development policy and the benefits of resources shall be concentrated in the Sovereign Wealth Fund for equal and fair distribution" has been clarified. The content "the efficient use of natural resources and development of its sustainable management" of the goal of sustainable development approved by the UN General Assembly (UNGA) is reflected in Article 6.2 of the Constitution. Therefore, it is necessary to have a special wealth fund for natural resources and to create sustainable, specialized management that conforms to international trends like other countries.
Ulaanbaatar is facing a critical challenge regarding sustainability, equality, and impartiality. The city's rapid urbanization has led to countless problems, such as social inequality due to the lack of access to essential services such as education and healthcare. Our project aims to help and care for those in need.

**Motivation:** Red Cross is a humanitarian organization that has been assisting people in need for a long time. The reason behind our voluntary work is rooted in the belief that every human being deserves access to necessities such as medical care, food, and shelter. We strongly believe that by offering our time and skills to help those who are in need, we can make a positive change in society and contribute to building a stronger society. We see homeless children, unattended elderly, and open trash just walking through the streets of Ulaanbaatar.

**Process:** Our project is broken down into 6 small ones. Through our six works, our objectives include:

- **Alleviating Poverty:** Provide food supplies and essential items to households in impoverished areas, offering immediate relief and support to those in need.

- **Enhancing Elderly Well-being:** Bring joy and companionship to elderly residents of care facilities, promoting their emotional well-being through engaging activities and heartfelt interactions.

- **Nurturing Children’s Happiness:** Provide entertainment, emotional support, and essential supplies to children in care houses, creating moments of joy and fostering a sense of belonging and care.

- **Promoting Animal Welfare:** Support pet care organizations by providing food supplies and assisting in maintaining clean and comfortable living spaces for animals, ensuring their well-being, and promoting responsible pet ownership.

- **Equal Education Opportunities:** Ensure that underprivileged students have access to basic educational resources by providing them with necessary school supplies, and empowering them to pursue their academic goals and dreams.

**Winter Safety and Comfort:** Provide gloves to children in need, protecting them from harsh winter conditions and ensuring their safety and well-being during extremely cold temperatures.

By achieving these objectives, we aim to make a tangible and positive difference in the lives of individuals and communities, fostering compassion, unity, and inclusivity throughout Mongolia.

**Conclusion**

After the completion of the project, participants expressed their immense satisfaction in being a part of this project and considered themselves part of a close-knit family. They gained valuable skills such as delivering water and wood for fire, while also having the opportunity to meet a diverse range of individuals. The experience deepened their understanding of Ulaanbaatar and its challenges. The project successfully achieved its goal of encouraging more teenagers to participate in volunteering jobs and contribute to their country. The families and care facilities we visited expressed heartfelt gratitude and thoroughly enjoyed the time spent with our team. By assisting 20 families facing disabilities, poverty, and various challenges, and providing care to pet owners, elders, and children, we demonstrated that teenagers can make a significant impact in their country.

This project not only influenced teenagers to actively engage in helping their community but also challenged the perception held by many adults that teenagers cannot bring about meaningful change. Through our efforts, we warmed the hands of 200 kind souls and left a lasting impression on both the younger generation and adults, showcasing the capabilities and dedication of teenagers to making a positive difference.

The project's success has inspired participants to seek further opportunities to engage in similar initiatives, strengthening the spirit of volunteerism among Mongolian youth. By fostering understanding and collaboration between generations, we continue to
create a collective impact and contribute to the betterment of our society.

Voluntary work is a noble act that enormously benefits the community. It provides an opportunity to give back to society, gain new skills, and make meaningful connections with others. Our project can be directed towards various SDGs such as poverty eradication, quality education, zero hunger, good health and well-being, reduced inequalities, and many more. It provides an opportunity for individuals to contribute their time and skills toward achieving these goals. By volunteering in local communities or international organizations, volunteers can help create awareness about the SDGs and encourage others to take action. Moreover, volunteer work promotes inclusivity by bringing together people from diverse backgrounds to work towards a common goal. This fosters social cohesion and strengthens community resilience. In conclusion, our project aligns with SDG 17 by promoting partnerships that are essential for achieving all other SDGs. It allows individuals to contribute their time and skills toward creating a better world for all.
MP Bulgantuya, President Kim, Ambassador Kim, Ladies and Gentlemen,

As we conclude the Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue, I am immensely proud and grateful for the remarkable journey we have embarked upon together. Over these past two days, we have explored, learned, and connected in ways that will undoubtedly shape our collective efforts to promote gender equality and sustainable development.

I want to express my sincere appreciation to the State Great Hural of Mongolia for hosting this fantastic event. Your commitment to fostering a platform for exchange and action is truly commendable. I also extend my heartfelt gratitude to all the speakers, participants, and organizers who have made this conference a resounding success.

Reflecting on our shared experience here, I am struck by the power of partnerships. Throughout our discussions, we have witnessed firsthand the transformative potential that emerges when diverse stakeholders convene, united by a common goal.

The recognition of the crucial role of gender equality in implementing the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development has resonated deeply throughout our deliberations. We have explored the intersection of gender equality and economic growth, social inclusion, and environmental protection — the three core elements of the 2030 Agenda — acknowledging that progress on one front strengthens our efforts on all fronts.

We have delved into the challenges, opportunities, and best practices in mainstreaming gender equality across various sectors. We have listened to the experiences and insights of policymakers, academics, and professionals working to dismantle barriers to equal opportunity and empower women to realize their full potential. Let us carry the lessons and camaraderie of the Trans-Altai Sustainability Dialogue into our homes, institutions, and communities. Let us continue to forge partnerships, cultivate knowledge, and drive tangible actions to create a more equitable world.

Let us also remember that our time in Mongolia is but a chapter in a larger story. As we depart from this land of rich culture and breathtaking landscapes, we look ahead with anticipation to the next phase of our journey — the second annual Trans-Pacific Sustainability Dialogue, which will take place in Seoul this coming fall, on September 13-14, and play a crucial role in furthering APARC and the Ban Ki-moon Foundation’s joint effort to stimulate ambitious action to deliver the 2030 Agenda.

Building on the momentum and takeaways from these past two days, the 2023 Trans-Pacific Sustainability Dialogue will address energy security — Sustainable Development Goal 7. Even as the international consensus regarding the energy transition we need for a shared sustainable future strengthens, the obstacles to achieving this transition are growing more apparent, especially as geopolitical uncertainties force many governments to reassess their strategies. To make progress on achieving SDG 7, which proposes clean and affordable energy for all, our upcoming Trans-Pacific Sustainability Dialogue will convene speakers from Stanford University and across the Asia-Pacific to explore technological, financing, and policy solutions that would expedite the shift to an energy paradigm that reduces dependency on fossil fuels.

The field trip and cultural activities we experienced today allowed us to immerse ourselves in the beauty and heritage of Mongolia. From the awe-inspiring Turtle Rock to the exciting Naadam festivities, we have witnessed the essence of Mongolian culture and its resilience. Let these experiences remind us of the interconnectedness of our planet, the importance of preserving our cultural diversity, and the urgency to act in the face of global challenges.
As we bid farewell to Ulaanbaatar and the memories we have created here, let us commit ourselves to advancing the SDGs with renewed vigor and determination.

Thank you again for your unwavering dedication and insightful contributions. I look forward to meeting you again in Seoul as we continue working together to build an inclusive, just, and sustainable future. 

*May our collective efforts inspire generations to come.*