Working Group Paper #3

Individual Sanctions Roadmap: Recommendations for Sanctions against the Russian Federation

Appendix A: Expanding Sanctions on Putin's Propagandists

The International Working Group on Russian Sanctions

October 20, 2022

https://fsi.stanford.edu/working-group-sanctions

The International Working Group on Russian Sanctions aims to provide expertise and experience to governments and companies around the world by assisting with the formulation of sanctions proposals that will increase the cost to Russia of invading Ukraine and that will support democratic Ukraine in the defense of its territorial integrity and national sovereignty. Our working group is comprised of independent experts from many countries, but coordinates and consults with the Government of Ukraine and those governments imposing sanctions. This consultation process helps to inform our views, but our members express independently held opinions and do not take direction from or act at the behest of the Government of Ukraine or any other person or entity. This publication is an appendix to Working Paper #3 on individual sanctions. It was released by the coordinator of the Working Group, in close consultation with expert members of the working group on individual sanctions but does not necessarily reflect the views of all members. All of our papers, as well as additional memos and publications from our working group members can be found at our website: https://fsi.stanford.edu/working-group-sanctions.

In our Individual Sanctions Roadmap, we singled out propagandists as one of the ten categories of individuals to be sanctioned for "hav[ing] consistently reproduced false narratives in line with the Kremlin's policies, laying the ideological foundation for Russia's war and concealing ongoing crimes." The subcategories in this paper can be generally divided into two broad groups: those who generate ideas for propaganda (ideologists) and those who transmit and propagate these ideas (mouthpieces). The division is not always clear. In practice, identifying those in the first group is much more difficult than those in the second. The representatives of the second group (journalists, celebrities, clergy, etc.), whose activity is aimed at garnering larger audiences, are easily traceable, whereas the representatives of the first one (members of academia, think-tanks, etc.) are likely to be out of the spotlight. Still, these persons lay the theoretical foundation for Russian propaganda by manipulating or distorting historical facts and scientific research. Consequently, to date, most of the ideologists have managed to escape sanctions altogether, except for the most notorious of them, such as Alexander Dugin. Devoting more attention to sanctioning ideologists, therefore, must a key component of strengthening individual-level sanctions as a means to hasten the end of Putin's war in Ukraine.

In this context, it is worth mentioning that academic or expert affiliation of ideologists should not, however, be taken lightly as implying academic freedom and independence. Notorious think-tanks (like Valdai Discussion Club, Izborsk Club, Foreign and Defense Policy Council, Russian International Affairs Council (RIAC), and Russian Institute for Strategic Studies (RISS)) typically have close ties with high-ranking officials. For example, RIAC and RISS are chaired by the former Minister of Foreign Affairs and Prime Minister respectively. The state or entities close to the regime sponsor many of these organizations and individuals. Members of such think-tanks often act as advisors to various Russian government organizations. While formally keeping distance from the Kremlin, many (but not all) Russian think tanks are nurturing and supporting ideas that promote Putin's war in Ukraine. Their supportive roles must be given greater scrutiny.

Propogandists or transmitters of information that support Putin's war in Ukraine constitute the lion's share of this category of Russian individuals who should be sanctioned. As Peter Pomerantsev has written, "Russian military theory sees information operations as integral to military operations to an unprecedented extent – Russian state media managers even received military medals for their role during the annexation of Crimea in 2014. And

rather than just nasty words broadcast on radio or TV, information operations are now continued in tightly controlled digital campaigns with everything from online 'troll farms' through to search engine optimisation, which rise and crest in tandem with military operations." Those in the business of propagating such information are not only journalists or pundits, but also soldiers in the war.

So too are those peddling Russian soft power more indirectly. These artists are oftentimes as dangerous as corporate propaganda outlets on television, radio channels, and newspapers, due to their ability to spread propaganda swiftly and effectively to a large target audience. Most of them are also masters of hypocrisy. Despite having an instrumental role in spreading pro-war propaganda and inciting hatred, they vacation abroad and enjoy lavish lifestyles anchored, in part, in the West. In addition, many own luxurious properties in Europe and the United States. These individuals act openly either through their social media channels or by performing during propaganda rallies in support of the illegal annexation of Crimea and the invasion of Ukraine. They perform at concerts, plays, and festivals in support of Putin's war aims. Some even have visited the occupied territories of Ukraine, thereby directly undermining Ukraine's territorial integrity. Several individuals claim to have visited the Mariupol Drama Theater² and afterwards supported the Kremlin's narrative that shifts responsibility for Russia's crimes onto Ukrainian populations. These people must be sanctioned as well.

Below is a list of Russian opinion leaders, artists, and so-called intellectuals who openly or indirectly produce narratives in line with the Kremlin's propaganda, spread misinformation about Russia's war against Ukraine, and therefore support policies that actively undermine Ukraine's territorial integrity, sovereignty, independence, and security. Since 2014, many of them have visited the temporarily occupied territories of Ukraine. Their activities are unrelated to journalism, freedom of expression, or scholarship; they fall squarely into activities that purposely and deliberately help Putin's war effort in Ukraine. Democracies around the world should add them to their sanctions list.

In expanding sanctions to this category of Russians, we also ask individual countries and the European Union to better coordinate their activities. Whereas more than 80 individuals, falling under the "propaganda" criteria, have been sanctioned in at least one G-7 jurisdiction, only a few of these individuals have been sanctioned by all G-7 states.

Finally, our recommendations of Russian propagandists to be sanctioned are only partial. We encourage other expert and non-governmental organizations to make their own suggestions as to others who should be considered and added to this list.

- 1. ALLEGROVA Irina Aleksandrovna
- 2. ANDREASIAN Sarik Garnikovich
- 3. ANDREEVA Ekaterina Sergeevna³
- 4. ARKHIPOV Roman Igorevich
- 5. AVERIN Maksim Viktorovich
- 6. AVERRYANOV Vitaliy Vladimirovich (Izborsk Club)

¹ https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2022/oct/16/propaganda-russia-ukraine-war-crimes accountability

² https://dailymoscow.ru/author/kristina-potupchik-ya-sama-ezdila-v-mariupol-i-byla-v-dramteatre-zrelishche konechno-zhutkoe

³ Sanctioned by US and Ukraine.

- 7. ASKER-ZADE Nailya Vagif kyzy⁴
- 8. BABKINA Nadezhda Georgievna⁵
- 9. BADOEVA Zhanna Iosifovna
- 10. BASHAROV Marat Alimzhanovich⁶
- 11. BASKOV Nikolai Viktorovich⁷
- 12. BELAN Viktor Nikolaevich / Dima BILAN
- 13. BEZRUKOV Sergei Vitalevich⁸
- 14. BOBUNETS Sergey Stanislavovich
- 15. BOIARSKII Mikhail Sergeevich⁹
- 16. BORISOVA Dana Alexandrovna
- 17. BORDACHEV Timofei Viacheslavovich (Valdai Club)
- 18. BURNYSHEV Igor Yurievich
- 19. BUTMAN Igor Mikhailovich
- 20. BUYNOV Alexander Nikolaevich
- 21. BUZOVA / TARASOVA Olga Igorevna
- 22. BYSTRITSKY Andrey Georgievich (Valdai Club)
- 23. CHICHERINA Yuliia Dmitrievna
- 24. DAINEKO Victoria Petrovna
- 25. DIDULA Valery Mikhailovich
- 26. DOBRONRAVOV Viktor Fyodorovich
- 27. DOBRONRAVOV Aleksandr Andreevich
- 28. DOLINA/KUDELMAN/MIONCHINSKAYA Larisa Aleksandrovna
- 29. DOVLATOVA Alla Aleksandrovna / EVSTRAKHINA Marina Aleksandrovna
- 30. DUBTSOVA Irina Viktorovna
- 31. DUGIN Alexander Gelyevich ¹⁰ (Eurasian Youth Union)
- 32. DUHOVA Alla Vladimirovna
- 33. DYUZHEV Dmitriy Petrovich
- 34. EGORCHENKOV Dmitry Alexandrovich (Member of the expert council of RUDN University "RUSSIAN UNIVERSITY OF FRIENDSHIP OF PEOPLE", Valdai Club)
- 35. EGOROVA Snezhana Aleksandrovna¹¹
- 36. FOMIN Dmitriy Anatolyevich
- 37. GAGARINA Polina Sergeevna
- 38. GALUSTYAN Mikhail Sergeevich
- 39. GAZMANOV Oleg Mikhaylovich¹²
- 40. GAZMANOV Rodion Olegovich
- 41. GLUSHKO Sergey Vitalievich
- 42. ILNITSKY Andrei Mikhailovich (Advisor to the Minister of Defense of the Russian Federation, Valdai Club)
- 43. IVANOV Alexander Viktorovich (IVAN)
- 44. IVANOV Alexandr Yulievych

⁴ Sanctioned in UK, Canada and Ukraine.

⁵ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

⁶ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

⁷ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

⁸ Sanctioned by EU, Switzerland, Canada and Ukraine.

⁹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹⁰ Sanctioned by EU, US, Switzerland, Canada and Ukraine.

¹¹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹² Sanctioned by EU, Switzerland and Ukraine.

- 45. KANDELAKI Tinatin Givievna¹³
- 46. KARAGANOV Sergei Alexandrovich (Valdai Club)
- 47. KEOSAYAN Tigran Edmondovich¹⁴
- 48. KOSTIUSHKIN Stanislav Mikhailovich¹⁵
- 49. KHARATYAN Dmitrii Vadimovich¹⁶
- 50. KHRAMOV Andrey Vladimirovich
- 51. KHARLAMOV Igor Yurievich¹⁷
- 52. KHRULEVA Elena Vladimirovna (Vaenga)
- 53. KIPELOV Valery Aleksandrovich
- 54. KIRKOROV Philip Bedrosovich
- 55. KISELEV / KISELYOV Dmitrii Konstantinovich¹⁷
- 56. KISELEV Yuri Vladimirovich (YurKiss)
- 57. KISELYOVA Elena Yurievna (Elena Sever)
- 58. KITAYEVA Maria Vladimirovna¹⁸
- 59. KORMUKHINA Olga Borisovna
- 60. KOROVIN Valeriy Mikhailovich (Izborsk Club, Public Chamber of the Russian Federation)
- 61. KOZACHENKO Vadim Gennadievich
- 62. KRASOVSKY / KUZNETSOV-KRASOVSKY Anton

Vvacheslavovich¹⁹

- 63. KRAVCHENKO Maria Olegovna
- 64. KRISTOVSKIY Sergei Evgenievich
- 65. KRISTOVSKY Vladimir Evgenievich
- 66. KRYSANOVA Ekaterina Valerievna
- 67. KUIEK Karolina Myroslavivna²⁰
- 68. KUPRYK Sergey Vasilyevich
- 69. LANTRATOV Vladyslav Valerievich
- 70. LAZAREV Sergey Vyacheslavovich
- 71. LEBEDEV Artemy Andreyevich²¹
- 72. LEPSVERIDZE Grigory Viktorovich²²
- 73. LESHCHENKO Lev Valerianovich²³
- 74. LUKYANOV Fedor Alexandrovich
- 75. MAIDANOV Denys Vasilyevich
- 76. MAKEEVA Anastasia Vasilievna
- 77. MAMENKO Igor Vladimirovych
- 78. MANUCHAROV Vyacheslav Rafaelevich
- 79. MARSHAL (MINKOV) Alexander Vitalievich
- 80. MASHKOV Vladimir Lvovich²⁴
- 81. MATVEICHUK Gleb Alymovych
- 82. MELNYKOV Matvey Alexandrovych (MOT)

¹³ Sanctioned by US, Canada and Ukraine.

¹⁴ Sanctioned by EU, UK, Canada, Switzerland, Australia and Ukraine.

¹⁵ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹⁶ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹⁷ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

¹⁸ Sanctioned by US and Ukraine.

¹⁹ Sanctioned in five G7 jurisdictions and Ukraine.

²⁰ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²¹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²² Sanctioned by US.

²³ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²⁴ Sanctioned by EU, Switzerland, Canada and Ukraine.

- 83. MGOYAN Zarifa Poshaevna
- 84. MIKHAILOV Alexander Yakovlevich
- 85. MIKHAILOV Sergei Vladimirovich (TASS News Agency)²⁵
- 86. MIKHAILOV Stanislav Vladimirovich
- 87. MIKHALKOV Nikita Sergeevich
- 88. MILYAVSKAYA Lolita Markovna
- 89. MUZA Dmitry Evgenievich (Izborsk Club)
- 90. MYKHALKOVA Yulia Evgenievna
- 91. NETREBKO Anna Yurievna
- 92. NAROCHITSKAIA Nataliia Alekseevna (Izborsk Club)
- 93. NIKULIN Maksym Yuryevich
- 94. OBRAZTSOVA Elena Vasiliyevna
- 95. OKHLOBYSTIN Ivan Ivanovich²⁶
- 96. OMAROV Kurban Omarovych
- 97. PANAYOTOV Aleksandr Sergeyevich
- 98. PERMYAKOVA Aleksandra Andreevna
- 99. PERFILOVA Alla Yurievna (Valeria)
- 100. PETROSYAN Evgeniy Vaganovich
- 101. PLATONOV Oleg Anatolyevich (Institute of Russian Civilization)
- 102. PODDUBNYY Alexey Viktorovych
- 103. POPLAVSKAYA Yana Evgenievna
- 104. PORECHENKOV Mikhail Evgenievich²⁷
- 105. POTUPCHYK Krystyna Andreevna
- 106. POVALIY Taisiia Mykolaivna²⁸
- 107. PRESNYAKOV Vladimir Vladimirovich
- 108. PRIGOZHIN Iosif Igorevich
- 109. PRILEPIN Yevgeniy Nikolaevich
- 110. PROKHANOV Alexander Andreevich (Izborsk Club, Deputy Chairman of the Public Council under the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation)
- 111. PROKLOVA Elena Igorevna
- 112. PYEHA Stanislav Pyatrasovych
- 113. RASTORGUEV Nikolay Vyacheslavovich
- 114. RAZBEGAEV Vyacheslav Vyacheslavovich
- 115. ROMANOV Alexey Dmitrievich
- 116. ROMANOV Igor Evgenievich
- 117. ROZANOV Oleg Vasilievich (Izborsk Club)
- 118. RYBIN Viktor Viktorovich
- 119. SADKOVA (MALINOVSKAYA) Marina Nikolaevna
- 120. SAGAL Dimitrii Alekseevich (Izborsk Club)
- 121. SARDAROV Amiran Shirinovich
- 122. SATANOVSKY EVGENY YANOVICH (President of the Institute of the Middle East, expert council of the State Duma Committee on the development of civil society)
- 123. SAVICHEVA Julia Stanislavovna
- 124. SEDOKOVA Anna Vladimirovna
- 125. SEMENOVICH Anna Grigoryevna

6

²⁵ Sanctioned by EU, UK, Canada, Switzerland and Ukraine.

²⁶ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²⁷ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

²⁸ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

- 126. SENCHUKOVA Natalya Valentinovna
- 127. SEROV (SYAROV) Alexander Nikolaevich²⁹
- 128. SHCHEDROVITSKY Pyotr Georgievich (Center for Strategic Research "North-West")
- 129. SHEYNIN Artem Grigoryevich³⁰
- 130. SHUFUTINSKY Mikhail Zakharovich
- 131. SHUKSHINA Maria Vasilievna
- 132. SHUROCHKINA Anna Vladimirovna (Nyusha)
- 133. SIMONYAN Margarita Simonovna³¹
- 134. SKABEYEVA Olga Vladimirovna³²
- 135. SKLYAR Alexander Feliksovich
- 136. SLANEVSKAYA Anastasia Vladimirovna (SLAVA)
- 137. SMIRNOVA Polina Sergeevna
- 138. STAROVOITOV Stas
- 139. STEKLOV Vladimir Alexandrovich
- 140. SUKHORUKOV Viktor Ivanovich
- 141. SUSHENTSOV Andrey Andreevich (Valdai Club)
- 142. SUSLOV Dmitry Vyacheslavovich (Center for Comprehensive European and International Studies, Russian International Affairs Council, Valdai Club)
- 143. TELEGINA Pelageya Sergeevna
- 144. TODORENKO Regina Petrovna³³
- 145. TOPALOV Vladislav Mikhailovich
- 146. TORKUNOV Anatoly Vasilievich (Valdai Club)
- 147. TRENIN Dmitry Vitalievich (former director of the Moscow Carnegie Center)
- 148. TSOY Anita Sergeevna
- 149. TSYGANOVA / ZHUKOVA Victoria Yuryevna
- 150. TURETSKY Mikhail Borisovich
- 151. TYMOSHCHUK Anatoliy Oleksandrovych
- 152. USPENSKAYA Lyubov Zalmanovna
- 153. USTIMENKO-VEINSTEIN Denis Aleksandrovich (DZHIGAN)
- 154. VAKULENKO Vasyl Mykhailovych
- 155. VINOKUR Vladimir Natanovich
- 156. VOITENKO Sergei Ivanovich
- 157. VYSOKOVA Klavdiya Vadimovna (Klava Koka)
- 158. WEBER Maria Yurievna
- 159. YAKOVLEVA Elena Alekseevna
- 160. YAKUBOVYCH Leonid Arkadevich
- 161. YUNUSOV Timur Ildarovich / TIMATI
- 162. ZAKHAROVA Svetlana Yurevna
- 163. ZAPASHNY Edgard Valterovich³⁴
- 164. ZHIGUNOV Sergey Victorovich
- 165. ZHUKOV Sergey Yevgenevich

³⁰ Sanctioned by EU, UK, Canada, Switzerland and Ukraine.

²⁹ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

³¹ Sanctioned in six G7 jurisdictions and Ukraine.

³² Sanctioned in five G7 jurisdictions and Ukraine.

³³ Sanctioned by Ukraine.

³⁴ Sanctioned by Ukraine.